

## ESSN Task Force Istanbul Minutes

### Agenda

1. Welcome and Introduction
2. Action points from the previous meeting
3. Updates on ESSN and its implementation in Marmara region
4. Updates on the CCTE
5. ESSN Market Bulletin for the first quarter of 2019
6. AOB

### Date of meeting

11 June 2019  
09:30 - 11:00

### Location

Altunizade Mh., Kuşbakışı Cd., No: 4, Rainbow Plaza, B2 Blok,  
1. Kat – Üsküdar/İstanbul

### Meeting

WFP: Arzum Karasu

### Co-Chairs

TK: Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban

### 1. Action points:

No action point for the future meeting.

### 2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turk Kizilay (TK) provided an update of the ESSN updates noting that as of 28 May 2019, a total of 2,667,841 individuals were registered; 8,609 individuals were not assessed, and 998,333 individuals were ineligible.
- 1,660,899 beneficiaries in total received ESSN assistance in May.
- 222,724 beneficiaries in Istanbul received ESSN assistance.

### TK-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:

- Monitoring visits were conducted in Bilecik, Bursa, Istanbul, Kocaeli and Tekirdag where institutions like PDMM, DDPC (NÜFUS), SASFs, Halkbank branches and Hospitals were visited.
- During those M&E activities:
  - TK conducted beneficiary verification visits in Bursa and randomly selected 45 HHs as an exercise to verify the validity of its database.
  - SDA (SASF Discretionary Allowance) implementation at the SASFs was monitored.
  - In April, about 90 HHs in Istanbul and Bursa were visited to monitor and evaluate the practice of SASF Allowance onsite.
  - **Main Findings:**
    - Some of the visited SASFs and DDPCs reported that many Turkish speaking children of foreign families are of great assistance in breaking the language barrier.
    - Many SASFs stated that they do provide additional assistance using their own budgets, helping families with travel and medical expenses.
    - Many SASFs reported that there are families who still attempt to add/subtract family members from their HHs to fit within ESSN's demographic criteria.

**Q:** How did the SASFs become aware of such cases?

**A:** SASFs were aware of such attempts based on their experience with many past cases, the information they gather from the neighborhood during their beneficiary HH verification visits and households' "more than usual/frequent" requests to add or subtract family members or adjust some other demographic information into the system.

## Updates on the MUV project:

- The Mutfakta Umut Var (MUV) is a WFP livelihoods pilot project funded by the Republic of Korea to improve the employability of vulnerable Syrians while enhancing social cohesion between host and refugee communities.
- The target population is vulnerable Syrians under Temporary Protection (SuTP) and Turkish citizens aged 18 to 45 and who are interested in being trained to work in the local hospitality and food sector.
- The project consists of vocational training as a cook apprentice followed by on-the-job training in partner restaurants and hotels, in addition to employment support activities to facilitate participants' transition towards formal employment.
- If the participants attend more than 80% of the classes, they receive a monthly 1000TL stipend.
- The roles of WFP's implementing partners were explained in detail: while TK is leading the outreach process, cash-based transfers and vocational training components, WALD oversees the on-the-job training. All partners collaborate for the selection of participants, outreach as well as in the organization of social cohesion/culinary arts events.
- MUV is currently implemented in Bagcilar (Istanbul) and Altindag (Ankara) for 120 participants.
- In Istanbul, classes are mixed in terms of gender and nationalities. In Ankara, there is one male and one female group.
- Percentage of women/men and TC/SuTPs - Numbers are not finalized for the second cohort but in both locations, there are more women from both nationalities and it is difficult to reach Turkish males. However, the percentage between Turkish citizens and SuTPs is close to 50% (for the first cohort: 54% SuTP and 46% TC).

## 3. Updates on the CCTE:

### Cash Component:

- UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor provided an update noting that **404,610** beneficiaries were entitled to CCTE payment in March 2019. **201,315** Kizilay cards were uploaded with March 2019 payment. **1,571,344** Turkish beneficiaries received March 2019 payment in the national CCTE programme.
- As of May 2019, the number of children reached with at least one CCTE payment has become **511,453** and the number of Kizilay cards uploaded are **247,753**.
- In Istanbul, the total number of children reached as of May 2019 is **71,541**. Out of these children, **65.5%** are in Primary School, **27.1%** are in Middle School. Gender distribution is equal and the top five districts with the highest number of beneficiary children in Istanbul are Esenyurt, Bağcılar, Sultangazi, Küçükçekmece and Esenler.
- As of 27 May, a number of CCTE applications accepted from ALP students is **431** in Istanbul, Izmir and Bursa.

### Third Party Monitoring (TPM) for CCTE – 1st Wave.

- TPM 1st wave findings were shared with the participants. A total of **1,902** households have been surveyed during the first wave of the TPM. More information can be found in the presentation. Some of the highlights from the findings are:
  - The average total income of the households is approximately **2000 TL** in Istanbul, higher than South East provinces surveyed.
  - Primary sources of income of CCTE beneficiary households are skilled labour (48%) and unskilled labour (**28%**), followed by ESSN (**13%**) and CCTE (**3%**) benefits.
  - Findings show that for the overall age range of 6-17 years more girls (**81,2%**) than boys (**76%**) are enrolled among the CCTE beneficiaries.
  - For the influence of CCTE on first time enrolment, **71,8%** of the families in Istanbul reported no influence but when the attendance practices are asked **89,6%** of the children attend regularly in Istanbul.

- One of the top reasons for irregular attendance is illness of the children (**36%**) but also children looking for a job or working (**20%**), followed by children doing household chores or taking care of relatives and siblings (**12%**).

## **Q & A on TPM:**

- Slide 12 (Reasons for Irregular School Attendance): One of the reasons stated for irregular attendance is “No transportation to school”. Does this mean there is no access, or transportation is costly?
  - It was found through the responses that the reason is mostly related to cost in Istanbul, for South East provinces it is mostly access related.
- Slide 11 (Attendance Practices of CTE Beneficiary Children): It is surprising to see attendance is higher in Istanbul compared to South East provinces. It was also mentioned previously (slide 6 Total Income of HHs) that the cost of living is higher in Istanbul. So, should it not affect children’s attendance?
  - The data from the first wave shows that attendance is higher in Istanbul. There are factors affecting attendance in SE as well. For instance, the time that the wave was conducted versus the time of the seasonal agriculture movements. This is also quantitative data. Evaluation of the qualitative data will be able to show us more details.
- Regarding information on Slide 10 (Influence of CTE on first time enrolment): Why is the CTE influence on enrolment so low?
  - Design of CTE program aims to improve the attendance of the children and not enrolment. Enrolment was checked to see if CTE has any influence on it. The attendance data on the next slide shows that the CTE has an influence on attendance. It is also important to remember that the enrolment is a prerequisite for CTE application.
- Slide 12 (Reasons for Irregular School Attendance): Is there a follow up on the children who continue school irregularly.
  - A component of the CTE Program for Refugees is Child Protection (CP). Families of the CTE beneficiary children who do not continue school regularly, as per the payment criteria, are visited by TK CTE CP teams (where available). Families are directed to services and children are followed-up upon to ensure continues education. TPM does not have a CP follow up mechanism but the children are already covered under the CP component of the CTE Program for Refugees. In addition, TPM HH visits were conducted with accompaniment from the officials of the Ministry of Family, Labour, and Social Services which allowed them to note and follow up on the sensitive cases.

## **Cash Transfer**

- Question was asked regarding the difference in the number of beneficiaries paid from March to May 2019.
  - UNICEF, TK and the MoFLSS are investigating the reasons for the difference and the TF participants will be informed when determined.

## **Child Protection Component:**

- Starting from March of 2019, ALP students have been prioritized in CTE house visits.
- As of April 30<sup>th</sup>:
  - 64,883 children were screened by outreach teams.
  - 12,369 children were identified and assessed with protection needs.
  - 6, 120 children were referred to specialized services.
- In March-April period, Istanbul child protection teams screened 766 children. 37 of them were identified with high-risk level while 511 of them had no risk level. 414 of screened children were boys and 352 of them were girls.
- When we look at their age-based disaggregation; mostly children aged between 10-13 years were screened followed by those between 14-17 years.
- A question was asked regarding the expansion of the TK CTE CP component in other provinces. A new community center will be opening in Kocaeli, however, this does not include an opening of a CP office.

- A question was asked regarding where the families who cannot register their children to school be referred to. If there is a TK community center in a province, such cases are referred to Provincial Directorate of National Education. Otherwise, it is referred to the MoNE through TRC HQ Office in Ankara.
- Further comment was made stating families are scared to go to the Community Centres with fears of being reprimanded for illegal work. Work without a legal permit is not reported to the authorities unless it involves criminal offenses such as human trafficking etc.

#### 4. ESSN Market Bulletin for Q1 2019

##### **Highlights:**

- The Turkish economy has contracted, particularly in the sectors that the refugees are employed, namely construction and manufacturing.
- With the formal unemployment rate reaching to 14.7%, the possible job competition between the Turkish and refugee communities in the informal market is highly likely and can lead to social tension.
- The annual inflation rate is still high (18.71% as of May 2019); the prices continue to increase after some decrease in Q4 2018. The refugees increasingly resort to more coping strategies since mid-2018, might be attributed to reduced income along with the inflation. Please see attached report for a thorough analysis.

#### 5. Any Other Businesses:

- Participants have been informed that future meetings will dedicate a 10 mn presentation to one participant NGO per meeting for them to present their work within the scope of the ESSN program. More information will be provided ahead of the meeting.
- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:
  - **WFP:** Arzum Karasu: [arzum.karasu@wfp.com](mailto:arzum.karasu@wfp.com)
  - **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban: [faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr](mailto:faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr)
- For any programmatic issues, please refer your queries to the following Programme related focal points:
  - **WFP:**
    - Abdullah Alani: [abdullah.alani@wfp.org](mailto:abdullah.alani@wfp.org)
    - Verda Yuceer: [verda.yuceer@wfp.org.com](mailto:verda.yuceer@wfp.org.com)
  - **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban: [faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr](mailto:faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr)

**Next Meeting:** The next meeting will be held in August (TBC). The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

#### Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Istanbul Presentation
2. CCTE Presentation
3. ESSN Market Bulletin Q1 2019