**Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group**

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minutes

Gaziantep

**19 April 2016**

Chaired by: WFP, UNHCR and CARE

Hosted by: CARE International

(A full list of attendees can be found at the end of this document)

Agenda:

1.   Welcome and round the table introductions

2.   Revision of data collected by WFP VAM team and update on WFP/TRC e-food assistance value increase & discussion on Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB)

3.   Agreement on 3W Template to record CBI activities per month

4.   Presentation of proposed template for understanding existing beneficiary complaints mechanisms adopted by partners

5.   Introduction to CaLP website for this Working Group

6.   Endorsement & Validation of Work-Plan, Priority Areas & Focal Points

7.    AOB

|  |
| --- |
| **Summary of Action Points**   * **Action Point #1:** Partners facing financial constraints in maintaining caseload while increasing transfer value to 62TL can contact WFP to explore possibility of transfering some beneficiaries; * **Action Point #2:** All partners (WHH, Concern, ASSAM, STL and World Vision) to explore which data is available and can be shared; send to WFP/VAM to further refine MEB; * **Action Point #3:** Vanessa to circulate revised Work-Plan for final endorsement by COB 20 May; * **Action Point #4:** Co-Chairs to follow-up with team leaders of priority tasks prior to next meeting on 20 May; * **Action Point #5:** Partners to provide feedback on CaLP-hosted [Turkey CBI-TWG web-page](http://www.cashlearning.org/coordination/turkey-cash-working-group) by COB 20 May; * **Action Point#6:** Partners to provide feedback on the proposed 3W reporting requirements by COB 20 May; * **Action Point #7:** Vanessa to liaise with AAP/Protection Unit in WFP Rome to revise the AAP template and circulate to partners for their comments. |

1. Welcome and round the table introductions

*Co-chairs introduction*

* The Co-Chairs welcomed the WFP Vulnerability Analysis Mapping (VAM) colleague who presented research undertaken in four provinces in Turkey. The findings from the VAM analysis justified the increase of the WFP/TRC e-food assistance value to 62 Turkish Lira per individual per month. This presentation then contributed to a discussion on the MEB (Minimum Expenditure Basket).
* The Co-Chairs also introduced the agenda items to be discussed stressing the importance of agreeing on monthly reporting requirements and data to be collected for cash-based interventions.
* Special thanks to CARE International for hosting this meeting.

2. Revision of data collected by WFP VAM team and update on WFP/TRC e-food assistance value increase & discussion on Minimum Expenditure Basket (MEB)

1. *VAM Update on PAB Findings*

* Aysha Twose, WFP VAM Officer, introduced the initial results from the WFP Pre-Assistance Baseline (PAB) Report, which was released last week. Based on the results from this data, the VAM colleague led a discussion on the methodologies and concepts around establishing a Minimum Expenditure Basket in Turkey. She clarified that her presentation is merely a starting point and that it will be necessary for partners to share further information and assessment findings from different provinces in an effort to agree on what the MEB should be. It was also noted that the MEB may vary according to seasonality and geographic locations.
* The first methodology introduced involves looking at food purchases as a percentage of expenditure patterns and the second methology involves looking at actual expenditures (rather than starting by considering food as a key underpinning factor).
* *Discussion on Minimum Expenditure Baskets:* 
  + Operational Updates from Partners
* 9 actors currently have ongoing cash-transfer programmes. All except WFP are providing 50TL per capita per month.
* The following partners shared data with WFP: Concern, Welthungerhilfe, ASSAM, World Vision, Support to Life. Vanessa to follow-up with remaining partners:
  + **ASSAM** to share analytical data with WFP on NFI distributions taking place in 81 provinces.
  + **Mercy Corps** to share data on its operations in Izmir – starting NFI in-kind and cash transfers and e-voucher distributions.
  + **Support to Life (STL)** to share data from Iskenderen specifically on minium expenditure baskets.
  + **Concern** to share data on its calculations which show that 82TL per capita/month was what was needed to meet Syrian food security needs in Sanliurfa with the same food basket as WFP (2,100 Kcal).
  + Points of Concern Raised by Partners
* Difficulties in increasing the voucher value from 50TL to 62TL were highlighted by partners. It was agreed that actors facing financial constraints in maintaining their caseload while increasing the transfer value to 62TL can contact WFP to explore the possibility of transfering some beneficiaries;
* UNICEF requested further analysis on the vulnerability differences between newly arrived refugees and those already in Turkey for the past 6-12 months. This could be an additional topic to explore through partner data.
* IOM also expressed concern that the WFP Regional Referential Food Basket had not been sufficiently contextualized for Turkey and was skepitical as to whether the monetary value of the food basket could be effectively translated into three balanced/nutritious meals per day for all household members (i.e. PLWs, children, elderly etc.)
* The significance of adapting the expenditure-based methodology to economies of scale was also noted by CARE, especially as concerns variations in rental and utility payments depending on household size.
* Partners also noted that while food consumption and expenditure patterns are especially useful for voucher programs, they are not equally informative for unrestricted cash programs because it is difficult to monitor exactly what consumers are purchasing. It might be more useful to look at increases in vulnerabilities for the cash approach by comparing baselines with PDM findings to gauge levels of food insecurity.
  + Updates from WFP VAM
* WFP VAM tolook at expenditure and price data from the Turkish Statistical Institute as a means of comparison with Syrian expenditures and in order to begin negotiations with the Government.
* WFP provided updates on the meeting held with MFSP (Minisyry of Family and Social Policy) on 18 April in Ankara. The Government’s stance is still however to cap it at 62 TL and not go beyond this value each month.
* WFP is engaging with MFSP to collect a mean and median value of what is transferred to Turkish citizens for social welfare to be used as a means of comparison for our Syrian beneficiaries. Turkish social welfare and social assistance values are quite complex and when analyzing the decentralized portion of social assistance, one can see that it is not uniformly applied per district. Allocations are contingent on budget available, applications received and a number of other factors. It is still unclear if the Government will accept higher transfer amounts than those currently provided to poor Turkish citizens through national safety net systems, and/or how much higher.
* WFP has conducted proxy means testing to look at the correlation between demographics and the vulnerability/expenditure-pattern; a report will be issued shortly on this. What was presented is an initial attempt at an MEB based on limited information so any additional data that partners can contribute around expenditure patterns and price data is welcomed. Vanessa to follow-up with WHH, Concern, ASSAM and World Vision for this data.
* It was also clarified that the position of Chief Advisor to the Prime Minister’s Office has been transferred to a new focal point, who is in turn bringing in AFAD as a key coordinator. Whereas previously, AFAD was only responsible for camp coordination, it will now also be involved in the coordination of the off-camp response.
* While vulnerability-based targeting is an optimal approach, if WFP is to scale-up at the level it has been requested, door-to-door household expenditure surveys will not be an option.

3. Agreement on 3W Template to record CBI activities per month

* Co-Chairs stressed the importance of collecting data on CBI activities on a monthly basis using a shared template so as to avoid multiple data entries into different formats/templates.
* WFP as co-chair of the Food Security Sector and UNHCR as chair of the Basic Needs Sector propose the following 3W reporting areas to be collected from partners undertaking e-voucher and cash-based interventions:
  1. Geographical Identification – Province, District, Location
  2. Sector
  3. Number of individuals assessed/surveyed
  4. Number of individuals reached (male/Female)
  5. Type and frequency of assistance
  6. Voucher Value per individual
  7. Number of shops contracted
  8. Number of shops monitored
  9. Most commonly purchased products
  10. Type of mechanism available for feedback and complaints (i.e. hotline, letterbox, community centre etc.)
  11. Number of issues logged (i.e. calls received)
  12. Number of referrals (out) to specialized agencies/service-providers
* The indicators mentioned will be consolidated on a joint 3W matrix and collected monthly. Presentations will then be delivered at the CBI TWGs on gaps and overlaps in the CBI response to better inform strategic decision-making.
* All partners to provide their feedback on the proposed reporting requirements by **COB 20 May.**
* UNHCR Information Manager, Levant Ekis informed the Food Security Sector that ActivityInfo will be rolled-out for Protection and Education sectors by 1 May, but it is expected that the software will come to the other sectors over the course of the next two months. For more information on specific 3RP reporting requirements for each sector, please refer to the logframes in the 2016-17 3RP.

4. Presentation of proposed template for understanding existing beneficiary complaints mechanisms adopted by partners

* With a view to promoting a coordinated approach to Accountability to Affected Populations, one of the areas addressed in the Programme Quality section of the Work-Plan is to develop minimum standards and guidelines on AAP in CBI.
* An AAP Officer from WFP Rome will be deployed to Gaziantep to support the CBI TWG in this process.
* As a first step tp identifying shared standards and guidelines, a mapping exercise will be conducted to understand what existing mechanisms partners have in place to promote community feedback and complaints.
* A fact-finding mission to set a baseline - The proposed template containing the following topic areas was discussed:
  + Type of Mechanism
  + Common Issues (i.e. Technical Card Issues; Accommodation/Rental Payment; Medical Equipment and Needs; Transportation; Medical Assistance; Food Assistance; Documentation/Translation and Legal Assistance; Education;Protection/SGBV)
  + Specific Complaints
  + Who is complaining
  + Do you refer out to agencies?
  + How do you refer?
  + Do you collect (SADD – sex and age disaggregated data)?
  + What would you improve?
* This exercise will not be limited to CBI activities because it is worth getting a sense of what complaints mechanisms exist beyond e-voucher programs. However, be careful not to duplicate with Case Management/ Protection Working Group. Vanessa to call Protection/SGBV focal points to check for duplications.
* It was agreed that this should be an initial scoping exercise and therefore the template should have more text boxes allowing for open-ended/ qualitative responses to better understand what is in place and what the current gaps are.
* The concept behind Question 5 is to begin to improve referral systems (i.e. if a beneficiary phones about a protection issue, the agency can refer the individual to UNHCR that can then follow-up with more appropriate mechanisms – i.e. focus group discussions etc.) This will enable beneficiaries to navigate our humanitarian systems better and promote greater transparency and efficiency.
* This initial mapping will enable us to establish guidelines on how we can better communicate with Syrians who have been excluded from the programme, without giving away the vulnerability formula.
* It is important to clarify which target audience is complaining (i.e. beneficiaries, service providers, people in and out of programme).
* Vanessa to liaise with AAP/Protection Unit in WFP Rome to revise the template.
* Vanessa to circulate the revised AAP mapping template by **COB 28 April** to partners for their comments on the template.

5. Introduction to CaLP website for this Working Group

* A website for the Turkey Cashed-Based Technical Working Group has been designed through the CaLP platform (Cash Learning Partnership).
* We welcome all feedback from partners on both content and layout of the draft website (<http://www.cashlearning.org/coordination/turkey-cash-working-group)> by **COB 28 April** so that the page may become live shortly.
* The purpose of the web-page is to share knowledge on key outputs with interested focal points at both national, regional and global levels and to begin documenting progress on the different thematic areas of the agreed Work Plan.

6. Endorsement & Validation of Work-Plan, Priority Areas & Focal Points

* WFP is looking for a Stand-by Partner to have an additional support for IM/GIS functions for coordination based in Gaziantep (on board in the next two weeks) to lead Information Management component of the Work-Plan.
* Agreed Changes in Work-Plan:
  + Programme Quality & Cross-Cutting Issues – section led by WFP/UNICEF and supported by CARE – June, Sept., Dec.
  + Revision of PDM and price monitoring tools – WFP lead and IMMAP support
  + Sharing good practices/lessons learned – lead by WFP/supported by all actors
  + CARE and/or ASSAM - additional resource will support activity 9 in the work-plan on information sharing with local & central government counterparts.
* Priority Areas Agreed for Next Quarter & Next Steps:
  + **Activity #10** – IOM as lead and CARE/DRC to pilot tool shortly.
  + **Activity#11** – Mercy Corps will lead this and is finalizing price monitoring database for NFIs & food with support from all actors/ discussions on methodologies will follow. Mercy Corps to reach out to Nesrin Semen ([nesrin.semen@wfp.org)](mailto:nesrin.semen@wfp.org)) for WFP PDM data.
  + **Activity#12** – Lead by WFP
  + **Acivity#13** – Lead by CARE – already underway and can be presented at next meeting.
  + **Activity#18** – WFP/UNHCR with support from WFP Headquarters in Rome & all actors – (April till mid-July).
  + **Activity#19** – IOM as lead – reach out to REACH
  + **Acivity#25** – WFP to collect feedback from CaLP & REACH on mapping member resources for capacity building on CBI (nationally, regionally and globally).

***Activities that will be presented at the next meeting.***

7. AOB

* Concern & CARE to share existing Accountability Reports/databases with the Co-Chairs and the group.
* Broforce is in-country and exploring opportunities for capacity building in CBI.
* IOM believes it would be useful to develop SOPs/guidelines on impact evaluations (baselines/endlines) for CBIs and facilitate impact evaluations. Include it as **Activity #26** (starting in August).
* On 18 April, UNHCR established an in-house CBI-working group for non-Syrian refugees; a tender went out last week for unconditional multi-purpose cash. UNHCR wants PTT as a service provider. UNHCR will directly implement cash programs targeting non-Syrians but will implement through partners for e-voucher operations addressing Syrians.

*Next CBI TWG:* ***Tuesday, 31 May 2016****, 11:00 am to 13:00 pm @ Care.*

**ATTENDEES:**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Organization** | **Name** | **E-mail** | **Title** |
| 1. CARE International | Salah Hamwi | Salah.hamwi@care.org | Project Manager |
| 1. Concern | Korol Diker | Korol.diker@concern.net | Livelihood & Protection Program Manager |
| 1. Danish Refugee Council | Paula Armstrong | Paul.armstrong@drc-turkey.org | Livelihood Coordinator |
| 1. IOM | Yousef Ali | myali@iom.int | M&E Officer |
| 1. Mercy Corps | AlysWon Murray |  | Reporting Manager |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Zeynel Gultekin |  | Information & Project Manager |
| 1. Mercy Corps | Asma Dada |  | Information Protection Officer |
| 1. NRC | Sara Buzzoni | Sara.buzzoni@nrc.no | Livelihood Program Manager |
| 1. PARCIC | Yuki Onogi | [yuki.onogi@parcic.org](mailto:yuki.onogi@parcic.org) | Project Manager |
| 1. Turkish Red Crescent | Zeynel Dogan | Zeynel.dogar@kizilay.org | Team Leader |
| 1. Turkish Red Crescent | Ali Eren Karadeniz | Eren.karadeniz@kizilay.org | Team Leader |
| 1. UNFPA | Bora Ozbek | [ozbek@unfpa.org](mailto:ozbek@unfpa.org) | GBV Expert |
| 1. UNHCR | Selwa Aboulkas | abdulkas@unhcr.orACD | Associate Programme Officer |
| 1. UNHCR | Hilda Ochuonyo | ochuonyo@unhcr.org | Associate Protection Officer |
| 1. UNICEF | Yannick Brand | ybrand@unicef.org | Head of Office |
| 1. Welthungerhilfe | Jesco | Jesco.weickert@welthungerhilfe.de | Head of Program |
| 1. Welthungerhilfe | Liseme Yobonci | Liseme.yobonci@welthungerhilfe.de | Program Officer |
| 1. WFP | Katie Inglis | Kathleen.inglis@wfp.org | Head of Programme |
| 1. WFP | Azhar Al-Azzawi | Azhar.alazzawi@wfp.org | Head of Office |
| 1. WFP | Aysha Twose | Aysha.twose@wfp.org | VAM Officer |
| 1. WFP | Vanessa Bonsignore | Vanessavita.bonsignore@wfp.org | Programme Officer |
| 1. World Vision | Sadek Alfaraj | [Sadek.alfaraj@wvi.org](mailto:Sadek.alfaraj@wvi.org) | CARO |
| 1. World Vision | Ahmad Saoud | Ahmad.saoud@wvi.org | Commodities Specialist |