**Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group**

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

Gaziantep

**26 July 2016**

Chaired by: WFP, UNHCR and CARE

Hosted by: WFP

(A full list of attendees can be found at the end of this document)

Agenda:

1. Welcome and round the table introductions
2. Information Management Operational Updates, June 2016:
   1. Food Security & Basic Needs E-Voucher Distributions
   2. Possible overlap alerts for planned/ongoing activities
   3. Food Price Monitoring Overview over the past five months
   4. Overview of household expenditures & AAP indicators
   5. ActivityInfo Updates – Question & Answer Session
3. Update on the CARE Recruitment Process of the Technical Consultant & Data Collection Process
4. Update from CARE on the Harmonization of the Price Tracker, Shop Monitoring & Shopkeeper Satisfaction Tools
5. Overview of existing partner accountability approaches and mechanisms & discussion on next steps for design of guidelines on AAP
6. AOB – Agency Updates & Closing Remarks

|  |
| --- |
| **Summary of Action Points**   * **Action Point #1:** All submissions into Activity-Info should take place by the **10th of every month,** to allow for sufficient time to produce the Inter-Sector Dashboards and prepare for the next meetings later in the month. * **Action Point #2:** All partners to be trained on use of ActivityInfo on 15 August at IMWG Meeting led by Rob Samupindi, WFP-IMO (iMMAP-seconded). * **Activity Point #3:** Partners to submit inputs on the [Outcome Monitoring Sections of the 4W Framework](https://www.dropbox.com/s/5gttl9bvzt9lkdr/May%202016%204W.xlsx?dl=0) every three months via ActivityInfo. * **Action Point #4:** The following 15 partners to submit May, June and July 2016 inputs into Activity-Info: DRC, PARCIC, UNICEF, World Vision, Mercy Corps, STL, NRC, TRC, IRC, ASAM, SSG, CARITAS, Khayr, FAO, Save the Children. * **Action Point #5:** All maps to reflect the following agreed thematic categories: *Food Security only; Basic Needs/NFI only; Both Food Security/Basic Needs/NFI* * **Action Point #6:** All partners using Nagis as a service provider to investigate a process for releasing monthly monitoring reports to Rob Samupindi, WFP. * **Action Point #7:** The following agencies (IOM, CARE, UNHCR, NRC) to nominaete AAP focal points to support Sara Fowler, WFP in design of AAP Minimum Standards. CARE to check with their PQ team on this to confirm capacity to participate * **Action Point #8:** The next meeting will take place on **22 August** from 11:00 to 13:00 at UN House, Gaziantep, where Christina Hobbs, CARE-hired Consultant working on behalf of the TWG will present s/MEB findings. |

1. Welcome and round the table introductions

*Co-chairs introduction*

* The Co-Chairs noted that progress was made toward achieving two areas of the CBI-TWG work-plan related to information management with the recent secondment of Rob Samupindi, WFP Information Management Officer (iMMAP-seconded). The Testing Phase for ActivityInfo began in June and will be extended till the end of September. The following seven partners CARE, Concern, IOM, Support to Life, Syrian Social Gathering, WFP/TRC and Welthungerhilfe were especially thanked for submitting their inputs into ActivityInfo and for sharing their approaches on beneficiary accountability mechanisms. Further training on ActivityInfo will be provided on 15 August to enable the remaining 15 partners to also report on this tool.
* The Co-Chairs introduced the agenda items to be discussed stressing the importance of reporting information managemet updates on a monthly basis and the 19 agreed outcome monitoring indicators on a quarterly basis.
* Special thanks to WFP for hosting this meeting.

2. Information Management Operational Updates, May 2016

* The Co-Chairs clarified that progress was made in addressing the following action points noted from the previous meeting:
  + Mapping of actors’ Food Security/NFI-Basic Needs/Both interventions
  + Identification of possible overlaps in four provinces (Kilis, Gaziantep, Hatay, Sanliurfa)
  + Overview of Commodity Price Changes for Food & NFI
  + Use of Cash-Based Assistance at Household Level
  + Identification of Household-level Expenditures
  + Understanding Livelihood Coping Strategies
  + Appreciating Protection/AAP sensitive practices
* ***The following overview of IM progress to date was provided:***
* **Food Security & Basic Needs e-voucher distributions** 
  + The Coordination Officer noted that food security partners as of June 2016 are active in 11 provinces and have reached a total of 386,218 Syrian beneficiaries with CBIs for food assistance. This figure is 5.4% more than the month of May.
  + It was also noted that basic needs actors are present in four provinces, reaching a total of 41,542 Syrians with CBIs for basic needs/NFIs as of June 2016. This figure is 7% more than the month of May.
  + The group agreed that it is necessary to adjust the split of food security/basic needs mapping in order to form a clearer picture due to the different usages of the term “basic needs” i.e. in the 3RP sense (which is not the usage of most actors) meaning NFI, or a combination of food and NFI intervention.
* **Possible Overlap Alerts for Planned/Ongoing Activities**
* The Information Management Officer noted that there may be possible overlaps in the following provinces, given the presence of multiple actors:
  + **Kilis –** TRC/WFP; Welthungerhilfe
  + **Gaziantep–**TRC/WFP; TRC/WHH; Mercy Cops; Relief International; Welthungerhilfe
  + **Hatay -** TRC/WFP; STL; IOM
  + **Sanliurfa -** TRC/WFP; Concern; CARE; Khayr (both TRC/WFP and Concern have a presence in Akcakale, Harran districts).

Note from the meeting that this can only really be reviewed if village/town/city and then mahalle level data is collected for districts where more than one actor is operating programmes

* **Food Price Monitoring Overview over the past five months** 
  + The Coordination Officer noted that from an initial analysis of average food basket prices in 18 provinces (taken from WFP/TRC, NRC and Welthungerhilfe), prices tend to be higher in eastern Turkey (Mardin, Kiziltepe), as well as in Adiyaman and Malatya possibly due to political factors and trade relations between Turkey and Russia.
  + It was also highlighted that over the past five months (from February to June 2016), WFP food basket prices slightly decreased and that WFP contracted shops display on average 5% lower prices that non-contracted shops. It was however, not possible to confirm data based on actual prices charged.
* **Overview of Household Expenditures & AAP Indicators**
  + NRC presented their household survey findings in this regard prior to the start-up of their program in August 2016. Overall households in Ankara reported spending 310 TL on food and 179 TL on NFIs (excluding shelter). Data from Welthungerhilfe reveals that expenditures on food are slightly higher in Gaziantep (386 TL) and in Kills (322 TL).
  + In terms of AAP, Welthungerhilfe noted that 24% of its beneficiaries in Gaziantep logged a complaint through beneficiary feedback mechanisms, whereas this is true for 6% of beneficiaries in Kilis. Only 1.4% of WHH’s beneficiaries reported theft (card or belongings stolen) in Gaziantep, whereas this is true for 0.3% of beneficiaries in Kilis.
  + It was noted that further partner data (both household surveys and post-distribution monitoring) is required to inform a more comprehensive analysis nation-wide. There remains a need for comparable data collection if this is going to be as accurate and meaningful as possible.
* **ActivityInfo Updates – Question and Answer Session** 
  + The Coordinator expressed special thanks to the following partners (CARE, Concern, IOM, Relief International, Welthungerhilfe, WFP) for having proactively inputed their operational data into ActivityInfo for both the CBI-TWG and Food Security Sector log-frames.
  + The following actors were reminded to kindly do so by **COB 15 August:** DRC, PARCIC, UNICEF, World Vision, Mercy Corps, STL, NRC, TRC, IRC, ASAM, SSG, CARITAS, Khayr, FAO, Save the Children.
  + It was reiterated that all submissions into Activity-Info should take place by the **10th of every month,** to allow for sufficient time to produce the Inter-Sector Dashboards and prepare for the next meetings later in the month.
  + A further Training on ActivityInfo will be held by Rob Samupindi on **18 August at 11:00 AM** at UN House Gaziantep.
* ***The following points of concern were raised by partners, particularly NGOs:*** 
  + **Clearer Definitions on Interventions –** CARE noted that all infographics and maps need to reflect the agreed three cash-based intervention categories for this group: Food only; NFI/Basic Needs; Both Food/NFIs/Basic Needs. The Information Manager also needs to ensure that there is no double-counting between interventions or that this is highlighted. It was also suggested that timings of secured funding are included in mapping so that this can be used to advocate for coverage of funding gaps.
  + **Agreements with Nagis and other service providers for data sharing –** Welthungerhilfe noted that Nagis can provide commodity price monitoring on a monthly basis that can be easily uploaded onto ActivityInfo.
  + **Price & Shop Monitoring –** CARE noted that there needs to be a greater distinction between prices displayed and the prices charged to beneficiaries in the analysis. The price data gathered by NRC in their assessment, considered data from both kinds of shops (Turkish and Syrian) and averaged the costs. This is because people are likely to use multi-sector cash in both kinds of shops.
  + **Household Expenditures –** It would be beneficial to analyse six month cycles of household priorities on expenditures per different districts to promote a more accurate overview of trends.
  + **Multi-Purpose Cash v. Restricted E-Vouchers -** CARE noted that the 4W spreadsheet should clarify whether partners are using multi-purpose cash (NRC) or restricted e-vouchers to ensure better data analysis and comparability.
  + **Pre-Assessment Data/PDM –** Partners noted that it would also be helpful to compare Pre-Assessment Data with PDM findings to gauge how much beneficiaries have benefitted from assistance.
  + **ESSN -** Partners requested further information on the ESSN and the role of NGOs in this process.

3. Update on the CARE Recruitment Process of the Technical Consultant & Data Collection Process

* CARE noted that there has been some delay to the process due to the ECHO workshop clashing with the original interview date and then the Bayram holiday.
* The offer has been made and accepted and contracting is being completed.
* The Consultant expected to arrive on Tuesday 2 August but will begin review of data on Thursday 28 July.
* Chloe Day, CARE will aim to outline an initial workplan to be shared by the group during w/c 1 August.
* The Consultant will focus during w/c 1 August on data review and analysis, identification of gaps in data, and meetings with stakeholders.
* CARE will be in touch to arrange meetings with current cash actors.
* For field work to fill data gaps it is likely that this will need to take place during w/c 8 August and/or w/c 15 August: NRC, WHH, CARE and possibly DRC offered to assist with this.
* The Consultant plans on presenting the s/MEB findings on 22 August at the next CBI-TWG Meeting.

4. Update from CARE on the Harmonization of the Price Tracker, Shop Monitoring & Shopkeeper Satisfaction Tools

* Salah Hamwi, CARE introduced the harmonized e-voucher Shop Monitoring Questionnaire, Price Tracker for standardized food and NFI commodities and Shopkeeper Satisfaction Surveys, developed in consultation with WHH, WVI, IOM and CARE.
* The tools will be shared with the group and any feedback will be considered.

5. Overview of Existing Partner Accountability Approaches & Discussion on Next Steps for Design of Guidelines on AAP

* Sara Fowler, WFP-AAP Advisor provided an overview of existing partner beneficiary accountability approaches, in terms of information provision, community consultations and feedback and complaints, based on data from CARE, DRC, IOM, Mercy Corps, WVI and WHH.
* A question was raised regarding the ability of different phones to receive Arabic texts. Some had heard that only smart phones could receive them and others had seen non-smart phone receiving Arabic messages. If possible would be good to have more information on this.
* It was noted that there should be shared definition of what constitutes AAP in Turkey.
* The following agencies (IOM, CARE, UNHCR, NRC, DRC) agreed to nominaete AAP focal points to support Sara Fowler in the design of AAP Minimum Standandards.

7. AOB – Agency Updates and Closing Remarks

* ASAM agreed to share their statistical overview of the impact of cash programming on beneficiaries pre and post distribution in South-Eastern Turkey at the next meeting.
* Welthungerhilfe will also share information on their PDMs.
* World Vision is planning assessments in Ankara, Bursa, Mersin and Istanbul and will present their findings shortly.
* Mercy Corps will start their assessment in Gaziantep by mid-July 2016.
* Partners agreed to focus on Pillar 2, Activity 18 of the Work-Plan at the next meeting, which focuses on Beneficiary Accountability Mechanisms.
* The next CaLP L2 Training will take place from 1 to 5 August at Divan Hotel, Gaziantep. All candidates will be notified regarding their selection status at the end of July. A further CaLP Level 2 Training will be organized at the beginning of October.
* All partners interested in Protection Trainings are kindly requested to complete the UNHCR Training form.

*Next CBI TWG:* ***Monday, 22 August******2016****, 11:00 am to 13:00 pm @ WFP, UN-House, Gaziantep.*

**ATTENDEES:**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Organization** | **Name** | **Title** |
| 1. WFP | Vanessa Bonsignore | Program Officer - Coordination |
| 1. UNHCR | Giuseppe Simeon | Senior CBI Officer |
| 1. WFP | Sara Fowler | AAP Advisor |
| 1. World Vision | Ahmad Saoud | Commodity Specialist |
| 1. CARE | Salah Hamwi | Project Manager |
| 1. ASAM | Tugce Atak | MSC Manager |
| 1. WFP | Rob Samupindi | Information Management Officer |
| 1. DRC | Paula Armstrong | Project Coordinator |
| 1. GOAL | Ervim Eraslan | Project Coordinator |
| 1. Relief International | Golusun Yazici | Emergency Relief Manager |
| 1. Welthungerhilfe | Jesco Weickert | Head of Program |
| 1. Welthungerhilfe | Ilke Mucuk | Project Assistant |
| 1. UNHCR | Selwa Aboulkadir | Associate Program Officer |
| 1. UNHCR | Hilda Ochuonyo | Associate Protection Officer |
| 1. NRC | Sara Buzzoni | CBI-Livelihoods Manager |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Asma Dada | IMO & Protection |
| 1. CARE | Chloe Day | Program Manager |
| 1. WFP | Sayaka Maeda | Program Policy Officer (Cash-Based Tranfers) |
| 1. AAR Japan | Kiyomi Miyagoe | Program Coordinator |
| 1. Save the Children | Jenny Weatherall | FSL Technical Advisor |