

ESSN Task Force Ankara Minutes

Objective	To provide an update on ESSN (WFP/TRC), presentation on the ESSN TF Performance Survey results (WFP/TRC), presentation on overview of the findings of the CVME (WFP), updates on CCTE (UNICEF/TRC) and AOB.		
Date of meeting	08 December 2017 10:00 - 11:30	Location	WFP/TRC Park Oran Office, Ankara Yukari Dikmen Mahallesi, Turan Gunes Bulvari, No: 180Y, E Blok, Kat: 3 Office No: 3-4, Oran, Ankara Turkey

1. Update of ESSN (WFP/TRC)

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update on the ESSN to date noting that as of 8 December, a total of 373,243 applications were registered; 5,311 applications were not assessed; 196,487 applications were deemed eligible and 171,445 applications were ineligible. Approximately, 38,67% of the applications were registered by 18 TRC Service Centres. A total of 1,122,246 beneficiaries received ESSN assistance in November (48,952% male/51,048% female). Majority of the beneficiaries are Syrian nationals (90.9%) followed by the Iraqi (6.4%) and Afghan (2%) nationals.
- Second periodic top-up was made in November 2017. Eligibility HH of beneficiaries as follows: HH 1-4 (19%), HH 5-8 (68%), HH 9+ (12%)
- Inclusion rate is 53%. Average household size is 5.92.
- In Anatolia Region, majority of the applications are from Ankara, Konya (satellite city for IP holders) and Eskisehir provinces. Minimum number of applications are received in Bolu. In Ankara province, majority of the ESSN HHs are from Altindag (Syrians), Mamak (Iraqis), and Kecioren.
- In total 189,589 cards have been uploaded with the November payment. 13,281 new cards were distributed nationwide in November. 97.87% cash was withdrawn from the ATMs where 2.13% POS usage for food, clothing, communication and houseware.
- Call Center serves in 6 different languages (Turkish, Kurdish, English, Arabic, Farsi, Pashtu). As of 6 December, 476,618 calls received. Calls-gender breakdown as follows: 53.29% male/46.68% female. Most of the calls received are for information request and complaints.
- TRC and WFP teams work on verification of the eligible/ineligible data coming from MoFSP on a monthly basis in order to check the discrepancies and data entry errors to be able to transfer the amount for the eligible by the end of each month. In November, the big portion of the discrepancy was because of the MERNIS error that includes "deletion of duplicated records" and "acquired citizenship".
 - Deletion of duplicated records: DGMM deletes oldest records of an individual when there is a detection of duplicated registration record in GOCNET.
 - Acquired citizenship: DGMM records are no longer valid. In November, 5,813 cases have been identified during the verification process that have acquired citizenship and the relevant information has been provided to those households for the further steps.
- For the HHs rejected for the cases of head of households acquired citizenship or deletion of duplicated records, HH needs to go and re-apply with another head of household. HH will be accepted for the cases of member or members of households acquired citizenship or deletion of duplicated records. Assistance will be reduced per individual when those cases are detected regardless of meeting demographic criteria with other members.
- Beneficiary Communication: Facebook page is used by AAP teams to spread other news/words from the other agencies. They are also working on detecting the fake pages and reporting.
- Dormant accounts and uncollected cards: In December the first ESSN accounts will be swept for uncollected cards (3+ months) and dormant accounts (6+ months).
- Based on the information provided by Ankara Area office (AAO):

- A lot of undocumented foreigners are coming to the country (20.000/month) AAO is not sure how the numbers are being cumulated. AAO also expressed the concerns on how to enroll them on the ESSN in a timely manner. These people are not registered by DGMM, willing to be invisible in Turkey. Planning to cross the country to Europe.
- Media reports referring to detentions of thousands of foreigners mostly Afghans along old Silk Road. For non-Syrians, there is a risk to be deported. The procedure for the Syrians detected is to be sent to their registered provinces; the non-Syrians are being sent to the detention centres and procedure for the deportation to the country of origin is being started along with the other procedure of receiving their international protection application.

2. Presentation on the ESSN Task Force Performance Survey (WFP/TRC)

- The ESSN Task Force will promote proactive information sharing, including summary statistics of ESSN programming, and communication regarding the latest developments in the ESSN implementation process.
- Since December 2016, 35 meetings were held in total in Ankara, Gaziantep, Istanbul and Izmir; 2 provincial level meetings in Sanliurfa and Hatay.
- Survey was prepared in Turkish, Arabic and English. Participation rate is 23% (70 out of 304 e-mails from 4 ESSN TF mailing lists)
- More than 61% of the participants are from the (I)NGOs and civil societies.
- The average satisfaction rate (in general for all TFs, i.e. country level) varies between 71 – 85% and the lowest satisfaction rate (i.e. 65%) is obtained on the efficiency of feedback.
- There was a complaining that the calls do not receive Farsi support from 168 and TRC team followed the issue and made sure that the Farsi calls have access to the Farsi operator. It was explained by TRC that TRC Call Center operators reply incoming calls and the call center system puts 3 more calls in line, if you are the fourth caller, you drop from line. This is the reason why caller could not get Farsi Service.
- Main messages from the survey: less PPTs, more discussions, more clear referral/feedback mechanism on board, more capacity building activities, more case studies and protection related discussions, etc.

3. Presentation on Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Exercise (WFP)

- It was noted that the CVME represents an in-depth analysis of refugee vulnerability, which recognizes and addresses the limitations of PAB and PDM surveys. It aims to inform programme design and identify unmet needs, with a specific focus on targeting analysis and exclusion errors; barriers to application; and health, protection, shelter needs and gaps.
- In total, 3,555 individuals, or 600 households, were included in the sample. The exercise found that consumption is relatively good among refugee households, but there is a high reliance on negative coping strategies, with over half the sample population living below the poverty line.
- While ESSN-eligible households are in general poorer than ineligible households, ineligible households are still very poor and reliant on negative coping strategies. In general, non-applicants are the worst off, with more debt, greater reliance on emergency coping strategies, and worse food consumption scores.
- Beneficiary – lowered debt, possible positive impact of assistance. In PAB (before any assistance given), bene and non-ben were roughly equal. In other regions average is around 14% but Anatolia is much higher (32%).

4. Presentation on CTE (UNICEF/TRC)

- Brochures in Arabic, Turkish and English were printed and shared to multiple locations such as SASFs, TRC service centers, TECs and MoNE provincials and FAQ is prepared and is being revised as per the feedback coming from the partners and the latest version will be shared. Brochures in Dari/Pashto language are not yet available.
- As of November 2017, 167,442 beneficiaries were entitled for payment due to regular attendance in 80 provinces. Most of the beneficiaries are located in Hatay (12.84%), Istanbul (12.08%) and Sanliurfa (9.39%). Most of them are attending primary school (Grades 1-8).
- Payments to beneficiaries are made in every two months (Jan-Mar-May-Jul-Sep-Nov) in line with the national social assistance programme. There are no plans to make the payments every month.
- Based on the 168 Call Center Statistics, 74.50% of the calls are for the information request, 24.16% of them are for the questions regarding the card and only 1.28% of them are for the complaints

- Ankara Field monitoring: Routine visits to relevant program institutions (SASFs, TRC SCs, Halkbank branches and other) by TRC and UNICEF Field Monitors kicked off in October. In Central, Eastern Anatolia as well as Blacksea regions 18 provinces/31 SASFs were visited.
- Community Centers did not hear any CCTE beneficiary that dropped out.
- No significant technical problems preventing to proceed CCTE applications in the SASFs
- No confusion about criteria of ESSN/CCTE applications in the SASFs except the one in Nevşehir (It has been resolved following the visit)
- School-related issues are on the rise and they adversely affect the school registration and attendance: lack of capacity at the schools, language barrier due to lack of Turkish language skills, bullying and discrimination claims, transportation expenses due to distant schools, unofficial fees requested by school managements for meals, stationary kits etc. UNICEF Education Team has been informed about these issues to seek solutions in a coordinated manner.
- Due to Arabic menu on the ATMs (Halkbank), non-Arabic speakers experiencing difficulties. ATM issue is a common issue. Turkish is an option in some ATMs-started in Istanbul. Arabic menu is considered as very complicated.
- Child protection component of the programme: Aim is to help the families who their children drop the school. Child protection outreach teams visits those families to find out the reason why the child is not going to school.
- Callers are mostly female as it is most callers are male for ESSN.
- CCTE Child Protection Component:
 - The outreach teams will ensure that families who are enrolled in the CCTE program but are unable to maintain the school attendance levels required by the program and thus whose payments are frozen, have access to case management services and are supported to re-register their children to the CCTE program, or to find other appropriate non-formal education options for the child.
 - They will also work to ensure that a cohort of the most vulnerable families eligible for the CCTE program are contacted and assessed so that any child protection issues, including domestic violence, child labor and child marriage, are identified for referral to specialized services.
- Every 2 months the lists are shared with TRC, Database. As of 1 December, the programme reached 19,893 children.
- Common child protection concerns are child labour, child marriage, disability and school related problems such as language barriers, bullying, distance, service charges.
- CCTE Child Protection teams' role is very important in order to encourage those who are not going to school.
- The school service charges are an issue for the schooling program but it is not the first. Also in some cities MoNE answer the service requests of the refugee children. In every province, TRC has connection with other NGOs and governmental institutions but it varies local to local.
- Workshops regarding SGBV and child marriage, sexual and reproductive health seminars with Syrian woman, also inviting the children and young people to the child friendly or adult friendly areas. Also PSS support especially child marriage, child mother cases.
- TRC has collaboration with many NGOs regarding the cases. If the case is far away from the Community Center then asking for the other nearest NGOs; but if it is not away, then directly response the case.

5. AOB

- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF.
- Link (<https://www.wfp.org/category/country/turkey>) for the following Survey reports will be shared:
 - Online Social Cohesion Survey (in English and Turkish)
 - Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Survey (in only English – Turkish version is being prepared)
- Next meeting's focus will be on protection.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Ankara Presentation

2. Presentation on the ESSN Task Force Performance Survey Results
3. Presentation on Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Exercise
4. Presentation on Update on CCTE for Refugees