

ESSN Task Force Istanbul Minutes

Objective ■ Provide an update on the ESSN, presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings, and AOB.

Date of meeting 14 May 2018
10:30 - 12:00

Location WALD Office Binbirdirek Mah. Piyer Loti Cad. Arif Paşa Konağı No:2 34122 Sultanahmet / Fatih İstanbul

1. Action points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Deadline:
Detailed information on the HH verification numbers.	TRC/WFP	Next ESSN TF Meeting

2. Update of ESSN (WFP/TRC):

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update of the ESSN to date noting that as of 7 May, a total of 436,484 applications were registered; 2,651 applications were not assessed; 234,019 applications were deemed eligible and 199,814 applications were ineligible. Approximately, 38.00% of the applications were registered by 9 TRC Service Centres. A total of 1,301,933 beneficiaries received ESSN assistance in April (51.30% female/48.70% male). A potential decrease is expected within the upcoming months as a result of the verification process.
- Inclusion rate is 53%. Average household size is 5.83. It is noted as stable compare to last month.
- On 9 April, 1362 accounts were swept back: 1154 uncollected cards (3+ months) and 208 dormant accounts (6+ months). Please note that the accounts are only suspended; it can be reinitiated again.
- The information is for further dissemination that as of April 2018, the beneficiaries can use their Kizilaykarts without commission fee at all Ziraatbank and Vakifbank ATMs.
- In Marmara Region, majority of the applications are from Istanbul, Bursa and Kocaeli. Top 5 most applied districts in Istanbul are Esenyurt, Bagcilar, Kucukcekmece, Esenler and Sultangazi. Top 3 most applied districts in Marmara region are Yildirim/Bursa, Esenyurt and Bagcilar from Istanbul. Edirne, Kirklareli and Canakkale have the least percentage of DGMM registered Syrians applied for ESSN due to their special geographical locations and circumstances.
- Based on the information provided by WFP & TRC Istanbul Area offices (IAO):
 - Both WFP and TRC IAOs cover the same 12 provinces. Estimated number of refugees: 803,004 TPs and 62,853 IPs.
 - 127 CVME surveys were conducted in 5 provinces (Bursa, Canakkale, Istanbul, Yalova, Kutahya), covering 7 districts.
 - In April, four Focus Group Discussions (FGD) conducted in 2 provinces: Two in Yalova and two in Istanbul. WFP IAO shared a summary of the FGDs under the theme of Food. Some of the findings are: 1) HHs spend between 400 TL and 900 TL on food in average depending on the size of the family; 200 TL per capita for small families and 150 TL per capita for larger families. 2) The HHs follow a more diversified food diet in Ramadan. 3) The quality of food increases in summer, Ramadan, and in the first week of the month when people get their salary, 4) The participants believe that their children do not receive nutritious food. 5) ESSN assistance helped the beneficiaries in allocating more money for their food and increased the quality of their diet.
- SASF workshops are planned with TRC in the near future.
- As a result of the CVME activities, the number of protection cases have increased. During the CVME exercise, the families are referring other families with problems regarding ESSN, DHR etc.
- During the month of Ramadan, Directorate of the Religious Affairs are providing iftar and delivering food packages to Turkish and refugees. If you have vulnerable cases that need access to food packages, please refer them to Turkiye Diyanet Vakfi (TDV) Offices.

- TRC IAO and M&E activities: 7 out of 11 provinces were visited. Outreach teams conduct advocacy and sensitisation activities. They mainly visited muhtars.
- HH verification process is being conducted by the SASF offices as this is under the responsibility of the MoFSP. TRC is supporting the SASFs by providing translators and vehicles in case they need it. Since the beginning of 2018, the number of TRC Service Centers have been decreased to nine. Regarding the provinces where the TRC SCs are/were located, up to now 33,000 HHs were visited (verification visits) and 25,000 of them were achieved. For the exact numbers, TRC and WFP will request from the MoFSA and inform the partners at the next ESSN TF meeting in June.
- Regarding HH verification Process, SASFs inform their demands like translator, vehicle, etc. to MoFSP with cover letter, later MoFSP share SASF demands with TRC headquarter. Accordingly, TRC take action on assisting SASF. When NGO/INGO or other Institutions come across any SASF which could not start HH verification due to the lack of capacity, it is informed that process runs as mentioned.

3. Presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings (WFP/TRC):

- Data collection of the Post-Distribution Monitoring 2 (PDM) were conducted by the TRC Call Center in Gaziantep. Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Exercise 2 (CVME) were conducted face to face which helps to get more data than the phone interview.
- Small technical disclaimer: During the exercise, both beneficiary and non-beneficiary data are collected. Non-beneficiary data helps to understand what would have been happened without the assistance. Non-beneficiary data is used as a control group. However, the real impact of the measure requires Propensity Score Matching. World Bank is conducting a PSM, to allow for matching of beneficiary and non-beneficiary households. The results will be updated later on.
- Non applicants are mostly recent arrivals (within the last six months) which explains why they did not apply for the ESSN.
- Although there is a big decrease between CVME1 to CVME 2 (from 56% to 43%), not being registered with the DGMM is still the biggest barrier for applications. Not registered with Nufus is becoming a potential barrier as it is increased from 13% to 16% since the CVME1. ID registered in another city is increased 8%.
- Families who signed up for CCTE had higher school attendance rate at baseline, before any assistance is received; these families perhaps prioritise education more to begin with. Having CCTE only is not showing a big increase. Only together with ESSN and CCTE is showing a big improvement.
- Female headed HHs are more frequently sending their boys to work. The other reasons are listed as children need to stay at home to help and families cannot afford to send children to school.
- In terms of seeking treatment or medical advice, non-applicants are lower than the other groups (eligible and non-eligible). This could be the result of not being registered and therefore not having access to government hospitals.
- Dietary diversity: Overall diets are very diverse. Assistance is allowing people to have more diverse diet.
- Food Consumption Scores: We see an improvement for non-beneficiaries. Much larger improvement is for beneficiaries.
- Consumption Coping Strategies: Beneficiaries have decreased frequency of all consumption coping strategies
- Reduced Coping Strategies Index: Beneficiaries have larger decrease in rCSI since PDM 1(51%) compare to non-beneficiaries (17%). This creates some concerns for the future as we will continue to provide assistance to beneficiaries, their status will improve where the non-beneficiaries' status will remain stable.
- Total household debt has decreased for beneficiaries. Overall, ESSN Assistance helped beneficiaries to reduce their poverty rate than the non-beneficiaries.
- During routine field monitoring of the CCTE by UNICEF Field Monitors, information is gathered regarding the refugee experiences through CSO (Civil Society Organization) representatives who have direct communication with them through their community or service centers. There is also a third party/independent monitoring component in the monitoring and evaluation strategy of the CCTE program which includes household surveys and FGDs. This is in progress and findings are expected later in 2018. In addition, WFP M&E Team will collaborate with CCTE M&E Team.
- The primary purpose of the CVME is not to measure changes in beneficiary outcomes; we rely on the PAB/PDM for this purpose, as there is no baseline for the CVME. The primary purpose is to understand refugee vulnerability more broadly than the ESSN, and identify unmet needs, vulnerable groups or specific gaps. However, seasonality

is still important. The CVME3 data collection will run from March-August; the longer period will allow us to better control for seasonal factors.

- The World Bank will use all available data in the surveys to match the households, including the important demographic variables. These households, who match on demographics, will all be considered in the matching process.
- Regarding the Propensity Score matching, the World Bank is currently working on updated results and relying on their experts in DC. This is a complicated process and can take some time, but we hope to have updated results in the next few months.

4. Kristen Biehl's message regarding EU Facility for Refugees in Turkey - Needs Assessment:

The EU Delegation to Turkey has contracted a team of technical experts to carry out a needs assessment with the objectives of:

- Identifying remaining/unmet needs of refugees and most affected host communities in Turkey
- Assessing existing gaps in view of needs and past/on-going government and donor interventions
- Suggesting areas where further measures would still be needed in the medium and long-term
- Exploring opportunities for further coordination and alignment of actions being funded by government and donor community

The assessment covers the fields of basic needs, education, health, infrastructure, livelihoods, labour market integration, as well as social protection and cohesion. An important part of this assessment consists in consultations with various stakeholders active in these areas that the assessment will be covering. In this framework, we would like to take this opportunity to discuss these points above together with stakeholders participating in the ESSN Task Force / Basic Needs Working Group. Please contact: Kristen Biehl at kristenbiehl@europlus.sk.

We would like to thank you in advance for your timely cooperation, which will support both EU and other donor programming in Turkey and the region.

5. AOB

- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points.
- The next meeting will be held on 11 June. The meeting venue is TBD.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Istanbul Presentation (WFP/TRC)
2. Presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings (WFP/TRC)
3. ESSN - FDG April 2018: Food