

# Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group

## CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

06 July 2017

Gaziantep

**Chaired by:** WFP and CARE

**Hosted by:** UNHCR

**Agenda:**

- 1. Introduction and welcome**
- 2. Discussion on workshop (13/14 July) to develop programmatic recommendations based on Cash Gap Analysis: CBI-TWG member expectations and outputs**
- 3. Presentation of findings of the ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin (Q1 / 2017)**
- 4. Development and finalization of the “Cash Modality Decision Tree”**
- 5. A.O.B**

### Summary of Action Points

- ✓ CBI-TWG coordinators to provide the CBI-TWG with a thorough de-brief on workshop outcomes at the next meeting, highlighting follow up actions/analysis required or requested from the working group.
- ✓ WHH to share their data on healthcare visits/costs with WFP. Deadline: 14 July 2017.
- ✓ WFP to check and advise on whether social welfare payments to Turkish citizens are adjusted to account for inflation and provide feedback to CBI-TWG members at the next meeting.
- ✓ WFP to collate information on the prices of winter items (incl. coal, if available) for inclusion in the Q2 ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin and for circulation to BN/winterization actors.
- ✓ WFP to provide a breakdown of items included under each category of the ESSN MEB to enable harmonization and comparison with calculations based on local market surveys. Deadline: 14 July 2017.
- ✓ Co-chairs follow up on the analysis of TurkStat data to determine differences in costs of living in rural vs. urban areas, with a view to associated developing programmatic recommendations. Deadline: 27 July 2017 (i.e. the next CBI-TWG meeting).
- ✓ CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Protection-CBI Risk Analysis Matrix by CoB 07 July, after which the tool will be considered final. Deadline: CoB 07 July.
- ✓ CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Cash Modality Decision Tree by 11 July, after which IOM will work toward its finalization.
- ✓ Co-chairs to follow up with the ISWG coordinator to present on the CBI-Protection Risk Analysis Matrix and draft Cash Modality Decision Tree at the coming ISWG meeting. Deadline: 07 July.

### 1. Introduction and welcome

- WFP and CARE welcomed participants, noting that the UNHCR co-coordinator is on leave. Following a brief tour de table, WFP revisited the action points of the previous meeting, as follows:
  - CBI-TWG coordinators to make final amendments/additions to the report based on feedback received from CBI-TWG members, after which the report will be considered final and submitted, along with recommended next steps, to the Inter-Sector, Basic Needs, and Protection Working Groups. **Status: Completed, with the Cash Gap Analysis now seen as**

endorsed.

- CBI-TWG members to send comments on the revised work plan (attached) to CARE ([salah.hamwi@care.org](mailto:salah.hamwi@care.org)) by CoB 30 May, after which it will be considered final. **Status: Completed, with the work plan now considered final.**
- WFP to explore the possibility of linking the development of standard operating procedures and terms of reference for impact evaluation to broader efforts to strengthen impact monitoring at the inter-sectoral level in 2018, and revert with a proposal at the next meeting. **Status: Pending. WFP to follow up over the coming month.**
- WFP to keep partners updated on TRC readiness to cross-check beneficiary lists to prevent duplication between e-voucher and ESSN beneficiaries. **Status: Ongoing. WFP noted that TRC has advised that an SoP and template will be shared within the coming week.**

## **2. Discussion on workshop (13/14 July) to develop programmatic recommendations based on Cash Gap Analysis: CBI-TWG member expectations and outputs**

- It was explained that, building upon the Cash-Gaps Analysis, the CBI-TWG, Basic Needs Working Group, and Protection Working Group are organizing two-day “Workshop to identify program responses to facilitate access to services in Turkey” on 13-14 July in Gaziantep. The workshop will bring together up to 40 NGO, INGO, and UN partners to: (i) discuss barriers to access to the ESSN and identify opportunities to address these challenges through existing programming (ex. ECHO-funded Individual Protection Assistance); (ii) identify ways to meet the basic needs of vulnerable households which are not eligible to receive assistance under the ESSN; and (iii) agree on next steps, including collective advocacy with donors and other relevant stakeholders.
- Partners expressed some concern that, following on from the Cash Gap Analysis, the workshop appears focus on basic needs and protection sectors and, in particular, basic needs programming which addresses gaps in ESSN coverage. It was stressed that, given the ESSN’s immense coverage, some partners had hoped that the CBI-TWG would limit this component of analysis, instead focusing on other types of cash assistance (e.g. conditional cash interventions to address child labour) which would be perceived as competing with the ESSN. The co-chairs noted that the original ToRs, which should have been circulated to all concerned stakeholders, focused heavily on identifying the population which was not eligible to receive basic needs assistance under the ESSN. While several points in the ToRs were not addressed in the analysis, this was due to limitations to the aggregated dataset. Nonetheless, the CBI-TWG remains on hand to address points which were not considered in the Cash Gap Report, based on sector/partner requests to the working group and/or as follow up to the discussion which takes place at the 13/14 June website. It was also stressed that although the presentations during the second day of the workshop focus on targeting, it will also provide forum through which to develop recommendations regarding modality (e.g. micro-credit to promote access to livelihoods and promote self-sufficiency).

### **Action Points:**

- CBI-TWG coordinators to provide the CBI-TWG with a thorough de-brief on workshop outcomes at the next meeting, highlighting follow up actions/analysis required or requested from the working group.

## **3. Presentation of findings of ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin (Q1 2017)**

- WFP’s M&E/VAM team shared the objectives, methodology, findings, and implications of the Q1 ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin with task force members. Further information can be found in the attached presentation.
- It was noted that, in order to develop the ESSN MEB, WFP had drawn upon the September 2016 CBI-TWG MEB. However, it was noted, WFP made some adjustments to the percentage income spent on each category of expenditure based on data collected through the ESSN Pre-Assistance Baseline (PAB).
- It was noted that the ESSN MEB factors in TL 59.04 / person / month for health costs, based on an assumption, drawn from PAB data, that individuals undertake three specialist visits per month and obtain

three prescriptions. Partners (WHH) offered to share data on the actual number of specialist visits per month in SET, based on their existing assessment data.

- The TurkStat price data, on which the ESSN MEB relies, is considered a limitation as TurkStat prices are often higher than those that refugees spend at local markets. Nonetheless, partners suggested that the data, which is made public online, would be helpful in identifying whether price changes in supermarkets contracted under e-voucher programmes are in line with national fluctuations.
- Partners asked whether social welfare payments to Turkish citizens are adjusted in line with inflation, noting that this may be a good basis for advocacy with the GoT to increase the transfer value. WFP agreed to follow up and provide feedback at the next meeting.
- It was noted that, in advance of discussions on winterization (tentatively scheduled to take place on 19 July in Gaziantep), WFP would be collating information on the prices of winter items (incl. coal if available), including this information in the Q2 ESSN Market Monitoring Report and sharing it directly with BN/winterization actors.
- In order to allow comparison between the ESSN MEB and the calculations of CBI-TWG members based on their surveys of local markets, WFP agreed to share the breakdown of items that have been included under each category.
- Members suggested that the CBI-TWG analyze TurkStat data to determine differences in costs in rural vs. urban areas, with a view to informing programming to complement the ESSN and e-voucher programmes. The co-chairs agreed to follow up over the coming week(s).

#### **Action Points:**

- WHH to share their data on healthcare visits/costs with WFP. Deadline: 14 July 2017.
- WFP to check and advise on whether social welfare payments to Turkish citizens are adjusted to account for inflation and provide feedback to CBI-TWG members at the next meeting.
- WFP to collate information on the prices of winter items (incl. coal, if available) for inclusion in the Q2 ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin and for circulation to BN/winterization actors.
- WFP to provide a breakdown of items included under each category of the ESSN MEB to enable harmonization and comparison with calculations based on local market surveys. Deadline: 14 July 2017.
- Co-chairs follow up on the analysis of TurkStat data to determine differences in costs of living in rural vs. urban areas, with a view to associated developing programmatic recommendations. Deadline: 27 July 2017 (i.e. the next CBI-TWG meeting).

#### **4. Development and finalization of the “Cash Modality Decision Tree”**

- The co-chairs presented the final Protection-CBI Risk Analysis Matrix, which was initiated at the March workshop bringing together protection and cash actors in Gaziantep. Given that some partners expressed an interest in providing further feedback on the tool, it was agreed that final comments would be shared by CoB 07 July, enabling CARE to present the final matrix to the PRT WG on 12 July.
- IOM presented the latest Cash Modality Decision Tree. It was agreed that partners would share their feedback on this tool by CoB Tues 11 July, after which IOM will work toward its finalization.
- Members suggested that the tools be presented to the ISWG, given their cross-sectoral applicability.

#### **Action Points:**

- CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Protection-CBI Risk Analysis Matrix by CoB 07 July, after which the tool will be considered final. Deadline: CoB 07 July.
- CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Cash Modality Decision Tree by 11 July, after which IOM will work toward its finalization.
- Co-chairs to follow up with the ISWG coordinator to present on the two tools at the coming ISWG meeting. Deadline: 07 July.

**5. AOB – Partner updates and next meeting**

- *Next CBI TWG: 27 July (tbc)*