

Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

31 January 2017

Gaziantep

Chaired by: WFP, UNHCR and CARE

Hosted by: WFP

(A full list of attendees can be found at the end of this document)

Agenda:

1. **Welcome and round the table introductions**
2. **Information Management Updates, December 2016**
3. **Progress on Activity 21 of the Work-Plan**
4. **Progress on Activity 13 of the Work-Plan**
5. **Overview of IOM's Post Distribution Monitoring findings for the e-card basic needs project in Hatay**
6. **Update on the ESSN Gap Analysis**
7. **AOB – Agency Updates & Closing Remarks**

Summary of Action Points

- **Action Point #1:** Partners to confirm whether they are interested in contributing to Activities 13 and 21 of the work-plan by COB 6 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org.
- **Action Point #2:** Partners interested in Activity 21 to submit the OCAT Tool spreadsheet with completed scoring sheets based on individual self-assessment by COB 17 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org.
- **Action Point #3:** Partners interested in Activity 13 of the Work-Plan to submit their agencies' inputs into the tool by COB 24 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org; Initial partner inputs will then be discussed in a Workshop session (date to be confirmed).
- **Action Point #4:** Partners to submit their final comments/inputs on the AAP Guidelines by COB 13 February.
- **Action Point #5:** Next CBI-TWG Meeting scheduled for **28 February 2017, 11:00 to 13:00 at UN House Gaziantep**, when CARE will also provide an update on the Learning Exchange Matrix.

1. Welcome and round the table introductions

Co-chairs introduction

- The Co-Chairs welcomed participants to the meeting, noting that the focus of the discussion would be on learnings from e-card post-distribution monitoring and moving forward with defined activities in the 2017 Work-Plan.
- Special thanks to UNHCR for hosting this meeting.
- Apologies noted from CARE (Salah Hamwi and Chloe Day) and UNHCR (Giuseppe Simeon) who were unable to attend the meeting.

2. **Information Management Updates, December 2016** *please see attached Presentation*

- Megan Walden, UNHCR provided information management updates for different sector-specific cash-based interventions (CBIs) as of December 2016. It was noted that 152,307 individuals were reached with CBIs for the food security, winterization and basic needs sector in eight south-eastern provinces.
 - Restricted e-vouchers for food assistance were provided off-camp to 500 individuals in South-Eastern Turkey by Welthungerhilfe.
 - 13,844 individuals were reached by partners with restricted e-vouchers for non-food items.
-

- Possible overlaps may take place in Hatay, Killis, Gaziantep and K.Maras between four partner agencies and it was therefore recommended that partners address this issue bilaterally with reference to geographic data at admin level 3 (mahalle level).

3. **Progress on Activity 21 of the Work-Plan** *please see attached Presentation and OCAT Tool*

- The Co-Chair introduced Activity 21 of the 2017 Work-Plan which states the need to look into agency capacity needs assessments, to review TWG member resources for capacity building on CBIs in country. This activity should be accomplished within the first quarter of 2017.
- The Cash Learning Partnership (CaLP) Organizational Capacity Assessment Tool (OCAT) was introduced as a very useful advocacy tool to accomplish this initial screening and mapping of partner agencies' resources and capacity to deliver on cash-based interventions based on program officers' initial self-assessment.
- The tool addresses the following four key areas: technical expertise, organizational systems and policies, leadership and resourcing, external engagement and provides defined criteria and indicators for each of these categories as well as a scoring sheet to gauge progress against the defined areas.
- The purpose of the tool is to self-assess cash/voucher delivery capacity midline and to evaluate CTP strategy and partner assessments. It does not however compare across organizations or add value as a standalone process.
- In terms of concrete outputs, the tool will enable capacity to be strengthened and opportunities for improvement will be identified. Practical recommendations and an action plan will also be promoted.
- **Action Points:**
 - ✓ Partners to confirm whether they are interested in contributing to this activity of the work-plan by COB 6 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org.
 - ✓ Partners interested in Activity 21 to submit the OCAT Tool spreadsheet with completed scoring sheets based on individual self-assessment by COB 17 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org.

4. **Progress on Activity 13 of the Work-Plan** *please see attached CaLP/UNHCR Protection Risks& Benefits Tool*

- The Co-Chair introduced Activity 13 of the 2017 Work-Plan highlighting the need to undertake a review of gender, protection and inclusion issues relating to CBI for refugees in Turkey and develop recommendations on improvements to CBI program design.
- The Co-Chair proceeded to introduce a UNHCR/CaLP tool produced on behalf of ECGO and partners (DRC, Oxfam, Save the Children, WFP, Global Protection Cluster, Women's Refugee Commission) as part of the ERC project in 2014-15.
- The purpose of the tool is to identify and assign context-specific weights/importance to protection risks and benefits in terms of safety and dignity, access, data protection, market impacts, people with specific needs and risks, social relations, fraud and diversion, and durable solutions/early recovery. Although the tool identifies these eight protection risk areas, it can be adjusted to also include more gender specific and inclusion issues related to CBI programming in Turkey.
- **Action Points:**
 - ✓ Partners to confirm whether they are interested in contributing to this activity of the work-plan by COB 6 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org.
 - ✓ Partners interested in Activity 13 of the Work-Plan to submit their agencies' inputs into the tool by COB 24 February by emailing vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org; Initial partner inputs will then be discussed in a Workshop session (date to be confirmed).

5. **Overview of IOM's Post Distribution Monitoring findings for the e-card basic needs project in Hatay** *please see attached Presentation*

- Abduaziz Diyab, IOM Cash Project Expert, provided an overview of their post-distribution monitoring findings for their e-card basic needs project in Hatay.

- **Issues raised by partners in the question and answer session:**
 - ✓ **Did the field teams ever encounter cases where the beneficiaries preferred to trade their e-cards for cash?** Not in this particular province, however IOM did see a few cases of beneficiaries selling their winterization cards online through social media tools in exchange for cash.
 - ✓ **Did the PDMs also consider host communities in addition to refugees?** Only refugees were involved in this particular PDM, however in other PDMs 7% of host communities were included in Belen district.
 - ✓ **Were there any surprises that came through from the PDM findings?** In terms of the target group, several community members were not aware of the beneficiary selection criteria and how they were selected into the e-card program. Greater communication efforts (i.e. via sms or community outreach) should be strengthened. Other surprises included dealing with community members in semi-rural areas who put pressure on local authorities to implement blanket assistance even if it meant decreasing the value amount.
 - ✓ **Are there any changes IOM would implement in future in terms of project design and implementation?** It would be advisable to finetune internal organizational procedures so as to render the process more efficient. There is currently a disconnect between HQ and mission level which may slow down the cash scale-up process. There therefore need to be greater internal synergies between program, finance and procurement units. In terms of program design, it would be advisable to improve the beneficiary selection process by establishing stable refugee committees also involving trusted community members (i.e. school teachers) to assist with the scoring.
 - ✓ **How are beneficiary complaints raised and addressed?** Complaints mechanisms (i.e. call centres) have been established and complaints are forwarded to different program units depending on thematic area.
 - ✓ **What is the extent to which PDM templates have been harmonized for CBIs in Turkey?** Has a mapping of PDMs with a mapping of different questions per thematic area been put into place? All partner agencies' PDM templates related to CBIs have been stored on the dropbox
 - ✓ **Has IOM taken steps to conduct more detailed analysis, considering breaking down questions related to beneficiary satisfaction and awareness, key challenges, or household level decision-making processes depending on household composition (female headed, disabled etc.)?** IOM is in the process of conducting further cross-tabulations and other statistical analyses to gauge differences in decision-making processes depending on different vulnerability factors.

6. Update on the ESN Gap Analysis

- UNHCR through the CBI-TWG (Cash-Based Interventions Technical Working Group) is undertaking an ESN Gap Analysis Exercise to identify the percentage of partner beneficiary caseloads who are not eligible for the ESN and to further define their different vulnerability profiles.
- 6 out of the planned 14 organizations have to date submitted their household-level anonymized datasets for analysis. Initial evidence shows the following:
 - ✓ NGO Agency 1 – 2,500 households – 44% eligible
 - ✓ NGO Agency 2 – 1,500 households – 54% eligible
 - ✓ UNHCR – 60,000 households – 37% eligible
- Evidence displays an average 38% inclusion rate from an initial analysis of 65,000 households.
- An initial report will be produced by mid-February. Further analysis of livelihood coping strategy trends will be conducted at a later stage and further findings disseminated in March 2017.
- **Action Points:**
 - ✓ Partner agencies to continue submitting their anonymized household level datasets to Giuseppe Simeon, UNHCR at simeon@unhcr.org and to email him for further information on the exercise.

7. AOB – Agency Updates and Closing Remarks

- The Draft Accountability to Affected Population Guidelines developed by the AAP Task

Force involving the following five agencies: WFP, NRC, IOM, CARE, Concern will be disseminated shortly for final feedback. This piece of work was undertaken as part of Activity 18 of the 2016 Work-Plan: To Review existing accountability approaches and mechanisms and develop minimum standards/guidelines for accountability in CBI.

- CARE to present Learning Exchange Meeting at the next meeting.
- Further activities to be accomplished in the first quarter of 2017 as per the agreed Work-Plan are the following:
 - ✓ Activity 15 – Adapt existing modality decision trees for use in the Turkish context;
 - ✓ Activity 17 – Review existing price monitoring/tracking tools and methodologies and seek opportunities for harmonization.
- *Next CBI TWG: Tuesday, 28 February 2017 11:00 am to 13:00pm@UN House, GZT.*

PARTICIPANTS:

Agency	Name	Title
1. ASAM	Emre İlker Cece	South East Regional Coordinator
2. CaLP Cash Learning Partnership	Jacqueline Frize	CaLP Middle East Regional Representative
3. DRC	Paula Armstrong	Program
4. FAO	Attilio Rizzoni	Senior Agronomist
5. Global Communities	Rola Hbeichi	Program
6. Global Communities	Emily Galloway	Child Protection Manager
7. GOAL	Ayya Kutlu	Associate Coordinator
8. HANDICAP INTERNATIONAL	Tom Palmer	Inclusion Unit Coordinator
9. HANDICAP INTERNATIONAL	Sawsan Klieb	Inclusion Manager
10. iMMAP	Alexander Reigber	IMO
11. IMPR	Ahmad Albouchi Adi	Outreach Officer
12. IMPR	Rasna Aliwi	CC Officer
13. IOM	Yusuf Ali	Program
14. IOM	Abduaziz Diyab	Cash Project Expert
15. KHAYR	Mohammad Eid	Program
16. SAVE THE CHILDREN	MhD Wassim Ghazal	Community Outreach Officer
17. Support to Life	Ezgi KIRIS	Program
18. UNHCR	Elena Del Fabbro	Inter-Sector WG Coordinator
19. UNHCR	Emilie Chazelle	Social Protection Officer
20. UNHCR	Megan Walden	Information Management Officer
21. WATAN	Mohammad Najem	Program Manager
22. WELTHUNGERHILFE	Obada Kahil	Project Officer
23. WELTHUNGERHILFE	Ilke Mucuk	Project Assistant
24. WFP	Dina Morad	Basic Needs Coordination
25. WFP	Vanessa Bonsignore	Program- Coordination

