

## ESSN Task Force Izmir Minutes

### Agenda

1. Welcome and Introduction
2. Action points from the previous meeting
3. Updates on ESSN and its implementation in the Aegean region
4. Updates on CCTE
5. Q&A with General Directorate for Population and Citizenship (NÜFUS)
6. AOB
  - Performance Survey Results
  - Case Study Report

<b>Date of meeting</b>	5 April 2019 09:30 - 11:30	<b>Location</b>	Türk Kızılay Izmir Branch - Sehit Nevres Bulvari No:3 1. Kat, Kizilay Is Merkezi, Izmir
		<b>Meeting Co-Chairs</b>	<b>WFP:</b> Arzum Karasu <b>TK:</b> Hanifi Kinaci

### 1. Action Points:

No action point for the future meeting.

### 2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turk Kizilay (TK) provided updates on the ESSN programme to date, highlighting:
- By 25 March 2019 a total of 514,675 applications (2,617,206 people) were registered; 1,997 applications were not assessed; 280,276 applications were deemed eligible and 232,402 applications were ineligible. 36.92% of the applications were registered by TK Service Centers.
- 271,618 households (total of 1,580,036 individuals) have received ESSN assistance in March.
- 9,486 households (total of 55,470 individuals) in Izmir have received ESSN assistance.
- As of 8 March, 1,432 accounts were swept back nationwide [ 580 uncollected cards (+3 months), 852 dormant accounts (+6 months)].

### ■ TK-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:

Monitoring visits were conducted in **Izmir, Mugla, Kutahya, Isparta, Denizli, Burdur, Afyonkarahisar and Aydin** to District Governorships, District Muftis, District Directorates of Population and Citizenship (Nufus), SASFs, Halkbank branches, Hospitals, Mukhtars, TK SCs, TK Community Centres, Social Service Centres and ISKUR Service Centres.

#### Method:

- TK conducted verification visits for random beneficiaries for database validity.
- Ten protection cases were identified and referred to relevant service providers.
- The implementation of the SASF Discretionary Allowance (SDA) was monitored.
- Surveys are to be conducted in April 2019 through HH visits to monitor and evaluate the implementation of the SASF allowance.

## Main Findings:

- Some of the visited SASFs, especially those in Mugla, expressed that they do not need to use their assigned quota for the SASF discretionary allowance, highlighting that the households in their district do not meet the ESSN criteria.
- Illiterate applicants face some challenges while obtaining their cards from Halkbank branches.
- Bodrum State Hospital has a **“Foreigner Rights Unit”** which assists foreign patients with their problems.
- **Syrian Crisis Coordination Board** has been established in Torbali, Izmir under the chairmanship of the District Governor. The Board has initiated back-to-school campaigns with transportation from tent housings. They will soon assist with school uniforms and meals. Members of the board include District Governorship, Law Enforcement, Directorate of Health, Directorate of Education, Directorate of Migration, TK Community Centre and several NGOs.

## **3. Updates on the CCTE:**

- UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor provided an update of CCTE noting that 404,610 beneficiaries were entitled for CCTE payment in March 2019. 201,315 Kizilaycards were uploaded with March 2019 payment. 1,571,344 Turkish beneficiaries received January 2019 payment in the national CCTE programme.
- As of 2 April 2019, 90 % (473,225) of the CCTE applications were accepted, 10 % (52,229) of the applications were rejected and 0 % (2,232) of the applications were pending. 36 % of the applications were registered by the TK Service Centres.
- As of 1 April, 110,325 calls were received by TK Call Center for CCTE. 56 % of the callers were women and top call category was information request.
- 3 % of the CCTE beneficiaries (16,924), who received March 2019 payment, were from Izmir.
- Districts where the Accelerated Learning Program (ALP) takes place in Izmir are: Bornova, Buca, Foça, Karabağlar, Konak, Menderes, Menemen and Torbali. In all these districts the ALP modules have started and continue at the PECs.
  - The number of ALP Learners was 1,090 among the 404,610 children paid in March 2019.
  - 91 out of 1,090 ALP Learners who have been accepted into the CCTE Programme are from Izmir.
- **Questions and Comments from the participants regarding CCTE and ALP Programmes:**
  - Question was asked regarding ALP registration criteria for children who are not registered in Izmir. Children who are not registered in Izmir can still apply and attend the ALP program if they meet the age and education level criteria and as the applications for CCTE are based on the residential district, the families of the ALP students need to apply to CCTE in the district where they live. Furthermore, if a child is going to ALP in one district and lives in another district within the same province, the family should apply for CCTE in the district that they live.
  - The reasons of why, not all ALP students are CCTE beneficiaries, was discussed. The most important barrier is ID and address registration. UNHCR commented that this is probably a prevalent case for Torbali. In the past, there has been a problem of students who were previously registered to YOBIS, as a student at a temporary education center, as their transition from TEC to PEC was not possible in the registration system. However, now, if a student had a registration to YOBIS 2 years ago or more, the YOBIS responsible at Provincial Directorates of MoNE can make transition in the system and MoNE has started to inform the ALP Coordinators on this functionality.
  - An NGSO representative provided a case detail regarding a student who was taken out of the ALP program in Karabağlar when he turned 18. It was later understood that the student finished one module, entered the equivalency exam but turned 18 before he could start another module in the ALP program. YOBIS system cannot take registrations when the age is above 18. The coordinator of the Public Education Center suggested that the person can attend language courses only which are the regular adult language courses

of the PEC for which the registration is taken over E-Yaygın (the Registration system for the courses provided by Public Education Centers).

- TK shared the information that TK Service Center in Konak will no longer process ESSN and CTE applications of families who reside in Karabağlar as there is no need in terms of number of applications, however, they will process the applications of families who reside in Bayraklı (along with Bornova and Konak).
- TK shared the information that there is Syrian Crisis Commission formed in Torbalı district. They are running a “Return to School” campaign. TK is a member of this commission.
- An NGO representative provided information regarding complaints they received from Syrians who tried to apply for CTE at Buca but were rejected due to their ESSN benefits. WFP and UNICEF commented that the issue is well known and raised with the necessary institutions.
- An NGO representative asked where they could direct education related issues. Any individual cases, including the cases of access to school of individual cases can be directed to the TK Community Center in Izmir. General trends, questions, and concerns on access to education in a certain region / for certain groups can be shared with UNICEF.

## ■ **Child Protection Component**

In total, 16 CP offices are operational in 15 Provinces with the highest number of refugees.

### **Their objectives are to:**

- Sustain positive education outcomes;
- Mitigate child protection risks and violations, which are closely intertwined with economic vulnerabilities (such as child labour, child marriage, physical and emotional violence and family separation), and
- Reducing the damage caused by exposure of children to violence, exploitation, abuse and neglect, and family separation.

### **a) Identification:**

- Identification is made through the CTE beneficiaries list provided by the MoLFSS
- Children are identified based on the following criteria for PHASE I
- Children whose payment has been paused (missed more than 4 days of school)
- Vulnerability Criteria (ESSN beneficiary list)
- Geographical location

In addition to those criteria in PHASE II; Focusing on specific grades (2nd and 6th grade will be prioritized starting from December). Since, in the November 2018 frozen list, 2nd and 6th grade had the highest numbers of students, starting from December, **2nd and 6th grade is prioritized** based on the frozen list of November 2018.

### **b) Screening:**

Screening is made through a risk/needs assessment carried out during household visits by TK Child Protection Teams in 15 provinces. Child Protection Teams do screening using standardized forms.

### **c) Response:**

- On the Spot Information:
  - ✓ CTE Eligibility Criteria and Application Process
  - ✓ ESSN Eligibility Criteria and Application Process
  - ✓ Obtaining ID

- ✓ Obtaining Report
- ✓ New Registry-identity/data verification
- Internal Referral:
  - ✓ Community Center Case Team
  - ✓ Service Center
  - ✓ Psychosocial Support
  - ✓ Child Friendly Spaces
  - ✓ Adolescent Friendly Spaces
  - ✓ 168 Line
- External Referral:
  - ✓ Health Services
  - ✓ District Governorate
  - ✓ Other NGOs
  - ✓ Civil Registry Office
  - ✓ ASPİM (Ankara Provincial Directorate of Family, Labour and Social Services)

#### **CCTE CP – March 2017 - February 2019:**

- Children screened by outreach teams: 59.005 (%51 boys / %49 girls)
- Children identified and assessed with protection needs: 10.972
- Children referred to specialized services: 5393

During January and February 2019, Izmir Child Protection Outreach Team screened 428 children.

#### **4. Q&A with Representative from Population and Citizenship Directorate (NÜFUS): M. Fatih ALUÇDIBI**

- After the participation of MoFLSS, MoH & DGMM in Task Forces, General Population and Citizenship Directorate (NÜFUS) was invited to the April ESSN TF meeting to introduce the existing structure and procedure of the NÜFUS as well as address issues faced with members on the field. Mr. Fatih ALUÇDIBI, The Head of Address Registration Department was invited to share his expertise.
- Mr. Alucdibi first explained the structure of their units and the nature of their interaction with DGMM. One key highlight is that information between these two structures are not shared regularly. i.e: NUFUS do not have direct access to the DGMM data. Mr. Alucdibi has shared that language is being encountered as an issue while interacting with the refugee community. Mr. Alucdibi has also expressed their wish to see DGMM handling refugee's registration cases as refugees first reach DGMM when entering the country and because NÜFUS lack the technical capacities in terms of both translation needs and access to information at DGMM level. He added that some procedures can be rapidly and more feasibly handled by DGMM. Another important point shared by Mr. Alucdibi, ***"The system used by Turkish institutions does not allow access to view family linkages between persons under foreigners status including refugees"***. NÜFUS, ahead of the Syrian influx, would deliver ID/address registration for foreigners present in Turkey to work and/or study. Following the influx this has changed to be completely dealt with by DGMM.
- **Address registration** According to Civil Registration Services Law number "5490", for an address registration the document showing the identity of the applicant such as Identity Card, Birth Certificate, Passport, or Residence Permit is enough. In case the declared address is vacant, no extra document is needed. If the address is already seen as being occupied on MERNIS (NÜFUS system), the applicant must

provide bill (electricity, gas, rental etc.) to confirm their residence. If the applicant cannot provide any documents, then a police investigation can/must take place.

All above mentioned rules are implemented for all individuals who live in Turkey regardless of their nationality or status.

- **For informal housing:** Addresses can still be generated. The law stated that address is a geographical location of a piece of land or a building defined by components such as province, district, quarter, road, street name and house number. So as long as these components exist in the system then all sorts of housings can be registered. Shelters such as caravans, tents, prefabricated houses, sports centres, nursing homes, social and training facilities can be registered as an address.

If no address components are available, then components can be created. NÜFUS can ask municipalities to verify. but the applicant (or landlord) can also go through this personally and ask directly the municipality to do so. Once this is done, the NÜFUS can then use this newly created address to proceed with the registration. In addition, Mr. Alucdibi stated that there is no limit to the number of people that can be registered into a single house (40 people can be registered into a flat). However, when registering, there can only be one application for all, i.e one same address registration for all members of the household.

- **Change of address:** Any change of address must be communicated by the person itself when moving to a new place. In most case TPs holders do not inform DGMM of their movement and this prevents NÜFUS department of the province where they recently moved to proceed with the registration.
- **Registration in a different province and district:** Moving to a different province in order to live there is prohibited unless the applicant situation is linked to the criteria introduced (Health, education, employment etc).
- **Moving from a district to another within a same province** is possible, NÜFUS can change the address given that the address is registered in that province.
- **Citizenship request:** There are two ways to acquire Turkish citizenship, one of them is by birth from a Turkish parent or being married to a Turkish spouse. Or having residence permit and residing in Turkey for more than 5 years, here applications are made at the **Provincial Citizenship and Population Directorate** (NÜFUS Mudurlukleri). This Directorate then sends the application to the district level NÜFUS to investigate. The other condition is the **exceptional citizenship** where the Board of Ministers have the ability to decide on giving citizenship to some people. This was processed by DGMM and they collected list from different ministries (MoH, MoNE). DGMM has - independently- the possibility to decide to allocate citizenship to some refugees given that they want to get the citizenship.
- **Marriage:** The law is the same again for all, Turkish and Foreigners:  
The legal marriage age is + 18. If the applicant is 17 then parents' consent is needed.  
If one of the applicants is 16 or less, then a court decision is needed.  
In all cases, religious marriage is not recognized by the Turkish state, civil marriage is the only valid form of marriage.
- **Birth certificate:** Registration is done based on the declaration of the applicant. Birth certificate has to be provided. In case of home-based delivery, either a witness testimony is requested or depending on the sensitivity of the request (suspicious profile for example) then a medical check might also be requested.  
Any birth registered by a parent who is -16 has to be reported to the prosecutor office.
- **Divorce:** Document proving the divorce is needed to register the divorce.
- **Orphans:** NÜFUS officials in order to register the child with any adult needs a decision from a court attesting that a non-parent, third person, can be considered as the legal guardian of that child and/or that the child can live with that person.
- A question regarding '**stateless status**' was raised by a participant, this status is not a case that NÜFUS unit is dealing therefore both M. Alucdibi and the Co- Chairs have reminded the participant that it falls under

an international mandate and that there are some specific protocols in place which could be a more reliable source when dealing with such case.

- PDMMs are the authorities to issue the civil registry for the foreigners including refugees, not NUFUS. It is important to add that “Death, divorce, marriage, baby registration procedures for the foreigners are being issued by the PDMM offices; NUFUS offices are only dealing with the address registration of the foreigners including refugees. The foreigners, including the refugees, should reach to the PDMM offices for any kind of updates or changes on their demographics as soon as possible.

Note: For TPs, any change to the information that was provided when first entering the country has to be proved. Example; if a marriage was stated at first then if a divorce is being claimed after the marriage certificate may be asked. If married at first then declared as single afterwards, then the second claim cannot be considered unless proved.

## 5. Any Other Businesses:

- 2018 Performance Survey: Its main findings were shared reminding participants that the **full survey will be circulated end of April**. The initial findings and recommendations are as follows:
  - ✓ 38 ESSN TF regular meetings (in four locations) were held throughout 2018.
  - ✓ 99 members out of 528 completed the survey (19%).
  - ✓ 79% appreciate the relevancy of the agendas.
  - ✓ 76% stated the language and venue of the meetings were the least appreciated elements.
  - ✓ 86,7% said they were overall satisfied with the Task Force.
  - ✓ Most of the ESSN TF members (mainly in Gaziantep & Istanbul) suggested **more case study discussions** such as success stories, FGD contents, refugees invitation etc.
  - ✓ All partners would like **to be more engaged in providing inputs into the meetings agendas** and have more time for discussion.
  - ✓ In Gaziantep and Istanbul specifically, ESSN TF members suggest **more education-based** topics and analysis, particularly related to CCTE Programme.
  - ✓ **Protection, livelihood and health issues** to be linked to the meetings.
  - ✓ Guidance on referrals & updates on focal points.
  - ✓ Improvement on meeting venue and translations.
  - ✓ Request for more meetings (monthly).
- **Meeting and presentation Language Preference:**  
Participants were asked again if they would like to consider changing the language of the presentation (Eng to Tur), it was agreed that the current format (Eng language) is to remain as it the preferred option.

In relation to one of the recommendations above – more engagement to the agendas from the participants- participants have been kindly asked to share any ideas/suggestions of items they would like to be treated at the next ESSN TFs.

- **Case Study Report:**  
Co-chairs stated that the case study report is ready, only awaiting or one confirmation by one of the NGO who provided inputs. The report will be circulated by the end of April.

Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed related to coordination and the ESSN TF with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:

- **WFP:** Arzum Karasu email: [arzum.karasu@wfp.com](mailto:arzum.karasu@wfp.com)
- **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban email: [faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr](mailto:faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr)  
Hanifi Kinaci email: [hanifi.kinaci@kizilay.org.tr](mailto:hanifi.kinaci@kizilay.org.tr)

For any programmatic issues, please refer your queries to the following Programme related focal points:

- **WFP:** Digidem Aktaran email: [digidem.aktaran@wfp.org.com](mailto:digidem.aktaran@wfp.org.com)  
Gulfem Kaya email: [gulfem.kaya@wfp.org](mailto:gulfem.kaya@wfp.org)
- **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban email: [faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr](mailto:faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr)

**Next Meeting:** The next meeting will be held on 7 June 2019 (TBC). The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

## **Attachments:**

1. ESSN Task Force Izmir Presentation
2. 2018 Performance Survey initial highlights
3. CCTE presentation