

ESSN Task Force Ankara Minutes

Objective	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Welcome and introduction 2. Action points from the previous meeting 3. Updates on the ESSN <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TRC Data Management and Analysis System 4. Updates on the CCTE 5. ESSN and Disability 6. Q&A with MoH 7. AOB 		
Date of meeting	21 February 2019 09:00 - 11:00	Location	UNHCR Cinnah Office, Ankara
		Meeting Co-Chairs	WFP: Hiba Hanano (Gonca Savas) TRC: Hanifi Kınacı

1. Action points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Update:
Cross check of ESSN Applications for the foreigners with different kind of status and IDs	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Update integrated to the January meeting minutes
Case Study Report for ESSN Good Practices	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	This is expected in February 2019
ESSN TF ToR to be finalized	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	ToR circulated in February 2019

2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs of the World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update of the ESSN to date noting that as of 18 February 2019, a total of 507,729 applications (2,580,493 people) were registered; 2,401 applications were not assessed; 273,105 applications were deemed eligible and 232,223 applications were ineligible. 36.48% of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres.
- 262,832 households (1,530,030 people) in total received ESSN assistance in January 2019.
- As of 10 January, 1,299 accounts were swept back nationwide: 634 uncollected cards (+3 months), 665 dormant accounts (+6 months).
- Severe Disability Top-Ups: 6,330 beneficiaries received Severe Disability Top-Ups in January 2019.
- **Please refer your cases having barriers accessing ESSN to TRC Outreach Teams for their follow up. TRC Outreach Teams e-mail address: kizilaykartdiserisim@kizilay.org.tr**
- Based on the monitoring findings provided by Ankara Area office (AAO):
 - It was noted that as of February 2019, 80 SASFs out of 181 SASFs have started implementation of the SASF Discretionary Allowance. Total of 318 households which is equivalent to 0.8 % of total ineligible households benefited from the Discretionary Allowance.

- January Focus Group Discussion (FGD) on ESSN Assistance and Livelihoods was conducted in Eskisehir.
- February FGD on Vulnerability and Gender is currently being conducted.

TRC Data Management and Analysis System:

- Turkish Red Crescent made a presentation on their database and analysis system. The presentation included information on ESSN's 2.5 million application pool and how this data is being used for further analysis and programmatic decisions. As an example of conducted analysis on ESSN's existing application pool, livelihood survey findings including educational background, difficulties faced in finding a job and capacities of beneficiaries were shared with participants. More details are available in attached presentation.
- UNFPA asked whether there is connection between the capacity and the vulnerability analysis for ESSN applicants and availability gender breakdown graph for these applicants with no capacity. The TRC presenter emphasized that actually there is no study done showing the connection between the capacity and vulnerability in that while one high capacity applicant may be more vulnerable, one low capacity applicant may be less vulnerable. In this analyse, there is no gender breakdown for applicants with no capacity.

3. Updates on the CCTE:

- UNICEF CCTE Programme Officer provided an update of CCTE noting that 439,215 beneficiaries were entitled for CCTE payment in January 2019 and 47,563 beneficiaries received only CCTE top-up payment (for the beginning of spring term). 211,038 Kizilaycards were uploaded with January 2019 payment. 1,526,911 Turkish beneficiaries received January 2019 payment in the national CCTE Programme.
- As of January 2019, number of children reached with at least one CCTE payment has become 487,089 and the number of Kizilaykart uploaded with January CCTE payment is 236,218.
- As of 21 January 2019, 91 % (462,243) of the CCTE applications were accepted, 8 % (43,912) of the applications were rejected and 1 % (3,341) of the applications is pending. 36 % of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centers.
- As of 16 January, 98,569 calls were received by TRC Call Center for CCTE. 56 % of the callers were women and top call category was information request.
- Top 5 provinces with most number of CCTE beneficiaries are respectively as follows: Istanbul (14%), Gaziantep (13%), Hatay (11%), Sanliurfa (9 %) and Ankara (5%). Among 29.625 children reached in Ankara as of January payment, 1 % of the students are in kindergarten level, 6 % of the students are in high-school level and 93 % of the students are in primary school. 5 districts with most beneficiaries in Ankara are respectively as follows: Altindag (32%), Mamak (21%), Kecioren (16%), Yenimahalle (13%) and Sincan (3%).
- 14 SASFs, 11 Halkbank branches in 5 provinces and 8 PECs in 3 provinces were visited in Blacksea, Central and Eastern Anatolia regions since November 2018.
 - In some SASFs, some of the CCTE beneficiaries were automatically being rejected as they reached the age of 18; SASF Officers were alerted that these children can be readmitted to the system after they sign consent forms.
 - At 9 SASFs out of 14 visited, the Local BoT approves CCTE applications only when the HH visit is completed, and the reported duration for the entire process varies. The longest duration reported was one month.
 - The misunderstanding at Terme SASF in Samsun based on the ISAIS announcement made on 06 Feb 2018 was corrected. 10 CCTE beneficiaries out of 25 affected beneficiaries were re-admitted to the programme on the spot, and the situation of the remaining beneficiaries will be followed up.

- Due to an ISAIS announcement made on 16 March 2018, Aksehir SASF in Konya does not proceed the applications without IDs issued by the PDMM even if the applicant submits pre-registration document on which the ID number is written by the PDMM.
- Since 2016, Refugee Integration Center has been operational within Bey pazari SASF in Ankara involving SASF and MoNE Officers; they regularly conduct HH visits in order to identify potential risks/issues related to refugees. In summer of 2018, they identified several OOSC and informed families on free access to education and the CCTE in Turkey during those visits.
- Outreach staff of Kocasinan PEC in Kayseri collaborated with local NGOs in the district and they swiftly reached to a large number of refugees, including non-Syrians in this way. Currently, half of the ALP learners registered in the PEC are IP holders.
- Children enrolled in ALP have been eligible to apply for the CCTE programme as of mid-August 2018.
 - The number of ALP Learners received CCTE payment reached to 1,078 after Jan 2019 payment. 31 out of 1,078 are in Ankara.
 - There are 5 districts in Ankara where ALP classes are operational: Altindag, Cubuk, Kecioren, Mamak and Polatli.

4. ESSN and Disability:

- **The legal framework** for the provision of services and assistance for the people with disability in Turkey is based on the “Law on Persons with Impairments” dated 2005 and the “Regulation on the Impairment Criteria, Classification and Medical Board Reports to be issued for the impaired” dated 2013. These two legal documents were designed around the main principles of equality, non-discrimination, integration, full and active participation, and rehabilitation for access and education. The new regulations as a replacement to the above-mentioned regulations have been announced on 20 February 2019 and the detailed information on the new regulation is below.
- **Persons with disability** are described as a person who due to loss of varying degrees of physical, intellectual, mental, sensory and social abilities congenitally or afterwards, has difficulty in adapting to social life and meeting daily needs, and is in need of protection, care or rehabilitation, counselling and support services. This means that disability does not only refer to either physical or mental disability but refers to the person’s own capacity for survival and meeting daily needs including access to basic needs.
- The Ministry of Health and Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services are the two responsible authorities for providing different types and levels of services and assistance for the persons with disability. Based on the type and level of the disability, there are available services including informal/formal education, employment, social rehabilitation/integration, physical access, health and preventive services, care and rehabilitation services, financial assistance, tax deduction/exemption, etc.
- **Disability Health Report** (DHR) is the document that is needed for identification of the type and level of disability of the person. It follows the international standards as a technical and objective tool.
- DHR can only be provided by the **Medical Board** of the authorized hospitals. The Board consists of hospital managers and specialists from different departments including physician, ophthalmologists, otolaryngologist, general surgery or orthopaedical, neurology or mental health and diseases.
- During the identification of the **authorized state hospitals**, the Ministry of Health looks for different indicators such as having enough doctors and capacities as well as the demand from the people. If ESSN TF members can identify a place with an insufficient number of authorized hospitals, the request can then be referred to the Provincial Directorates of Health in the provinces. Noting that the suggested hospital should have an adequate capacity to provide DHRs. And it is important to note that only two big private hospitals are in the list of authorized hospitals with enough academic and bureaucratic capacity.

- All foreigners and citizens of Turkey can obtain DHRs from the authorized hospitals – they need to submit the ID cards and a referral letter or a written petition. Foreigners under International Protection or Temporary Protection status may need to pay the cost of around 200-250 TRY per report.
- For **appeals** over the results of the DHRs or reports that have missing information such as severity or validity period, please reach out to the Hospital Management or Provincial Directorates of Health in the provinces.
- There are two types of reports: temporary and indefinite (permanent). It is based on the decision of the Medical Board for the validity of the reports in line with the general health/social conditions of the person. Persons with the level of disability or a medical condition that may change in due course (positively or negatively) may receive DHRs with expiry dates. It means that the Medical Board need to evaluate the disability and health condition of that person by the expiry date of the report. It is also important to note that the persons with disability can reach to the authorized hospitals for renewal of their DHR starting from 6 months before the expiry date of the old DHR.
- Main challenges to obtain DHRs for refugees are reported from the field as the cost, translation of the documents, language barriers, limited hospital capacities, long appointment periods, appeal process, expiry dates and incomplete reports such as missing flagging as severely disabled. In addition to the main challenges and barriers, there are also different implementations in the field, especially on the cost coverage. While some hospitals do not ask for fee from the refugees with more than 1% disabilities, others may ask for the cost of around 200-250 TRY. In some cases, SASFs, Sub-Governorate offices or NGOs cover the cost for the vulnerable people including refugees.
- Ministry of Health representative noted that they recently evaluated the capacity of hospitals and have not detected any capacity issue or long appointment periods for obtaining DHRs. He added that none of evaluated hospitals give more than a four-month appointment and requested from the partners to refer their identified hospitals giving appointment for long periods to the Provincial Directorates of Health.
- Under the Emergency Social Safety Net (ESSN) Programme, WFP-TRC-MoFLSS provides two kinds of assistance to the people with disabilities and these two-assistance are interlinked to each other. The first one is that one of the six criteria to be eligible for ESSN Assistance is “having a minimum of one household member with more than 40% disability proved by a DHR from an authorized state hospital”. The households that meet this criterion, after the application to ESSN, start receiving 120 TRY per person per month via their Kızılaykart. This is the normal implementation since the beginning of the ESSN programme in December 2016. As of August 2018, ESSN Programme started to provide additional top-ups called **“Severe Disability Allowance”** for the ESSN eligible persons with severe disability (more than 50% disability rate) and their disability is flagged as “severe” on their valid DHRs. This assistance is 600 TRY per person per month in addition to their regular ESSN assistance. This assistance is for the families that have a minimum of one person with severe disability who is dependent to at least one household member to take care of himself/herself. In January 2019, a total of 1.530.030 individuals received ESSN assistance, among them 25.537 have valid DHRs indicating more than 40% disability; and 6.330 persons with severe disability received additional top-up as “Severe Disability Allowance”. Please note that some of the ESSN beneficiaries with a certain degree of disability who meet one of the other criteria, already receives ESSN assistance by meeting other ESSN criteria. They are the ones having disability but not a valid DHR submitted to the SASF offices. TRC-WFP team informed all ESSN beneficiaries to obtain DHRs for the persons with disabilities and submit to the SASF offices as soon as possible in order to benefit from this additional allowance as well.

5. Q&A Session with MoH representatives:

- Based on the MoH online database platform, by the end of 2018 MoH issued more than 6 million reports and almost 3,5 million disabled individuals are registered/befitting from the related services and assistance. As counted reports include results from 1% to 100% disability status.
- **New regulations** on “Assessment of Special Needs for Children” and “Assessment of Disability for the Adults” is valid as of 20 February 2019 as a replacement for the “Regulation on the Impairment Criteria, Classification and Medical Board Reports to be issued for the impaired” dated 2013 and the new regulation have the revisions below:
 - With the new regulations, the terminology has been changed from “persons with severe disability” to “fully dependent persons with disability”.
 - Additional diseases have been included to the calculation.
 - The composition of the members of the “Medical Board” have been revised. For children with several types and levels of disability or impairment, there needs a minimum of four specialized doctors from different departments relevant to the person’s health and disability condition and the members of the board should be a minimum six. For the adults, there should be seven members to comprise the Medical Board.
 - The DHRs should be finalized in a maximum period of 30 days.
 - Once children with disability turns 18, they should reach the authorized hospitals in a period of 3 months to obtain a new DHR.
 - The DHRs with expiry date can be renewed in 6 months before the expiry date.
 - DHRs with expiry date obtained before this regulation will be valid until their expiration date. The acquired rights will not be withdrawn.
 - The authorized hospitals will establish required structure for the e-report system in one year. The reports will be issued and proceeded online in the near future.
- According to new regulation, the appeals to the DHRs should be within 30 days and the regulation is in place as of 20th Feb. For Turkish versions of the two new regulations, please see the following links: <http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2019/02/20190220-2.htm> for the adults’ DHR
<http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2019/02/20190220-1.htm> for the children’s DHR
- MOH representative stated the new regulation shows that change on regulation is benefit of patient or disabled individuals.
- The terminology change fully aims stopping unjust treatment and loss of rights is another point stated by representatives.
- New regulation will not cover the ones who already had DHR but will be valid for the new DHR application or renewal of existing DHR.
- MoH, UNICEF and MoFLSS are working on the training sessions for the hospital personnel on the new regulation on “Assessment of Special Needs for Children” dated 20 February 2019. The regulation frames the provision of DHRs for the children under 18 and there is also another regulation on the “Assessment of Disability for the Adults” announced on the same date and effective now.
- The platform of e-report system/submissions developed by MoH enables checking types of medical reports provided by public hospitals, eliminates the fraud practices and increases the coordination among the service providers.
- Regarding the Disability Health Report fees, the representatives reminded participants that DHRs are not free, the cost is around 200 TRY. Discussions of an agreement between the Ministry of Health and the DGMM is being carried to provide free DHR to refugees. In addition, the report is provided free of charge for the Turkish citizens by the decree of the Council of Ministers. Depending on the type of the report, there are certain exceptions that Turkish citizens may also need to pay for the report (i.e. vehicle purchase).

- The representatives reminded participants that the Provincial Health Directorate is the legitimate entity to which people should go if they face with below circumstances:
 - Any objections to result of report,
 - Any maltreatment or abuse by hospital staff,
 - Any block on renewal of report due to different reasons like typing mistake on ID cards,
 - All other troubles cannot be solved by hospital administration.
- The general complaints can be directed to the MoH hotline 184.
- Mental and physical disability breakdown was another topic wondered by the participants, yet MoH representative stated that the information is on the DHR documents and this type of information cannot be public due to law on personal data privacy.
- Turk Kizilay co-chair reminded the cases in need of special education such as the autism and MoH representatives replied that like in other locations cases of autism are handled at some education centers and clinics coordinated with MoNE, but the referral and problem of communication still arise for the refugee children to access specialized education and DHR.

6. Any Other Business:

- As of February 2019, ESSN TF will follow the bi-monthly meeting cycle. If you would like to attend or receive documents/invitations from those locations, reach out to sahnur.soykan@wfp.org for further requests.
- ESSN TF Co-Chairs are planning to invite Directorate General of Population and Citizenship (NUFUS) representatives to the ESSN TF meetings in April. Once it is confirmed, you will receive the invitation.
- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed (related to coordination and to the ESSN Task Force), with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:
 - **WFP:** Gonca Savas – email: gonca.savas@wfp.org
 - **TRC:** Ayman Sallawy Alhalb – email: ayman.alhalb@kizilay.org.tr
Hanifi Kinaci – email: hanifi.kinaci@kizilay.org.tr
- **Basic Needs and Livelihoods sectors are planning a thematic ad hoc meeting in March with the focus on transition.**
- Next Meeting: The next meeting will be held **in April 2019**. The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Ankara Presentation
2. TRC Data Management Presentation
3. CCTE Presentation
4. ESSN and Disability Presentation