

ESSN Task Force Ankara Minutes

Objective

- Provide an update on the ESSN; presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings; Refresher Session: Communicating with Beneficiaries, and AOB.

Date of meeting

17 May 2018
10:30 - 12:00

Location

WFP/TRC Park Oran Office, Ankara
Yukari Dikmen Mahallesi, Turan Gunes Bulvari,
No: 180Y, E Blok, Kat: 3 Office No: 3-4, Oran,
Ankara

1. Action points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Deadline:
Provision of information on Severe Disability Allowance	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Once the SoP is finalized with MoFSP
Provision of more information on SASF Allowance	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Once the SoP is finalized with MoFSP
Provision of more information on Household Verification SoP	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Once the SoP is finalized with MoFSP
`Livelihoods` as a theme for ESSN TF meetings (ISKUR to be invited)	TRC&WFP	July 2018
`Non-Syrians` as one of the agenda item for next meeting (UNHCR to present border trends)	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	21 June 2018
Request for gender breakdown in Call Center sub categories	TRC will include it to the ESSN updates presentations	Starting as of June meetings

2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update of the ESSN to date noting that as of 14 May, a total of 438,360 applications were registered; 2,777 applications were not assessed; 235,801 applications were deemed eligible and 199,782 applications were ineligible. Approximately, 37.94% of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres. 1.3 million target was reached in April 2018. A total of 1,301,933 beneficiaries received ESSN assistance in April (51.30% female/48.70% male). More than 60% of the beneficiaries are 18 years old.
- Most applications are received from Istanbul, Hatay, Gaziantep and Sanliurfa provinces.
- Inclusion rate is 53%. Average household size is 5.83.
- On 9 April, 1362 accounts were swept back: 1154 uncollected cards (3+ months) and 208 dormant accounts (6+ months). Please note that the accounts are only suspended; it can be reinitiated again. ESSN is designed as a **swift response** to provide the foreign people living under International Protection, Temporary Protection and Humanitarian Protection in Turkey with the chance to meet their basic needs in dignity. Therefore, after detecting **idle amounts** remaining in some of the beneficiaries' accounts, beneficiaries were informed via SMSs and were called by 168 Call Center to be informed to collect their cards and/or to make disbursements and the amounts remaining in the accounts of beneficiaries, who did not act, were swept back. The total amount swept-back was included back in the programme funds and **redistributed to beneficiaries** in need.

Two SMSs are sent to all beneficiaries with uncollected cards:

- the first warning is sent two months before the sweep-back action takes place
- the second warning is sent one month before the sweep-back action takes place to direct them to collect their cards.

An SMS is sent to each beneficiary with dormant account one month before the sweep-back action takes place to remind them to make disbursements. After all, if no return, accounts swept back and these HHs are informed to SASFs to make HH verification.

- **The information is for further dissemination** that as of April 2018, the beneficiaries can use their Kizilaykarts without commission fee at all Ziraatbank and Vakifbank ATMs. Please note that Ziraatbank and Vakibank ATM menu screens are only in Turkish.
- In Anatolian Region, majority of the applications are from Ankara, Konya and Eskisehir. Top 5 application districts in Ankara are Altindag, Mamak, Kecioren, Yenimahalle and Polatli. Top 3 most applied districts in the region are Altindag and Mamak from Ankara and Karatay/Konya.
- Based on the information provided by Ankara Area office (AAO):
 - Previously, as a result of individual applications, the ineligible application rates were high in some provinces (ex: Bolu, Cankiri). As applications cannot be deleted, but are kept on record, the eligibility percentages in those provinces will remain inaccurate.
 - DGMM established a decision centre in Ankara to speed up the decision making and registration process for the non-Syrians.
 - In order to decrease the workload of the PDMM offices, 36 new District Migration Offices were established in 16 provinces: Adana, Ağrı, Ankara, Antalya (4), Aydın (3), Balıkesir, Çanakkale, Erzurum, Gaziantep, Hatay (2), İstanbul (11), Kırklareli, Kocaeli, Malatya, Muğla (3), Şanlıurfa (3)
 - In April, two Focus Group Discussions (FGD) were conducted in Aksaray and Nigde provinces. WFP AAO shared a summary of the FGDs under the theme of Food Consumption. Some of the findings are:
 1. ESSN Assistance is enough to cover rent and bills, but not enough to meet food needs.
 2. In average, HHs spend 250 -300 TL/person in Nigde and 150-200 TL/person in Aksaray on food.
 3. The food prices are lower in Syria than Turkey. The prices tend to increase during the month of Ramadan.
 4. Some SASF are distributing food baskets in Ramadan. For further details, please see the PPT attachment.
- There was a question regarding sharing the information on ineligible households such that other agencies can support those people. There is an ongoing high-level discussion on how to share this information with the partners, yet maintaining confidentiality of personal data. Once there is a final decision, the partners will be informed accordingly. However, in indirect way, NGOs send to TRC their possible beneficiaries information under “duplication matrix” scheme, they can check their eligibility statue. Duplication matrix and its relevant documents can be shared again with members by request.
- HH verification visit guidelines will be introduced soon. These guidelines will help SASFs to determine to exclude families that should not be on the ESSN and including families where they are still vulnerable but not fitting the criteria.
- The HH verification process is under the Ministry initiative, SOPs of this process were prepared by WFP and TRC and informed to Ministry but not yet endorsed. During this HH verification process, TRC is supporting SASFs with staff and vehicle where they need. As of end of May 2018, totally 144 translators have been recruited and 38 vehicles have been provided to the SASFs through TRC under ESSN programme.
- Many questions about this issue raised in all other platforms, for this reason TRC put it in meeting agenda with Ministry, when TRC get information like nationwide HH visit number and exclusion rate after HHs verification will be shared with members.
- It is important to note that SASFs are legal entities that have under private law sanctions. They can operate differently. They receive some technical guidance from the MoFSP. However, they are bound by/linked to the District Governor. In addition, as stated on the first article of SASF regulation, they provide assistance to vulnerable people who lives in Turkey regardless of their nationality.

- A question was raised as to why household expenditure was measured, instead of household income. The reason was that income was generally inconsistent through the sampling period, whereas expenditures are more consistent.

3. Presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings:

- Data collection of the Post-Distribution Monitoring 2 (PDM) were conducted by the TRC Call Center in Gaziantep. Comprehensive Vulnerability Monitoring Exercise 2 (CVME) were conducted face to face which helps to get more data than the phone interview.
- Small technical disclaimer: During the exercise, both beneficiary and non-beneficiary data are collected. Non beneficiary data helps to understand what would have been happened without the assistance. Non-beneficiary data is used as a control group. However, the real impact of the measure requires Propensity Score Matching. World Bank is conducting a PSM, to allow for matching of beneficiary and non-beneficiary households. The results will be updated later on.
- Non applicants are mostly recent arrivals (within the last six months) which explains why they did not apply for the ESSN.
- Although there is a big decrease between CVME1 to CVME 2 (from 56% to 43%), not being registered with the DGMM is still the biggest barrier for applications. Not registered with Nufus is becoming a potential barrier as it is increased from 13% to 16% since the CVME1. ID registered in another city is increased 8%.
- Families who signed up for CCTE had higher school attendance rate at baseline, before any assistance is received; these families perhaps prioritise education more to begin with. Having CCTE only is not showing a big increase. Only together with ESSN and CCTE is showing a big improvement.
- Female headed HHs are more frequently sending their boys to work. The other reasons are listed as children need to stay at home to help and families cannot afford to send children to school.
- In terms of seeking treatment or medical advice, non-applicants are lower than the other groups (eligible and non-eligible). This could be the result of not being registered and therefore not having access to government hospitals.
- Dietary diversity: Overall diets are very diverse. Assistance is allowing people to have more diverse diet.
- Food Consumption Scores: We see an improvement for non-beneficiaries. Much larger improvement is for beneficiaries.
- Consumption Coping Strategies: Beneficiaries have decreased frequency of all consumption coping strategies.
- Reduced Coping Strategies Index: Beneficiaries have larger decrease in rCSI since PDM 1(51%) compare to non-beneficiaries (17%). This creates some concerns for the future as we will continue to provide assistance to beneficiaries, their status will improve where the non-beneficiaries' status will remain stable.
- Total household debt has decreased for beneficiaries. Overall, ESSN Assistance helped beneficiaries to reduce their poverty rate than the non-beneficiaries.
- As a result of matching the Propensity Score Matching, the vulnerable cases (extreme poor) are included in the programme. Our main concern are the ones who are extremely poor and not in the programme. That is why SASF Allowance is under discussion.
- During the HH visits, assessments are made on the general conditions, not only by income or assets.
- Regarding the child marriages, this will be covered in the CVME report in detail.
- Livelihood Coping Strategies were resorted by mostly smaller beneficiary HHs as smaller HHs are receiving less amount of assistance than the larger HHs.

4. Refresher Session: Communicating with Beneficiaries:

- When a beneficiary calls, operator can see all information (eligible,ineligible,province etc.), system recognize the caller.
- Regarding the categorization of the calls, operators follow the SoP. Refresher training is also provided to the operators on how to determine the category. It is double checked by the supervisor according to subjects and Ids on a daily basis.
- SMSs are sent in ten categories. The SMSs are sent according to planned timeline. Starting from April, messages will be sent in 4 languages: Turkish, Arabic, English and Farsi (not in Pashto anymore).
- Facebook ads are planned to cover people who do not know the programme. Some provinces are chosen to target Farsi and Arabic speaking people. Six provinces were chosen for each language. So far 6000 people were reached.
- Ownership of the mobile phone rate is 88%. Gender disagrated information is not available.
- ESSN info is included in the other visibility materials (i.e UNHCR verification brochures).

- Publicising the ESSN through National TV Channel is avoided in order not to cause for tension among the host community.
- Identification of the outreach and coordination sensitization locations is based on a number of factors including ESSN application rates, requests from partners, and analysis from field/area offices.
- WFP/TRC have a Beneficiary Communication Strategy and Corporate Communications Strategy which are more internal documents.
- Regarding the tape recording for ESSN; when someone calls the 168, caller will hear language preference first, after caller chooses the language (Arabic, Turkish etc.), subject/Program will be chosen (ESSN, CCTE or other). After this, there will be new option for caller, by pressing a certain number, some important information regarding subject/programme like application process, address changing etc. are able to be listened. In all steps, inevitably there will be some waiting period or until connecting to operator, on back frame there will be tape recording regarding some spot information like in order for us to help you faster and better, please keep your ID card ready while waiting. Your ESSN application result will be sent to you via SMS. Payments under the ESSN are taking place on the last day of every month etc. This tape record and new option is ready for ESSN side, but under preparation for CCTE side. Both will be in process in near future.

5. AOB

- Please reach to us if you have any suggestions to the themes of the upcoming Focus Group Discussions. It is confirmed with the M&E team to share the questionnaire of the next external FGDs in advance with the interested ESSN TF partners for their inputs and comments to the questionnaire. We will channel you with the M&E team if you would like to provide any contributions. Next months' subject will be on Social Solidarity.
- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points.
- For any briefing requests on up to date general information on CCTE/ESSN for the teams and field staff, please contact with ESSN TF team by indicating the language preferences of the briefing, time and venue and the number of participants.
- The next meeting will be held on **21 June at the UNHCR Cinnah Office Address: Enis Behic Koryurek Sokak No: 15/A, Aziziye Mahallesi, Cankaya Ankara.**

Attachments:

1. Presentation on ESSN Updates
2. Presentation on ESSN PDM & Q1 Monitoring Reports Findings
3. Presentation on Refresher Session: Communicating with Beneficiaries