



Inter-Agency
Coordination
Turkey



Joint 3RP Basic Needs Sector and Livelihoods Sector Meeting Minutes

Agenda

1. Welcome
2. Introduction
 - 2019 Sector Priorities, Sector in Numbers & Current Situation
3. Presentations: Recent Assessments & Surveys
 - a) Participatory Assessment Findings
 - b) Livelihoods Survey - Highlights
 - c) Livelihoods Assessments:
 - Mapping of Syrian Owned Enterprises in Turkey
 - Survey Findings on the **Perception of Private Sector Engagement** into the Syria Crisis Response in Turkey
 - d) Profiling
4. Presentation: Ongoing Mapping of Active Labour Market Activities
5. Exit Strategy from the ESSN Program
 - a) Presentation of Exit Strategy
 - b) Q & A Session
6. Next Steps

Date & Time:

March 20th 2019
13.30 - 17.00

Venue:

Yildiz Kule, Ankara

Meeting Co-Charis:

Özlem Çavuş
Ahmet Unver
Line Rindebaek

Livelihoods Sector Coordinator
Assoc Inter-Agency Coord. Officer
Head of Coordination

UNDP
UNHCR
UNWFP

1. Introduction:

Meeting Co-Chair welcomed presenters and participants, and introduced the respected colleagues of the Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Services (MoFLSS).¹

It was noted that the joint Basic Needs (BN) Sector Working Group and Livelihoods Sector (LH) Working Group session was aimed taking stock of ongoing and joint sectoral activities, which will support the transition and referral process going forward.

2019 Sector Priorities, Sector in Numbers & Current Situation

The co-chairs provided a brief overview of their respective sector priorities, 2018 and 2019 figures/targets as well as of the need for and challenges related to the transition process:

¹ Please refer to the full PPT here: https://www.dropbox.com/s/73mtrbgnuvojslr/2019_0320_JointBN_LHSession_PPT.pdf?dl=0

- Basic needs and livelihoods sectors will work closely to support transition process and help increase self-reliance. Jointly with other sectors such as PRT, FSA.
- Basic needs sector has supported more than 1,96 million beneficiaries with cash-based interventions in 2018.
- During 2019, fourteen organisations have appealed under BN. The sector aims to target more than 2,1 million with cash-based interventions, in addition to supporting municipalities with services and 31 municipalities with infrastructure.
- During 2018, Livelihoods sector have increased income for 2,159 beneficiaries, and have supported 1,264 beneficiaries to start businesses.
- During 2019, Livelihoods sector aims to target up to 81,370 beneficiaries in language trainings and 48,045 beneficiaries in increasing the access to income and employment opportunities.
- The main reasons for the need to transition from Basic Needs to Livelihoods include the following:
 - The high (and unsustainable) social protection policy expenditure
 - The instability of the basic needs assistance
 - The need to increase social cohesion
 - The significant number of beneficiaries in the informal sector
 - The need to increase self-reliance
- The main challenges of the transition fall under multiple factors such as economic challenges, language barriers, high rates of unemployment, lack of job creation opportunities, lack of information on education and experience background of Syrians, gender specific challenges, cultural barriers against working/seeking support, AtC (Alternatives to Camps)-challenges in integrating to urban context.

2. Recent Assessments & Surveys

Five **different areas of assessments, surveys** and analyses, that all relate to and supports the transition process, were presented by colleagues from UNHCR, Turkish Red Crescent (TRC), WFP and UNDP:

a. Participatory Assessment Findings [UNHCR]²

- The Assessment was carried out through forty-seven FGD sessions conducted in eight cities. Respondents were 52% Males, 43% Females and 5% LGBTI among five nationalities (Syrian, Afghani, Iranian, Somalian and Iraqi).
- Findings from FGD showed that refugees defined legal, administrative, economic and social barriers. Social were flagged as the most significant barrier to refugees, which included issues such as language barrier, discrimination, fear of exploitation and harassment at workplace etc.
- Participants had many barriers against access to self-employment and formal employment that varied between legal, administrative and economic ones.
- FGD brought out several solution proposals such as continuing advocacy with government for flexible procedures, advocacy with private sector, entrepreneurs for more job opportunities for refugees, more support/training for entrepreneurship and self-employment, promotion of child-care facilities at courses/workplaces for single parents/women, monitoring and advocacy for safe/secure working environments for vulnerable groups, and awareness-raising on importance of education for parents with working children.

b. Livelihoods Survey – Highlights [WFP/TK]

- WFP and TK, through the TK Call Centre interviewed 5,332 respondents from ESSN applicant households across 19 provinces grouped into three regions between June and November of 2018. The selection was based on random sampling and included Syrians (95,7%), Iraqis (3,7%), Iranians and Afghans. The purpose

² Please refer to further findings of the analysis:

<https://app.powerbi.com/view?r=eyJrIjoizTUwMTk4NzUtNGU4Yy00YTg5LWJlYzEtNmU2NmVjMDNjY2U2liwidCI6ImU1YzM3OTgxLTY2NjQ tNDEzNC04YTBjLTU1NDNkMmFmODBiZSIsImMiOiJh9>

was to understand the situation of the ESSN applicants and the trends when it comes to labour market integration.

- Major Findings:
 - Survey showed that South-East of Turkey has the largest proportion of illiterate beneficiaries and the largest proportion of beneficiaries with high school and/or university degree.
 - There is a correlation between age and employability: Younger age groups are less unemployed when compared to other age groups.
 - Language remains the primary barrier to employment as advanced Turkish language skills are linked to higher rates of employment with younger individuals.
 - The average salary in the Western provinces is 40% higher than in the Southern provinces.

c. Livelihoods Assessment [UNDP]

- The assessment was on **Mapping of Syrian Owned Enterprises**. Its main objective was to understand the challenges that Syrian owned enterprises encounter, to develop strategies to increase their job creation potentials and to better support Syrian owned enterprises.
- **A Private Sector Survey** was carried as well; including an online Survey and printed versions which were disseminated through Chambers including membership database, network of Türkonfed, social media, business associations, sectoral associations. It has also contained bilateral meetings and FDGs in Istanbul, Ankara, Konya and Gaziantep. With a total of 288 companies completing the online survey in 27 provinces. Some of the survey findings on the *Perception of Private Sector Engagement* into the Syria Crisis Response in Turkey are follows:
 - Only 16% of the enterprises stated that they did not want to take any initiative for immigrants/Syrians, mostly located in Hatay, Izmir and Ankara.
 - Only 3,4% of the enterprises have Syrian business partners and only 3,7% of the Syrian companies have Turkish partners.
 - 24% of the enterprises had employed a Syrian and 54% of the surveyed enterprises have employed or are planning to employ Syrian workers.
 - Only 40% of the enterprises received work permits for Syrians. Furniture sector and Hatay shows the worst tendency in terms of getting work permit.
 - The most important issue for those enterprises that have not yet employed Syrians but have the idea of employing is their qualifications. Language skills, past experiences and educational level is next with a very small difference. Their references and certificates are of less importance.
 - Main motivation for new potential employers is the access to Arabic speaking countries but they are considering hiring Syrians as technicians, blue-collar workers or administrative staff.
 - 37% of the surveyed enterprises do not want to employ Syrians.
- **Profiling**
 - 96,7% of the interviewees were male starting their first investment in Turkey.
 - 300 Syrian owned enterprises employ 2,766 people in total with average of 271 out of 326 women employees and out of 2440 men employees

4. Vulnerability Profiling [WFP]³

- The Vulnerability Profiling analysis was conducted by WFP HQ VAM experts in summer 2018 and relies on ESSN data, including Pre-Assistance Baseline, Post-Distribution Monitoring and Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Exercise.
- The objective of this analysis was to provide a stronger evidence base as the ESSN starts to transition towards more sustainable solutions, with links to the livelihoods sector. It shows the breakdown of ESSN beneficiary households by vulnerability and capacity classifications:
- The Vulnerability classification covers these three dimensions:
 - Food Consumption and dietary diversity

³ The full profiling report is available online:

<https://www.wfp.org/content/turkey-emergency-social-safety-net-programme-vulnerability-profiling-2018-analysis-results>

- High risk coping strategies
- Economic vulnerability
- The capacity classification covers these three dimensions:
 - Able-bodied working age men
 - Household member with high school degree (single care taker household exempted)
 - Among the vulnerable households' capacity was classified as 15% have no/little capacity, 45% have limited capacity and 40% have higher capacity.
- Moving forward, the profiling exercise will be updated, to ensure it can become operational within ESSN3. The actual criteria to be used will depend on which data is available on all ESSN beneficiaries. Referrals to trainings or employment will depend on which jobs/trainings etc are available within each location. This is the main reason behind the ongoing livelihoods mapping exercise.

5. Ongoing Mapping of Livelihoods Opportunities [WFP]

- 1,545,674 people are receiving unconditional ESSN cash assistance (as of Feb 2019). Initial strategy of the Turkish government focuses on one person from each HH to enter the active labour market programmes (ALMPs) which sums up to 167,402 ESSN beneficiaries.
- The mapping of livelihoods activities is being undertaken jointly by WFP and LH Sector to understand the livelihoods opportunities that are in place, which are being implemented by national, international and local stakeholders. And to have a comprehensive mapping of the current activities to support future referrals of individuals.
A Livelihoods TWG (UNDP, WFP, UNHCR coordination & technical teams) have developed a questionnaire (<https://ee.humanitarianresponse.info/x/#pG7HVYNx>), which will be used by WFP field teams from April onward and by UNDP covering 3RP partners to map opportunities.
- UNHCR's Services Advisor Platform will be utilized to upload the collected data online.

Next Steps for Mapping Exercise:

- WFP will collect the data country-wide in April and May, then data will be uploaded on the UNHCR Services Advisor platform. Services Advisor and the maps are envisaged to be utilized as a live referral tool for the ESSN transition.
- WFP/TRC will continue to closely coordinate with MoFLSS on ESSN transition.
- UNDP will use the questionnaire to collect 3RP partner inputs.
- Follow up LHTWG technical discussions on defining the referral mechanisms – with relevant WGs.

6. Exit Strategy from the ESSN Program⁴

a. Presentation of Exit Strategy

- The purpose of the exit strategy material is to provide guidance to the international institutions in their response to the program for the FRIT II program, to create a balance between conditions of social assistance and formal employment for Syrians under Temporary Protection, to decrease the dependence of the Syrians under Temporary Protection on social assistance and to better direct Syrians under Temporary Protection to labor market in a formal way with better skills and competences.
- The importance of graduation is highlighted under difficulties in the supply side, the demand side, the challenges with national budget, labour market access and social cohesion.
- Main objectives of accessing livelihoods opportunities relies in the following:
 - Supporting the graduation from ESSN and adaptation to the labour market of Syrians under Temporary Protection
 - Special emphasis on the disadvantaged population of children and women
 - Ensuring and increasing the formal employment and job creation opportunities (in both agriculture and industry sector) including social security incentives.

⁴ Please refer to the Exit Strategy from the ESSN Program through MoFLSS: <https://ailevecalisma.gov.tr/media/3725/essn-exit-strategy-1.pdf>

- Improvement of the labour market cohesion for Syrians under Temporary Protection and Turkish citizens.
- There is also a need of harmonization of labour policy and practices, including data sharing and evaluation system besides coordination of institutions.
- The following measures are to be taken into consideration in FRIT II:
 - Arranging informative meetings on international labour policies and practices.
 - Integration of inter-agency information systems for the labour market (DGSA, İŞKUR, SSI, DGMM, MoH).
 - Establishment of accommodation facilities for Syrians under Temporary Protection and Turkish citizens working as temporary/ seasonal agricultural workers.
 - Providing occupational health and safety training in agriculture and construction sectors.
 - Providing Professional Qualification Certificates for Syrians under Temporary Protection.
 - Social cohesion of Turkish citizens and Syrians under Temporary Protection will be supported.
- Priority areas and activates to be supported in project proposals such as adaptation to labour market, language education, development of skills, job creation opportunities, prevention of child labour and supporting formal employment.

b. Q & A Session

- **Guideline rather than Strategy:**
 - MoFLSS (DG of International Labour Force) highlighted that the “exit strategy” should be seen more as a guideline.
- **Emphasis on Graduation:**
 - MoFLSS (DG of Social Assistance): emphasis should be on “*graduation* strategy” rather than on “exit strategy” given the budgetary implications. It is too early to put an actual exit strategy in place and rather referred to ‘starting the transition’ due to the expected budget impact.
 - The estimated amount for 2,000 vulnerable Syrians that will continue to receive aid is at least 500 mil TRY/ year and there is no agreement in place with the responsible authority of national budget, SBO, for such a budget.
 - A clearer picture expected after implementation of ESSN 3.
 - There will be a connection between social assistance and employment; however, social assistance will not be stopped rapidly.
- **Timeline for Graduation:**
 - Time frame for the transition process will be clearer after June 2019.
 - Awaiting to results of FRIT II and remain realistic;
 - If all FRIT II projects are synergized (and in line with “exit strategy” guidelines), the expectation is to graduate around 167,000 people over 3 to 4 years.
- **Future Planning / FRIT II:**
 - SSI (SGK) awaiting FRIT II to have more clarity on what job creation activities will take place.
 - İSKUR and MoFLSS (DG of International Labour Force) highlighted that the modality is to be clarified only after FRIT II is clear (after June 2019).
- **Data & Referrals:**
 - MoFLSS (DG of International Labour Force): Regarding data required to support referrals, DGMM will share this (e.g. the labour age population) with MoFLSS and it will be analysed.
 - After FRIT II is developed, vocational counselling and referrals can be done according to skills/ competencies.
- **Awareness on Work Permits**
 - MoFLSS is supporting job creation projects and capacity building activities for the Syrians under Temporary Protection through the provision of work permits, which develops formal employment and protects social security rights.

- MoFLSS (DG of International Labour Force) emphasized the need to raise awareness of and willingness to apply for work permits
- Government initiated campaign for employment “istihdam seferberligi” → no nationality restrictions
- **Gender:** Women’s access to economic opportunities is part of MoFLSS strategy.
- **Methodology:** A total of 167,000 eligible to work is based on a joined survey with TRC through their call centre then results were cross-checked with numbers collected through a different methodology. This number was also generated by grading provided capacities as *high, moderate and low* and then calculating contribution of one person per household to the labour market. The methodology was to target all with focus on one per household.
- **Social Cohesion / Informal Employment:** Social cohesion is harder to achieve when beneficiaries are entitled to have free health care and education additional to other facilities, whereas Turkish people have to contribute to social security system. When people work informally, they do not contribute to the social security system.
- **Employment vs Safety:** The Ministry is working to insure safety measures are included in IO proposals if needed – and have done this already with proposals that were missing certain safety outputs, specifically for construction and agriculture focused proposals.

7. Next Steps:

- The Co-Chairs closed the meeting thanking the MoFLSS, SSI and ISKUR and briefly outlined the next steps:
- The Sectors will continue to support the Government on exit strategy.
- There will be follow up “Livelihoods TWG” meetings (BNWG-LHWG coordination & technical teams) to support the ongoing work on mapping and to discussed referral related matters.
- The BN and LH WGs will continue to work with relevant Sectors.
- A follow up joint Basic Needs-Livelihoods meeting(s) in June/July (e.g. referrals) is expected once there is clarity on FRIT II.

Related links:

- Full presentation of the meeting
https://www.dropbox.com/s/73mtrbgnuvojslr/2019_0320_JointBN_LHSession_PPT.pdf?dl=0
- Sector Dashboards and other related IM products are available at Operational Portal
<https://data2.unhcr.org>
- UNHCR PA Analysis and Findings Page
<https://app.powerbi.com/view?r=eyJrIjoizTUwMTk4NzUtNGU4Yy00YTg5LWJlYzEtNmU2NmVjMDNjY2U2IiwidCI6ImU1YzYzM3OTgxLTY2NjQtNDEzNC04YTJlY1NDNkMmFmODBiZSIsImMiOjh9>
- WFP full profiling report
<https://www.wfp.org/content/turkey-emergency-social-safety-net-programme-vulnerability-profiling-2018-analysis-results>
- MoFLSS Exit Strategy from the ESSN Program
<https://ailevecalisma.gov.tr/media/3725/essn-exit-strategy-1.pdf>
- Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) Vulnerability Profiling 2018- Analysis Results Report
<https://www.wfp.org/content/turkey-emergency-social-safety-net-programme-vulnerability-profiling-2018-analysis-results>