

Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

14 September 2017

Gaziantep

Chaired by: WFP, UNHCR, and CARE

Hosted by: WFP

Agenda:

1. Introduction and welcome
2. Review of the action points of the previous meeting
3. Presentation on the findings of ESSN Market Price Monitoring Bulletin for Q2
4. Review of the draft Ground Truth Solutions survey on beneficiary perceptions of cash assistance
5. Brief update on the 3RP planning process
6. A.O.B

Summary of Action Points

- ✓ WFP to follow up with other partners implementing CBI in Turkey, including IOM and UNICEF, to encourage their active participation in TWG meetings going forward.
- ✓ WFP to follow up with TRC to determine the minimum information required to cross-check winter beneficiaries against ESSN recipients.
- ✓ In order to ensure TRC is prepared to manage the increased workload associated with cross-checking winter beneficiary lists, NGOs to advise, through the winter taskforce, on their expected timelines for sharing of data. (WFP to follow up with the winter taskforce).
- ✓ WHH to share their criteria for selection of beneficiaries of CBI assistance in Maras. Timeline: by CoB 22 September.
- ✓ WFP to consult the TSI regarding the inclusion of children aged 15-17 in the calculation of the youth unemployment rate and share feedback with the CBI-TWG. Deadline: TBC
- ✓ WFP to explore the possibility of sharing graphs illustrating trends in key macroeconomic indicators since the onset of the Syria crisis. Deadline: TBC
- ✓ WFP to consult UNHCR and other agencies represented on the STF to determine whether there is any data available on the unemployment rate among refugees in Turkey. Deadline: CoB 22 September.
- ✓ The WFP TWG Coordinator to share a soft copy the GTS questionnaire with CBI-TWG members. Deadline: 14 September.
- ✓ CBI-TWG members to provide feedback/suggestions on the questionnaire to WFP, for onward submission to GTS. Deadline: 15 September.

1. Introduction and welcome

- The TWG Coordinators welcomed participants. It was noted that several longstanding TWG members were not present, and WFP agreed to follow up with IOM and UNICEF, in particular, to encourage their active participation going forward.

Action point:

- WFP to follow up with other partners implementing CBI in Turkey, including IOM and UNICEF, to encourage their active participation in TWG meetings going forward.
-

2. Review of the action points of the previous meeting

Following a brief tour de table, WFP revisited the action points of the previous meeting, as follows:

- CBI-TWG coordinators to provide the CBI-TWG with a thorough de-brief on workshop outcomes at the next meeting, highlighting follow up actions/analysis required or requested from the working group. Status: Pending. WFP noted that discussions related to the workshop are ongoing at the Ankara level, and that a more detailed update would be shared at the next meeting.
- WHH to share their data on healthcare visits/costs with WFP. Status: N/A. It was noted that WHH was not able to retrieve the data and therefore the action point had been dropped.
- WFP to check and advise on whether social welfare payments to Turkish citizens are adjusted to account for inflation and provide feedback to CBI-TWG members at the next meeting. Status: Completed. WFP advised that, according to the information available to them, there is a committee which meets on an ad-hoc basis to review the social welfare payments to Turkish citizens. The decisions that this committee takes may consider inflation, but are not based solely on this. The frequency does not seem to be set in stone, but WFP has heard (unconfirmed) that the review takes place every two years on average.
- WFP to collate information on the prices of winter items (incl. coal, if available) for inclusion in the Q2 ESSN Market Monitoring Bulletin and for circulation to BN/winterization actors. Status: Completed. WFP has advised that coal prices can be retrieved from the Turk-State database: (i) go to the link: <https://biruni.tuik.gov.tr/medas/?kn=84&locale=en>; (ii) select Consumer Item Prices (2003=100) at the very end of the menu; and (iii) use the item code: "0454001" (Coal Price).
- WFP to provide a breakdown of items included under each category of the ESSN MEB to enable harmonization and comparison with calculations based on local market surveys. Status: Completed (see attached).
- Co-chairs follow up on the analysis of TurkStat data to determine differences in costs of living in rural vs. urban areas, with a view to associated developing programmatic recommendations. Status: N/A. WFP advised that, when it comes to prices, data can only be retrieved at regional level, with "provinces" grouped into 26 regions, and, unfortunately, there is no coefficient available (@Turk-Stat database) that allows us to scale up/down prices for urban/rural areas. However, WFP agreed to follow up with TSI at Ankara level to determine whether there are other ways in which this comparison can be determined.
- CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Protection-CBI Risk Analysis Matrix by CoB 07 July, after which the tool will be considered final. Status: Completed. The tool has now been finalized.
- CBI-TWG members to share feedback on the Cash Modality Decision Tree by 11 July, after which IOM will work toward its finalization. Status: Feedback provided. Decision tree now under finalization and will be presented at the next meeting.
- Co-chairs to follow up with the ISWG coordinator to present on the CBI-Protection Risk Analysis Matrix and draft Cash Modality Decision Tree at the coming ISWG meeting. Status: Completed.
- Partners asked whether there were any updates on the process of cross-checking beneficiaries against ESSN DB – esp. with the 2017-18 winterization campaign scheduled to commence soon. It was noted that WHH and Watan have both cross-checked their e-voucher beneficiary lists against the ESSN DB, and that TRC responded within 2-3 days. [Update: For the winter response, TRC has advised that the minimum information required to undertake cross-checks against the ESSN DB would be: (i) name of org; (ii) foreign ID number; (iii) province; (iv) district; and (v) contact number. WFP stressed that this

information must be shared in the same template and according to the SoP which has previously been shared on behalf of TRC].

- CBI-TWG members provided updates on the CBI activities. It was noted that CARE and IOM are currently exploring cash-based interventions to enable shelter rehabilitation. CARE explained that discussion on modality of assistance and negotiation with Ptt (Posta ve Telgraf Teşkilatı) is ongoing. Ptt was reported to have specified that their engagement will require a minimum budget of USD one million.
- UNHCR noted that it is delivering assistance through Ptt, which in turn uses Mastercard. UNHCR is now exploring the possibility of using Ptt pre-loaded Mastercards which can be used at ATMs and PoS and can be distributed directly by UNHCR and/or UNHCR IPs (rather than through Ptt – helping to avoid crowds at Ptt offices). Up to 250 USD/752 TL per month/per card can be uploaded, with remote reloading possible, and the cards are simple to use -- the pin is the last four digits on the card. That said, this increases the fungability of assistance and could exacerbate protection concerns. UNHCR offered to share further information with interested partners and support negotiations with Ptt if needed.
- WHH continues to implement its e-voucher programme Kahramanmaraş, which has now entered its second phase. Partners asked WHH to share their selection criteria to understand how these have been designed to minimize initial overlap with the ESN caseload.
- Partners briefly outlined their planned winter activities. WHH is also planning to provide winter assistance in Mardin, and highlighted the need to ensure close coordination with partners working within the same province, including UNHCR. Notably, some partners will include ESN beneficiaries among their winter caseload as second tier beneficiaries, whilst others, notably UNHCR, will only include ESN recipients in exceptional cases.

Action points:

- WFP to follow up with TRC to determine the minimum information required to cross-check winter beneficiaries against ESN recipients.
- In order to ensure TRC is prepared to manage the increased workload associated with cross-checking winter beneficiary lists, NGOs to advise, through the winter taskforce, on their expected timelines for sharing of data. (WFP to follow up with the winter taskforce).
- WHH to share their criteria for selection of beneficiaries of CBI assistance in Maras. Timeline: by CoB 22 September.

3. Presentation on the findings of ESN Market Price Monitoring Bulletin for Q2

- WFP presented the findings of the Q2 ESN Market Monitoring Bulletin, outlining its objectives, findings, and programmatic implications. Main findings included growth in the Turkish economy during the reporting period, as reflected by macroeconomic indicators such as growth of GDP (5%), reduction of the unemployment rate, and a decrease in the inflation rate compared to Q1.
- For the reporting period, the average MEB was 324 TRY/capita. There are vast disparities between regions; in the last 12 months, the difference between regions with highest and lowest MEB across the country has grown from 730 TL to 813 TL per HH. Rent continues to comprise the largest part of the average MEB (66%) and is also the main reason for regional disparities.
- CBI-TWG partners asked why children aged 15-17 are included in the national youth unemployment rate. It was noted that, according to Turkish labour regulations, children in this age bracket are only eligible for employment in certain part-time jobs. WFP M&E/VAM unit agreed to follow up with the TSI and provide the TWG with clarification.
- Partners expressed an interest in seeing trends in key macroeconomic indicators since the onset of the Syria crisis, as well as in obtaining data on the unemployment rate among the refugees. WFP agreed to follow up with the TSI and share feedback once available.

Action Points

- WFP to consult the TSI regarding the inclusion of children aged 15-17 in the calculation of the youth unemployment rate and share feedback with the CBI-TWG. Deadline: TBC
- WFP to explore the possibility of sharing graphs illustrating trends in key macroeconomic indicators since the onset of the Syria crisis. Deadline: TBC
- WFP to consult UNHCR and other agencies represented on the STF to determine whether there is any data available on the unemployment rate among refugees in Turkey. Deadline: CoB 22 September.

4. Review of the draft Ground Truth Solutions survey on beneficiary perceptions of cash assistance

- The WFP TWG Coordinator shared information on the survey which Ground Truth Solutions in planning to carry out in Turkey in October. The survey builds upon previous GTS assessments in Turkey and seeks detailed information on beneficiary perceptions of cash assistance. Due to time constraints, it was agreed that a soft copy of the draft questionnaire would be circulated to participants, who would in turn share their feedback with WFP by CoB 15 September.

Action Points:

- The WFP TWG Coordinator to share a soft copy the GTS questionnaire with CBI-TWG members. Deadline: 14 September.
- CBI-TWG members to provide feedback/suggestions on the questionnaire to WFP, for onward submission to GTS. Deadline: 15 September.

5. Brief update on the 3RP planning process

- The WFP TWG Coordinator briefly updated participants on the 2018-19 3RP planning process, but noted that most planning will take place through sector working groups.

6. AOB

N/A