

Market Assessment: Saida

Building Resilient Communities in Lebanon:

An Integrated Approach to Livelihoods and Income Generation for Vulnerable Populations

28 December 2017

Introduction

Under the Dutch MFA-funded project titled “Building Resilient Communities in Lebanon,” Cesvi conducted a market assessment to survey the needs and opportunities in three key sectors of Saida’s labor market. The aim of this exercise was to better understand the actors and the environment impacting Cesvi’s activities, and to facilitate their ability to achieve the objectives of the above mentioned program. The market assessment will thereby assist Cesvi to analyze employment opportunities in key sectors and build relationships to improve project design and implementation.

Cesvi approach for construction sector trainings in Saida includes the three areas of green construction, MEP, and decorative finishing. These are summarized in the inception phase market assessment as follows:

(1) First, two TVET programs will be developed for provision of training on green buildings, one for unskilled workers and the second for semi-skilled site managers etc. Each course, covering approximately 3 months (maximum 60 hours) will be accompanied by apprenticeships to ensure hands-on learning (through a dual system).

(2) Second, a TVET program will be developed in MEP and general maintenance works, including fire safety, elevator repair and maintenance, electrical wiring etc. The course will cover approximately 4 months (maximum 120 hours) and will be accompanied by apprenticeships in the private sector.

(3) Third, a TVET program will be developed on decorative works such as carpets, carpentry, wallpapering etc. Each course will provide 2 months (maximum 40 hours) of training to beneficiaries who will be supported either through apprenticeships during the training program and/or access to jobs and internships after the completion of the training.

In addition to the TVET described above, participants in trainings will be offered opportunities in the same fields for on-the-job training through apprenticeships, job

placement. For those with small businesses, support for MSMEs via business development services will also be available.

Methodology

This report is the outcome of meetings and interviews undertaken by the project team in Beirut and Saida from 15 September 2017 to 19 December 2017. A total of 25 interviews were conducted.

Objectives

1. Determine the key stakeholders and influencers in the targeted sectors and build those institutional relationships
2. Determine the labor market demand for skills in green construction in caza Saida as a new growth sector
3. Provide recommendations for implementing and sustaining employment initiatives in green construction

Notably, as a partner in the Alliance consortium, ACTED is conducting a market assessment of MEP and decorative finishing as a part of the Social Development Centers' (SDC's) Market Resource Guides. For this reason, Cesvi's assessment focused largely on green construction. It should also be noted that while attempts were made to quantify demand for skills in green construction, the primary focus of this stage of the survey was to confirm the needs and interests of employers to clarify the type of program, as well as capacities and constraints in the relevant programmatic areas.

Activities in this survey included field interviews with contracting companies and employers, private sector experts, influencers and policy makers, program implementers, and related service providers. Interviews took the form of semi-structured meetings to understand the needs, perceptions, opportunities, capacity restraints, barriers to employment, or other challenges facing the green construction sector. Due to the lack of resources on this topic in Saida, the project team applied a "snowball" methodology whereby an initial list of key informants was prepared, and interviewees then provided suggestions for follow up contacts. The complete list of key informants can be found in Annex II, and a list of questions used to guide the semi-structured interviews in Annex III. This survey does not include the research conducted by the Lebanese Green Building Council, contracted to prepare the technical curriculum for green construction.

Context and desk review

The Syria response has prompted a greater number of market-related assessments than any other crisis to date, including in host countries such as Lebanon. Annex I outlines a variety of resources relevant to the labor market environment in Lebanon, including regulations and norms, tensions and social stability, vulnerability, and general labor market infrastructure. Neither the table in Annex I nor that following summary are intended to be exhaustive, however they should be regarded as useful reference materials which can be explored as needed.

Unemployment in Lebanon and high levels of informal labor were already a serious problem pre-Syria crisis, with the World Bank suggesting that the Lebanese economy would need to create six times as many jobs just to absorb the regular market entrants. Unemployment is particularly high in some of the country's poorest localities: in some areas, it is nearly double the national average, placing considerable strain on host communities. Longstanding inequalities are deepening and tensions at local level have been rising during the course of 2017, mostly over perceived competition for jobs and access to resources and services and exacerbated by an incendiary media. The economic downturn has had a disproportionate effect on young people and others who are entering the workforce: Lebanon's youth unemployment rates are three to four times higher than the overall unemployment rate.¹

The forced resignation of Prime Minister Hariri from Saudi Arabia in November caused significant concern for the financial stability of the country. A week after Hariri delivered a scripted resignation from Saudi authorities, Saudi Arabia also ordered Saudi citizens to evacuate Lebanon. There were fears that they would then threaten to expel the 250,000 or so Lebanese workers in Saudi Arabia, further damaging Lebanon's economy. There were also fears and speculations about Saudi's intentions to foment substantial civil unrest within Lebanon. While Hariri retracted his resignation after he was released and allowed to return to Lebanon, and Hezbollah's position in the government remains strong, this episode has demonstrated once more the fragility of Lebanon's political and financial position. These events prompted analysts to predict an economic downturn and has contributed to concerns that growth in the construction market may not increase as expected. Indeed, employers surveyed by Cesvi during November were pessimistic about their ability to remain financially stable during 2018.

¹ Excerpted from the LCRP 2018 Chapeau

Key findings

Green construction

Capabilities

Green construction is generally seen as a sector with potential, although none of the key informants interviewed could indicate a timeframe for how or when expansion might occur. According to the representatives of the Ministry of the Environment in the South² “people are attracted to green buildings,” and believes that there is a growing field for re-sale of buildings by promoting the green component. Cesvi is capitalizing on the strength of the Lebanese Green Building Council and affiliates to design and refine activities in this sector.

Constraints

People lack awareness on why a green building is important, and there is relatively little demand. At the same time, KIs suggested that green buildings are not built for reasons of environmental sustainability, but rather for financial gain and re-sale.³ This was echoed by the Order of Engineers, somewhat more pessimistically, that green buildings are expensive to build, and cheap to maintain. So while investors do want to resell, there is a perception that it is harder to make a profit on the building because the savings are more substantially a result of long-term energy efficiency. Aram Yeretzian, an expert in green architecture disagreed, however. He stated unequivocally that if the design team is aware of all potential factors then the building will not be more expensive than a conventional one. Additionally, he said that there is indeed a market for a 5% - 7% price increase for green buildings in Lebanon.⁴ This suggests that more consumer awareness is needed to grow the sector, as this is the primary driver for investors to choose green in the first place.

Many informants indicated that government environmental standards are missing and that this is a primary bottleneck to sector growth.⁵ A number of non-binding rating systems are in use however, including LEED (USA), which is a relatively well-known in Lebanon, as well as BREEAM (UK) and HQE (France). In addition, the Lebanese Green Building Council has designed ARZ, which speaks to the unique environmental context of Lebanon and is designed for application on pre-existing buildings. The Ministry of Energy informed the researchers that they require environmental assessments of new buildings, but there are no clear criteria or checklist for prioritizing those with a sustainable or energy-efficient agenda, and a committee reviews building plans on a case by case basis. Additionally, different ministries are responsible for approving different types of building plans; the Ministry of

² Rasha Kanj and Zeinab Eldor of the Ministry of the Environment South

³ Saida Chamber of Commerce Director; Danash Company; Order of Architects Beirut

⁴ Aram Yeretzian, AUB Assistant Professor, Joint Position for Climate Responsive Buildings, Faculty of Engineering and Architecture

⁵ Lebanese Green Building Council; MOE South; Dandashle Company

Environment approving towers over 12 stories, and the Urban Planning Department of the Ministry of Public Works and Transport approving smaller buildings. The office of the Ministry of the Environment in the South considers their role as advisory only, not decision-making, and that the Lebanon Environmental Pollution Abatement Project or UNDP and LIBNOR, the Lebanese Standards Institution, are now working on standardization.

Other constraints include the political and fiscal environment, which are closely linked. Construction companies interviewed all cited the economic recession in Lebanon as a bottleneck which has restricted construction investment.⁶ Given that this lull in investments is strongly influenced by an unstable political environment, they expressed substantial concern over the current climate.⁷ Unanimously, construction companies said that their biggest obstacle to growth was related to the political dynamics and pressures.

Potential

As indicated above, many informants indicated their belief that the green construction sector in Lebanon has potential.⁸ However the labor market needs appear to be with engineers and architects, not with skilled laborers. Danash Company said that they do not need to hire anyone with skills specific to resource efficiency, as this is done in the design phase of the project. They explained that specialists write the design, and construction companies may hire them on as consultants when necessary. The representative of the MOE in the South also noted that contractors are quite good at following their environmental recommendations, suggesting that there may not be a gap in labor in green construction. More to the point the Mayor of Saida, himself a construction company owner, summarily dismissed Cesvi's plan to work with laborers, and strongly suggested to target engineers.

While there is an opportunity to re-target the green construction for engineers, it is deeply problematic for the project aims and targets that construction companies do not see a value in training laborers in a sector which requires heavy theoretical background. On the other hand, construction companies like HarCo and Dandashle both expressed their interest to have their engineering-level staff trained in green construction, in order to better market themselves as a company with this unique expertise.

In summary, key market stakeholders agree that there is a small and emerging market for green construction skills, however these were not what we expected them to be – at a design level, rather than labor. The agents of change related to the policy environment are supportive, and would like to see an improvement in standards in this sector. The innovation is again, happening at the level of design and architecture, which is where current trainings

⁶ Bina' Company; Dandashle Company; Hariri Construction; GENECO; and Danash

⁷ At the time of research and writing, Prime Minister Rafic Hariri submitted his resignation from Saudi Arabia, and both Saudi Arabia and Kuwait embassies instructed their citizens to leave Lebanon. This caused confusion within Lebanon and international fears of regional pressures and potential conflict.

⁸ Lebanese Green Building Council; Order of Architects Beirut; Saida Chamber of Commerce; Ministry of the Environment Saida;

are taking place. For example, LEED courses being conducted by Amideast and the Order of Architects and Engineers. There is not a sense of upcoming demand for labor, as skilled and semi-skilled laborers just need to follow instructions of the contractor, who follows the design. It is not necessary for them to have any understanding of green building, if they have sufficient expertise in their respective field (electricals, plumbing, etc). Therefore the job market for this sector appears very small. Employers are not looking for people skilled in even LEED standards, as they are considered as consultants and not employees of a company. This needs to be an area of substantial investigation by the incoming curriculum development specialist in green construction.

Employment market and job placement

All employers indicated that they prefer to hire workers who can demonstrate skills and experience over those who have certificates in their field. Some continued to say that the certificate does not even matter, as most school-based TVET programs rely on theoretical simulations which lack real-life applicability.⁹ This was not surprising to the project team, however their responses emphasized the importance of taking a hands-on and competency-based approach to the training design.¹⁰

Capabilities

Strengths of the construction labor market appear few. Time and again, informants indicate that workers have little knowledge of their sectors, and people seem to get jobs only by knowing friends or relatives. No real application process or certification requirements, and those who have certificates have been considered by some employers as arrogant or having unrealistic expectations for their salary or working hours.

Constraints

Over and over again it was mentioned by key informants that Lebanese, by and large, are not interested to work in labor sectors.¹¹ As a result, the construction subsectors lack a skilled workforce, and other sectors related to administration and management are saturated, with no further absorptive capacity.¹² This is due to a social perception of labor which is present across Lebanon's communities and classes. Given that there are also

⁹ Harco Construction; Binaa' Construction; Sangary Plumbing – the latter also pointed out that regardless of the amount of background the new employee may have, there is always a period of on-the-job training during the first 6 months in order to ensure the new hire has the appropriate skill level.

¹⁰ This is reflected in the best practice of the sector, including in the 2018 LCRP

¹¹ National Employment Office Beirut; Danash Company; Al Sangaray Company

¹² NEO Beirut

substantial gaps in career counselling based on market research, students meet many challenges in finding employment in the career path of their choice.

For women, the construction subsectors do not provide opportunities for employment. Many social factors prevent women from entering these fields. However even when they are being considered for jobs in administrative sectors they face constraints such as less pay than for male counterparts, discrimination based on family or marital status, or discrimination about whether or not they wear hijab.¹³ This is echoed in numerous labor assessments in the region, which indicate women are more likely to experience restrictions based on perceptions of women-appropriate work, lack of negotiation power, and issues related to mobility.¹⁴

With regard to female entrepreneurs, however, challenges faced by women were less social, and more related to marketing. According to the Saida SDC Director, in his experience women-led MSMEs did not have adequate understanding of market assessments, faced extremely high competition (in the female-dominated areas of beauty and artisanal products), and generally did not know how to market their work. In addition to this, one can infer that due to the proliferation of NGOs working to support women entrepreneurs and female-headed-households, that it is likely that robust assessments were not conducted to determine the market's absorptive capacity for this influx of MSMEs in traditionally "feminine" fields.

Given the social constraints, it may be impossible to expect any women to participate in Cesvi's construction sector trainings. It is unlikely that any programmatic design will be able to address the fundamental causes of women's lack of participation in technical jobs in MEP, decorative finishing, or green construction.¹⁵ With relation to MSMEs, suitable knowledge of market concepts and dynamics can be included in trainings or joint consortium events, in order to increase the likelihood of success among women entrepreneurs.

Potential

Saida has particularly high unemployment and a large concentration of urban poor.¹⁶ During an interview with Majzoob House for Production, a job-placement agency, the respondent proposed that lack of attention to technical and vocational trainings in this city contributes to the gap between employers and jobseekers. Therefore Saida municipality itself and the economically-linked municipalities immediately neighboring to the east, have potential to see greatest impact from this project's activities.

¹³ Meetings with UNRWA employment office; Advanced Vocational Training School

¹⁴ Mercy Corps, Save the Children, IRC (Jan 2016) "Labor Market Analysis in Humanitarian Contexts"

¹⁵ LGBC, the contractor designing the green construction curriculum, is expected to indicate the degree to which women and persons with disabilities can engage in this sector as a part of their formal assessment and curriculum design.

¹⁶ Omar Abdulaziz Hallaj, "Saida Urban Sustainable Development Strategy: Local Economic Development" 2014.

One major area of opportunity for this project is to provide follow up *after* the apprenticeship placement, with both employees and employers. Based on the relatively short timeframes of donors, evaluation at post-job placement stage is not easily achieved, and none of the job-placement agencies surveyed indicated they were able to perform such monitoring. With the cascading nature of Cesvi’s trainings, however, there is the opportunity to survey employers on a rolling basis to modify trainings and apprenticeship content and delivery and assess whether employment needs are being adequately addressed.

Another area of potential in the employment market is that there appears to be no discrimination against Palestinians or Syrians among those employers surveyed. It was consistently noted by respondents that companies face no problem to hire non-Lebanese in the construction and related contracting sectors. However, laborers tend to be Syrians and some Palestinians (working for subcontractors, not normally for construction companies), foremen tend to be Palestinians or Lebanese, and academically-trained engineers tend to be Lebanese.

Some employers as well as implementers have suggested that Cesvi should not overlook “soft” skills as an important component of the program.¹⁷ These skills may support the jobseeker to remain assertive in their job search, improve their willingness to commit to a job, or contribute to their professional integrity overall. Inclusion of soft skills trainings may improve longer-term job prospects and retention.

Threats

In general, very few employers in Lebanon are able or willing to provide “decent” work for employees, defined by the ILO as “productive work in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity.”¹⁸ For both Lebanese and non-Lebanese, employees in lower-skilled sectors are hired on a daily basis, and work without any contract, insurance, or other benefits. Indeed, according to ILO’s report on decent work in Lebanon, “non-Lebanese work almost exclusively in the informal economy, with no social protection, long hours and, on average, earning less than the minimum wage.” This is echoed by the UNRWA employment office in Saida, which shared that neither employers nor job seekers of any nationality are aware of their employment rights under the Lebanese law. This lack of awareness or application of existing policy, not to mention shortcomings in labor standards and social protection policies, are likely to threaten medium-term livelihood improvements for program beneficiaries.

Curriculum development and TVET schools

¹⁷ Including Harco; Makhzoumi; UNRWA employment office of Saida

¹⁸ Salem Ajluni and Mary Kawar, ILO, “Towards Decent Work in Lebanon: Issues and Challenges in Light of the Syrian Refugee Crisis” 2015.

Capabilities

TVET schools surveyed in Saida (Siblin Center, Advanced Technical Training Institute) are well-regarded by employers, with Siblin being far more widely recognized. Neither of the schools surveyed had any awareness of green construction coursework, and both have different gaps when it comes to implementation of other curriculums.¹⁹ All employers indicate that even students with vocational certificates have to be re-trained on the job, so although Siblin was a well-recognized name, it may not be an indication of the school's overall capacity in the construction sector.

Constraints

Existing curriculums are rarely market driven, and some, including both the Saida SDC Director and the NEO-DG, say that the lack of market research is a primary factor in unemployment.

With regard to the MEP training, a large number of sources say that 120 hours for all three components is highly inadequate. This has been shared with Concern to better facilitate that consultancy, however it remains to be seen how the training will be designed to best improve the skills of semi-skilled workers.

Potential

The green construction curriculum will be market-driven and validated by employers.²⁰ This is important given the numbers of TVET trainings being offered in Lebanon, which follow relatively traditional classroom-based approaches. In discussion with LEADERS Consortium members Makhzoumi and DRC, Cesvi's approach has been further influenced based on their findings that trainings on job sites may be more practical. This is discussed in more details in Cesvi's internal program approach document.

There appears to be no green construction curriculum which targets workers. The LGBC has an existing curriculum (64 hours) for training assessors in ARZ, which targets engineers and architects. Similarly, Amideast and the Order of Architects and Engineers in Beirut both hold somewhat regularly 12-15 hours trainings in LEED for the same audience.

In almost every single interview with TVET schools, specialists, or employers, there is some confusion about what Cesvi's proposed training would entail. There is general consensus that workers have no need to learn about green construction sectors, as this is designed by an engineer and implemented by subcontractors following their plans. While this could

¹⁹ Siblin is more equipped to teach MEP, and neither school is prepared to conduct decorative finishing. AVTC's strength is in auto mechanics.

²⁰ This approach is global good practice, and was echoed by local NGO "Social Relief and Welfare Organization," who suggest that trainings should be preceded by detailed labor analyses and market forecasts.

potentially cause some difficulty securing buy-in from employers, it is most certainly an opportunity to improve the quality of the sector's outputs by addressing an otherwise new link in the labor value chain.²¹

Threats

Lack of support or authorization from either MEHE or MOL could contribute to the proliferation of unauthorized TVET completion certificates and saturate the market with workers whose certificates may become devalued as a result. However, the organizations currently undertaking or planning TVET in the sectors related to Cesvi's intervention around Saida are relatively few. These are Hilfswerk Austria (welding), the Social Relief and Welfare Organization (electrical, plumbing, tiling), and PU-AMI (construction). As noted above, there appear to be no other organizations or TVET schools working in green construction with workers or subcontractors, only in related technical areas.

Recommendations

Recommendations have been made throughout this document under subsections "potential" and "threats." Below is a list of a few additional recommendations for implementing and sustaining this project's employment initiatives. In addition, the annexed guidance document "ARC activities - Recommendations on approach" was a direct development of this exercise, and gives specific suggestions on each of the activities under the ARC-funded project in order to address the recommendations below.

1. Conduct ongoing monitoring and evaluation to better link project activities

The overall design of the project activities are logical and have the ability to have a positive impact in Saida, and the innovations in this program are consistently identified as "opportunities" throughout this survey. However this will be successful only if properly planned in a strategic fashion, linking the opportunities in each action to those in upcoming actions, capitalizing on networks, and sufficiently monitoring throughout. For example, linking business development activities to the same construction MSMEs who may also send staff to trainings or provide apprenticeships. Activities must build on one another in order within the same stakeholder networks in order to create continuity of the knowledge in an otherwise new potential growth sector. In this way of working with the private sector intensively, the small construction market of Saida can participate in a breadth of activities to build future employment in green construction.

²¹ To be further developed based on the assessment of LGBC

2. Give attention to the Lebanese demographic to have long-term outcomes

Overall, it may be a challenge to attract Lebanese in Saida area into this program. Given the attention to vulnerable groups and the training subject material, Lebanese may be less inclined to participate, and some balance should be maintained in order to preserve good relationships with local authorities. Advertisement and communications materials can therefore focus on the on-the-job training components and links to employment opportunities. Consider where curriculum can give attention to the management skills participants may need in positions such as foremen and site managers.

3. Build civic awareness when possible to support “demand”

While outside of the remit of the current activities, the green construction component will be better served if activities can support both the local authorities’ and the general public’s awareness of green building; i.e.: addressing the apparent demand constraints. There is a general consensus that green construction is a sector with some growth potential, however challenges include an unstable political and financial climate, lack of adequate policy or enforcement, and lack of consumer demand.

Little can be done to address the political and financial instability, however it may be possible to address the lack of vision on the part of local authorities with activities that support their general understanding or their creativity around incentives or planning. It is suggested therefore to continue to build a collaborative relationship with the municipality and Chamber of Commerce, as well as the SDCs when appropriate. Regular meetings with the municipality and Chamber of Commerce to update them and troubleshoot problems will be mutually beneficial. The project can continue to engage their focal points and volunteers in activities, and potentially continue to use their spaces for events.

Other activities which can take into consideration constraints related to consumer demand may also help to position the project for success in the final year of implementation, and for Cesvi’s future projects in the South. Given that ACTED is also working under the “green jobs” portfolio in Saida, some brainstorming with them may be helpful about how public communications strategies can be integrated into existing activities.

4. Address both “soft skills” and decent work

Given that hiring preferences favor those within existing networks, providing professional skills support for jobseekers is an essential activity. Although this was not foreseen as an activity that Cesvi would undertake, it is clear from the hiring preferences described by the NEO and by employers that without this training or support, job seekers will find it difficult to retain a job, or sustain outcomes of the career counselling beyond the scope of the project. Additionally, it is clear that some basic support for employers to provide “decent

work” is needed, promoting employers’ perceptions of jobseekers, and their ability to enact fair and equitable hiring and contracting practices. Detailed suggestions for how to implement this recommendation are included in the document “ARC activities - Recommendations on approach.”

Annex I: Overview of relevant documents

Overview of Relevant Documents 2011-2017					
Year	Month	Issued by	Title	Region	Sector
Green Jobs					
2011		ILO, UNDP	Green Jobs Assessment in Lebanon - Synthesis Report	All	Livelihoods
2015	Oct	UNDP	Renewable Energy and industry: Promoting Industry and Job Creation for Lebanon	All	Livelihoods
Labor market assessment and policy environment					
2013	July	Save the Children International	Skills Gap Rapid Assessment	Tripoli, Bekaa	Livelihoods
2014	May	FAO	Lebanon Plan of Action for Resilient Livelihoods 2014-2018	All	Livelihoods, Food security
2014	Sept	European Training Foundation	Labour Market and Employment Policy in Lebanon	All	Livelihoods
2015	Jan	Mercy Corps, Shield	Labor Market Assessment: South Lebanon	South	Livelihoods
2015		ILO	Towards Decent Work in Lebanon: Issues and Challenges in Light of the Syrian Refugee Crisis	All	Livelihoods
2016	Feb	GIZ	Employment	All	Livelihoods

			and Labor Market Analysis - Lebanon		
2017	Jan	LEADERS Consortium	Skills Gap Analysis for Improved Livelihood Sustainability in Lebanon	Mount Lebanon, Tripoli, Bekaa	Livelihoods
2017	March	UNDP	Mind the Gap: A Labor Needs Assessment for Lebanon 2016	All	Livelihoods
2017	Nov	World Bank	Doing Business 2018: Reforming to create jobs - Lebanon	All	Livelihoods
Social stability					
2014	March	Mercy Corps	Policy Brief: Engaging Municipalities in the Response to the Syria Refugee Crisis in Lebanon	All	Social stability
2014	Dec	UNDP, Mercy Corps	Stabilization and Resilience in Protracted, Politically-Induced Emergencies: A Case Study Exploration of Lebanon	All	Social stability
2017	June	Mercy Corps	From Tension to Violence: Understanding and Preventing Violence	All	Social stability

			between Refugees and Host Communities in Lebanon		
Program reports					
2016	June	Mercy Corps	INTAJ Evidence paper	Bekaa, North	Livelihoods
2017	September	Mercy Corps	INTAJ Stability Paper: Evidence from the SME component	Bekaa, North	Livelihoods, Social stability

Annex II: List of key informants

Employers or sector experts

1. El Sangaray Plumbing Systems, Saida
2. Hariri Construction Company, Saida
3. General Construction and Contracting Company, Saida
4. Dandashle Construction Company, Saida
5. Binaa Real Estate, Saida
6. Danash Company, Saida
7. Order of Engineers and Architects, Beirut
8. Lebanese Green Building Council, Beirut
9. Aram Yeretizian, Architecture Professor AUB

Local authorities

1. Saida Chamber of Commerce
2. Municipality of Saida
3. Ministry of Energy and Water, South Lebanon
4. Social Development Center, Saida
5. Social Development Center, Haret Saida
6. National Employment Office, Beirut
7. National Employment Office, South Lebanon

Program implementers and service providers

1. Advanced Vocational Training Center, Saida
2. UNRWA Sibling Training Center
3. UNRWA Employment Services Center, Beirut and Saida
4. Makhzoumi Foundation, Beirut
5. IRC Economic Recovery and Development Office, Beirut
6. Social Relief and Welfare Organization, Saida
7. Majzoob House for Production
8. IBDA Microfinance, Beirut
9. Abaad, Beirut

Annex III: Outline of semi-structured interview questions

Key themes and questions:

1. Confirming a market need for the type of jobs or skills identified
 - a. Talk to key economic stakeholders
 - i. Example in green construction, what hubs/influencers/supporters are there?
 - ii. Who are the agents of change related to the policy environment and what is their position?
 - b. Who sees potential in this sector and why
 - i. Where is the innovation happening in Lebanon?
 - ii. These jobs might not be totally prevalent right now, but is there a sense for upcoming demand - how far out, etc.

2. What's the current market look like?
 - a. What are employers looking for? Talk to the places people coming out of the training will get hired by
 - i. How the jobs/businesses you see people going into work now - who is hired, what are their skills, what are they paid, how are they hired, etc
 - ii. Talk to some employers in each area and maybe some people who do these jobs now
 - b. Starting their own businesses? Link to existing MSMEs? What's the pathway to do that in each sector and what are some criteria on whether we support them?
 - c. What skills are needed to at least start in this field, and how long will they take to teach?

3. Ensure development of curricula is skill focused, but practical and hands on.
 - a. How does learning this lead to actual employment?
 - b. What additional services can be added in based on the area - even if it's just referral to job counselors like at IRC (their microbusiness counselors)
 - c. Is the context sensitive to building local skills and jobs?
 - d. Confirming what skills can be learned in the time frame, to ensure curricula is practical and focused on what employers need
 - e. Consider gender in each of the sectors and how likely it is for women to participate
 - f. Consider nationality in each of the sectors and what balance can be expected based on the geographical scope