**Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group**

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

Gaziantep

**28 June 2016**

Chaired by: WFP, UNHCR and CARE

Hosted by: WFP

(A full list of attendees can be found at the end of this document)

Agenda:

1. Welcome and round the table introductions
2. Information Management Operational Updates, May 2016:
   1. Food Security & Basic Needs E-Voucher Distributions
   2. Percentage of Syrian beneficiaries assessed v. assisted
   3. Number of Syrian households with multiple family IDs
   4. Beneficiaries assisted by SADD & nationality breakdown
   5. Overview of e-voucher values
   6. Possible overlap alerts for planned/ongoing activities
   7. Food Price Monitoring Overview over the past four months
   8. ActivityInfo Updates – Question & Answer Session
3. Update on the CARE Recruitment Process of the Technical Consultant
4. Presentation on shop assessment/selection tools collected and analysed
5. Presentation on methodological approach to conducting the Multi-Sector Household Survey in Urfa and key findings
6. AOB – Agency Updates & Closing Remarks

|  |
| --- |
| **Summary of Action Points**   * **Action Point #1:** CBI-TWG partners to submit all inputs on [Beneficiary Accountability Approaches](https://www.dropbox.com/s/7vly5vohrol0xfz/Mapping%20of%20CBI%20Partners%27%20AAP%20approaches%20180516.docx?dl=0) by **COB 5 July.** * **Action Point #2:** Partners to provide comments on the [Outcome Monitoring Sections of the 4W Framework](https://www.dropbox.com/s/5gttl9bvzt9lkdr/May%202016%204W.xlsx?dl=0) and submit the completed matrix by **COB 5 July.** * **Action Point #3:** Partners **by COB 15 July** to provide support to the CARE Cash Consultant as per [Section 2 of the Consultant ToRs](https://www.dropbox.com/s/cs0txj87zhm1383/ToR%20for%20CBI%20TWG%20Cash%20Consultant_SMc.docx?dl=0) by uploading their data into the relevant sections of this [drop-box folder](https://www.dropbox.com/sh/57meprvcpvdtlku/AAANUHOR_Pdvw3TEkzLfNO5ka?dl=0) * **Action Point #4:** Partners to write to [Salah.Hamwi@care.org](mailto:Salah.Hamwi@care.org) if they have any field teams available in late July/early August to assist with any data collection that might need to be undertaken if gaps are identified by the CARE Consultant * **Action Point #5:** The following 15 partners to submit May and June 2016 inputs into Activity-Info by **COB 10 July**: DRC, PARCIC, UNICEF, World Vision, Mercy Corps, STL, NRC, TRC, IRC, ASAM, SSG, CARITAS, Khayr, FAO, Save the Children. * **Action Point #6:** All submissions into Activity-Info should take place by the **10th of every month,** to allow for sufficient time to produce the Inter-Sector Dashboards and prepare for the next meetings later in the month. * **Action Point #7:** The next [CaLP L2 Training](https://www.dropbox.com/s/txz7hjai155414l/CaLP%20Level%20II%20CTP%20in%20Emergencies%20Training%20Objectives.docx?dl=0) will take place from **1 to 5 August at Divan Hotel, Gaziantep.** Candidates to be notified regarding their selection status at the end of July. * **Action Point #8:** All partners interested in Protection Trainings are kindly requested to complete the [UNHCR Training form.](https://www.dropbox.com/s/6bd2ehxojamvb3e/Checklists%20for%20Training%20Requests.xls?dl=0) * **Action Point #9:** The next meeting will take place on **26 July** from 11:00 to 13:00 at UN House, Gaziantep. |

1. Welcome and round the table introductions

*Co-chairs introduction*

* The Co-Chairs noted that progress was made toward achieving two areas of the CBI-TWG work-plan related to information management and accountability to affected populations. The Testing Phase for ActivityInfo began in June and will run till the end of July. The following seven partners CARE, Concern, IOM, Support to Life, Syrian Social Gathering, WFP/TRC and Welthungerhilfe were especially thanked for submitting their inputs into ActivityInfo and for sharing their approaches on beneficiary accountability mechanisms.
* The Co-Chairs introduced the agenda items to be discussed stressing the importance of agreeing on monthly reporting requirements and data to be collected for cash-based interventions.
* Special thanks to WFP for hosting this meeting.

2. Information Management Operational Updates, May 2016

* The Co-Chairs clarified that progress was made in addressing the following action points noted from the previous meeting:
  + Mapping of current voucher values and future plans for increase, including logic/sectors of intervention
  + Mapping of % of unregistered refugees (both Syrian and non-Syrian) in operation areas
  + Information on non-Syrian refugee presence in operation areas
  + Mapping of % of households with multiple family ID numbers based on partner data.
* ***The following overview of IM progress to date was provided:***
* **Food Security & Basic Needs e-voucher distributions** 
  + The Coordination Officer noted that food security actors are active in 13 provinces and have reached a total of 334,460 Syrian beneficiaries with e-voucher distributions as of May 2016.
  + 8 Food Security actors submitted their operational data: CARE, Concern, IOM, Support to Life, Syrian Social Gathering, WFP/TRC and Welthungerhilfe.
  + It was noted that Basic Needs actors are active in 4 provinces (Sanliurfa, Gaziantep, Ankara, Killis) and have reached a total of 35,653 Syrian beneficiaries with e-voucher distributions as of May 2016.
  + 4 Basic Needs actors submitted their operational data: CARE, Concern, DRC, Relief International.
* **Percentage of Syrian beneficiaries assessed v. assisted** 
  + The Coordination Officer noted that partners in the last meeting had requested updates on the percentage of Syrian beneficiaries assessed compared to assisted. From the analysis collected, it appears that approximately 98% of the 335,982 individuals assessed received CBI assistance for food security, whereas approximately 99% of the 35,912 individuals assessed received CBI assistance for basic needs.
  + A few exceptions were introduced with regards to Hatay, Gaziantep and Killis as follows:
    - In Hatay – 92% of the beneficiaries assessed received assistance for food security
    - In Gaziantep – 75% of the beneficiaries assessed received assistance for basic needs
    - In Killis – 99% of the beneficiaries assessed received assistance for basic needs
* **Number of Syrian Households with Multiple Family IDs**
* WFP Program Officers noted that as part of an ECHO request to clarify this indicator, 1,100 ID records of Syrian families were scanned in three locations (Gaziantep, Kahramanmaras, Killis) to determine that 18% of the records (or 196 individuals) displayed duplications in Family ID numbers.
* **Beneficiaries assisted by SADD & nationality breakdown** 
  + Following ECHO’s request to provide greater gender and age information management analysis, the Coordinator noted that seven partners provided SADD (sex-and-age disaggregated data) for five provinces, highlighting that 2% more females than males receive assistance. The majority of Syrian beneficiaries assisted are between 5-17 years old, followed by individuals 18-59 years old. Marginal underassisted groups for food security and basi needs are therefore under 5 year olds and over 60 year olds.
  + The Coordinator also noted that the 3RP Mid-Year Review clarified that 300,000 non-Syrian refugees are now registered in Turkey.
  + Food Security and Basic Needs actors mostly assist Syrian refugees, with the exception of IOM which also assists 1,800 Iraqis, 2,000 Afghanis, 100 Iranians and 200 Palestinians in Turkey with food kitchens.
* **Overview of e-voucher values**
* A breakdown of voucher values provided by 14 implementing agencies for food security and basic needs was provided in Turkish Lira, per individual, per month.
* It was noted that NRC has the highest assistance value per individual (180TL) and will be implementing multi-purpose cash for Syrians in Ankara, staring August 2016.
* **Possible overlap alerts for planned/ongoing activities**
  + The WFP programming unit noted that there may be possible operational overlaps for 4,000 individuals served in Sehitkamil and Sahinbey districts of Gaziantep between TRC/WFP and Mercy Corps e-voucher interventions, starting July 2016.
  + Similarly other potential duplications of individuals assisted might occur in Hatay between WFP/TRC and Save the Children, starting in September 2016.
  + Welthungerhilfe, DRC and WFP/TRC may also face similar challenges in Killis City, with a possible overlap of interventions for 2,754 individuals.
* **Food Price Monitoring Overview over the past four months** 
  + The Coordinator introduced WFP food commodity price monitoring from the referential food basket from February to May 2016 from the following provinces: Adana, Adiyaman, Akcakale, Ceylanpinar, Harran, Islahiye, Karkamis, Malatya, Osmaniye, Viransehir, Gazianteo, Hatay (in and off-camp), Sanliurfa (in and off-camo), Killis (in and off-camp), K.Maras (in and off-camp).
  + It was noted that with very few exceptions, food prices remained stable over the course of the four months. Unskilled wage prices increased slightly as did the price of gasoline and kerosene.
  + On the other hand, prices of cucumbers, cheese, eggs and poultry decreseased slightly as did the overall average food basket price.
* **ActivityInfo Updates – Question and Answer Session** 
  + The Coordinator expressed special thanks to the following partners (CARE, Concern, IOM, Relief International, Welthungerhilfe, WFP) for having proactively inputed their operational data into ActivityInfo for both the CBI-TWG and Food Sexcurity Sector log-frames.
  + The following actors were reminded to kindly do so by **COB 10 July:** DRC, PARCIC, UNICEF, World Vision, Mercy Corps, STL, NRC, TRC, IRC, ASAM, SSG, CARITAS, Khayr, FAO, Save the Children.
  + It was also decided that all submissions into Activity-Info should take place by the **10th of every month,** to allow for sufficient time to produce the Inter-Sector Dashboards and prepare for the next meetings later in the month.
* ***The following points of concern were raised by partners, particularly NGOs:*** 
  + **Duplication in Family ID Numbers –** UNICEF was interested to know how WFP information on Syrian Family ID duplicates was collected and the WFP Quality Assurance Programme Assistant clarified that from 2015 to 2016 all beneficiary family IDs were scanned and scrutinized one-by-one to discern any duplications. It was noted that the purpose of this WFP exercise was to inform better programming and avoid future exclusion errors. Welthungerhilfe also requested further information on how WFP qualifies senior beneficiaries. WFP clarified that seniors are individuals who are over sixty years old.
  + **Price Monitoring –** UNICEF requested clarification as to why unskilled wage labor is also included as part of WFP’s price monitoring analysis. WFP noted that as part of ActivityInfo only food and basic needs commodity prices will be taken into account for the Food Security Sector and CBI-TWG.

3. Update on the CARE Recruitment Process of the Technical Consultant current

Chloe Day, CARE NGO Co-Chair noted that they will be recruiting a Cash Consultant on behalf of the the CBI-TWG who will be undertaking a more in depth analysis on the following data-points:

* + Referential basket information [“Basket”];
  + Commodity price data (food and non-food) from basic needs, food security and special needs fund programs [“price data”];
  + Household expenditure data (multi-sectoral) [“expenditure”];
  + Household income data [“income”];
  + Data relating to debt [“debt”];
  + Available livelihoods data/information [“livelihoods”];
  + Baseline/HH survey reports [“baseline” or “HH survey”];
  + PDM reports for cash/voucher programs (preferably covering different seasons) [“PDM”];
  + Data on current and planned cash-based programs in Turkey i.e. 4Ws data (to be provided by TWG Chairs);

Interviews for the CARE Cash Consultant will take place on 29 June by CARE and IOM, who will provide more technical inputs.

The purpose of the consultancy is to provide a stronger evidence-base to inform both ongoing and future cash programming and transfer values in our current operations but also for the onset of the ESSN by the end of September. The analysis generated from the Consultant will also be helpful in terms of planning complementary programming around the ESSN. Data requested will be cross-sectoral and not only limited to food and NFIs, but also incorporating data on transportation, medical and legal fees so as to inform not only the Basic Needs element of the ESSN but also any other top-up allowances that may be required throughout the course of the year.

The end product from this consultancy will be suggested sectoral MEBs and top-up allowances across Turkey, contextualized for different seasons and provinces where different actors are working as well as a broader overview of cash-programming nation-wide.

Partners were therefore kindly invited to share their data through the following dropbox file by **Friday 15 July**: ["Cash Transfer Consultancy”](https://www.dropbox.com/sh/57meprvcpvdtlku/AAANUHOR_Pdvw3TEkzLfNO5ka?dl=0) . In order to make it easier for the data to be sorted, partners were requested to title the documents in the following way:

***Agency name\_ data type\_location of data collection\_month(s) of data collection***

The data type is shown against each of the types above using []. So, for example:

**CARE\_price data\_Birecik-Sanliurfa\_May-June2016**

The Co-Chair clarified that the consultancy is really intended to help all partners make better informed decisions and therefore improve programme quality. Data collected in different seasons is also especially useful in terms of analyzing seasonal variations and contributing to more informed and context-specific programming.

Partners were also asked to think about whethere they will be able to make any field teams available in late July/early August to assist with any data collection that might need to be undertaken if gaps are identified. The Co-Chair stressed that we need to ensure we have data from the different parts of Turkey that TWG members are working in so that we can analyse any geographical trends. All partners who are willing to commit some time from their teams are kindly requested to send an email to Salah ([salah.hamwi@care.org)](mailto:salah.hamwi@care.org)) to provide further details on where the teams are working.

***Action Points:***

* Welthungerhilfe agreed to provide support and make their field teams available in late July/early August to assist with any data collection.
* ASAM, Mercy Corps and NRC, working in western Turkey also agreed to consider deploying their field teams.

4. Presentation on Shop Assessment/Selection Tools Collected & Analysed

* Alyson Murray, Mercy Corps introduced the work that has been conducted thus far on Activity 11 of the Work-Plan noting that significant efforts have been made to harmonize commodity price monitoring for food and NFIs. Partners noted that tea was not part of the referential food basket and yet is a key commodity for Syrians in Turkey.
* Over the course of March, April, May, Mercy Corps collected data from partners (WFP, Mercy Corps and CARE) on shop assessment selction tools and methodologies.
* CARE noted that they are already working with World Vision and PARCIC with STL to harmonize shop selection tools. Other factors to consider as part of shop selection criteria is quality and price of items, branding, and protection related issues (i.e. overcrowding and beneficiary treatment and feedback). Analysis from CARE’s complaints mechanisms (hotline, whattsup, phone, text) was explained.

***Action Points:***

* Partners who have agreements with financial service providers (i.e. Nargiz) can use them to submit all price monitoring data electronically, so as to save time.
* TRC agreed to provide an overview of the price monitoring database from the Turkish National Statistical Institute.

5. Presentation on methodological approach to consucting the Multi-Sector Household Survey in Urfa & Key Findings

* Salah Hamwi, CARE introduced their multi-sectoral household survey tool which was piloted in Birecik and Halfeti districts in Sanliurfa and provided a breakdown of average household incomes in both districts, % of income spent on food and NFIs, debt analysis, livelihood coping strategies, household dietary diversity, shelter and other sectoral analyses.
* A discussion on harmonizing key definitions was introduced (i.e. what qualifies a household unit and rent).

7. AOB – Agency Updates and Closing Remarks

* FAO conducted a scoping mission between May and June for  a proposed program titled Sustainable Agricultural Solutions Program (SASP).  The objective of the program is to improve livelihoods of both hosting communities and refugees through sustainable labor intensive interventions in the agriculture sector. The mission targeted Turkey, Lebanon and Jordan which are amongst the main countries hosting refugees. The mission involved meeting members of the FSWG mainly in Sanliurfa, government authorities, refugee communities, UN agencies and the South Eastern Anatolia Project. The proposed program will have three components, gardening/ increased food production for self-consumption, value chains/ increased income through better farmers profitability and productive public works/ increased income through employment.
* ASAM agreed to share their statistical overview of the impact of cash programming on beneficiaries pre and post distribution in South-Eastern Turkey at the next meeting.
* Welthungerhilfe will also share information on their PDMs.
* World Vision is planning assessments in Ankara, Urfa, Mersin and Istanbul and will present their findings shortly.
* Mercy Corps will start their assessment in Gaziantep by mid-July 2016.
* Partners agreed to focus on Pillar 2, Activity 18 of the Work-Plan at the next meeting, which focuses on Beneficiary Accountability Mechanisms.
* The next CaLP L2 Training will take place from 1 to 5 August at Divan Hotel, Gaziantep. All candidates will be notified regarding their selection status at the end of July.
* All partners interested in Protection Trainings are kindly requested to complete the UNHCR Training form.

*Next CBI TWG:* ***Thursday, 26 July 2016****, 11:00 am to 13:00 pm @ WFP, UN-House, Gaziantep.*

**ATTENDEES:**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Organization** | **Name** | **E-mail** | | **Title** |
| 1. ACTED | Veerle Schouten | Veerle.schouten@acted.org | | Project Development Manager |
| 1. ASAM | Rukiye Uysal | Rukiye.uysal@sgdd-asam.org | | Project Assistant |
| 1. ASAM | Tugce Atak | Tugce.atak@sgdd-asam.org | | Office Manager |
| 1. ASAM | Gamze Aslan | aslan.gamze@sgdd-asam.org | | Reporting Officer |
| 1. CARE | Salah Hamwi | Salah.hamwi@care.org | | Project Manager |
| 1. CARE | Chloe Day | Chloe.Day@care.org | | Program Manager |
| 1. Concern | Yasemin Sener | Yasemin.sener@concern.net | | Livelihoods Program Officer |
| 1. DRC | Paula Armstrong | Paula.armstrong@drc-turkey.org | | Livelihoods Coordinator |
| 1. FAO | Daniel Muenga | Daniel.muenga@fao.org | | Food Security Officer |
| 1. GOAL | Ervim Eraslan | eeraslan@tr.goal.ie | | Project Coordinator |
| 1. GOAL | Ayya Kutlu | nkutlu@tr.goal.ie | | Associate Coordinator |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Asma Dada |  | | IM Protection Officer |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Zeynel Gultekin |  | | IM & Protection Manager |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Alyson Murray |  | | Reporting Manager |
| 1. NRC | Osama Slo | Osama.slo@nrc.no | | Project Officer |
| 1. PARCIC | Yuki Onogi | Yuki.onogi@parcic.org | | Program Manager |
| 1. Relief International | Sarah Torbey | Sarah.torbey@ri.org | | Cash Program Manager |
| 1. Save the Children | Ghaith Dkmak | Ghaith.dkmak@savethechildren.org | | Senior MEAL Officer |
| 1. TRC | Zeynel Dogan | Zeynel.dgan@kizilay.org.tr | | Team Leader |
| 1. UNHCR | Selwa Abdulkadir | abdulkas@unhcr.org | | Program Officer |
| 1. UNICEF | Hakki Ersoy | hersoy@unicef.org | | Field Coordinator |
| 1. Welthungerhilfe | Jesco Weickert | Jesco.weickert@welthungerhilfe.de | | Head of Program |
| 1. WFP | Vanessa Bonsignore | Vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org | | Program Officer |
| 1. WFP | Ahmad Nached | Ahmad.nached@wfp.org | | Program Assistant |
| 1. WFP | Sayaka Maeda | Sayaka.maeda@wfp.org | | Program/Policy Officer (CBT) |
| 1. WFP | Esther Kabairewahito | esther.kabairewahito@wfp.org | | M&E/VAM Officer |
| 1. WFP | Seda Okem | Seda.okem@wfp.org | | Program Assistant |
| 1. World Vision | Ahmad Saoud | | Ahmad.saoud@wvi.org | Commodity Specialist |