

ESSN Task Force Izmir Minutes

Objective	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Welcome and introduction 2. Action points from the previous meeting 3. Updates on ESSN and its implementation in Aegean region <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - TRC Data Management and Analysis System 4. Updates on the CCTE 5. ESSN and Disability 6. Q&A with MoH 7. AOB 		
Date of meeting	01 February 2019 09:30 - 11:30	Location	TRC Izmir Branch - Sehit Nevres Bulvari No:3 1. Kat, Kizilay Is Merkezi, Izmir
		Meeting	WFP: Arzum Karasu
		Co-Chairs	TRC: Hanifi Kinaci

1. Action Points:

Follow up issue:	Who will take action:	Deadline:
SMSs and alternate communication for the partners to have access to ESSN information	ESSN TF Co-Chairs	Pending discussions
Detailed information on the HH verification numbers	TRC requested from MoFLSS	National level figures shared at the last Istanbul ESSN Task Force – local figures still needed.
New Action Points from the Meeting:		
Do the municipalities who can provide assistance to refugees take on board the ESSN eligibility of the applicant when providing assistance? If yes and in case the applicant is an ESSN eligible, he/she still receive assistance?	TRC	April ESSN TF

2. Updates on the ESSN:

- The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turkish Red Crescent (TRC) provided an update of the ESSN to date noting that as of 28 January 2019, a total of 503,081 applications (2,560,172 people) were registered; 2,630 applications were not assessed; 278,396 applications were deemed eligible and 222,055 applications were ineligible. 36.57% of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centers.
- 262,832 households (1,530,030 people) in total received ESSN assistance in January.
- 9,380 households (54,930 people) in Izmir received the ESSN assistance.
- As of 10 January, 1,299 accounts were swept back nationwide: 634 uncollected cards (+3 months), 665 dormant accounts (+6 months)

■ TRC Data Management and Analysis System

Turkish Red Crescent has made a presentation on their database and analysis system. Presentation included information on ESSN's 2.5 million application pool and how this data is being used for further analysis and programmatic decisions. As an example of conducted analysis on the use of ESSN's existing application pool, livelihood survey findings including educational background, difficulties faced in finding a job and capacities of beneficiaries have been shared with participants. More details available on attached presentation.

■ Focus Group Discussions Findings:

December and January Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) findings were presented.

December FGDs investigated the winter conditions and its impact upon refugees.

• Highlights:

○ **Livelihoods:**

For them, work **opportunities are more in winter and less in summer** as opposed to the general trend.

○ **Expenditure:**

Expenses related to winter clothing and heating **increase** during winter. Winter clothing as the additional cost for children's schooling.

January FGDs addressed issues related to livelihoods and social cohesion.

• Highlights:

○ **Livelihoods:**

Job opportunities are **much less** than when they first arrived.

Female participants reported no change concerning their use of the assistance (covering rent and bills).

Male participants reported improvement in their lives after receiving the assistance.

○ **Social Cohesion:**

No tension with the host community was raised. Female participants noted that the Turkish people were very helpful during the first years but that it was no longer the case.

Male participants reported no change with their interactions with the host communities.

■ TRC-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:

Monitoring visits were conducted in **Izmir, Mugla, Antalya, Usak, Denizli, Manisa** and **Aydin** to SASFs, Halkbank, Hospitals, Nufus and TRC-SCs, where:

- **25** CVMEs were conducted (Mugla).
- **11** protection cases were identified and referred to relevant service providers.

Main Findings:

- There are HHs still trying to apply to the ESSN with IDs registered in a different province.
- Illegal migration: Kusadasi and Didim districts are still used as transit points to the Greek islands. In Manavgat district (Antalya) some refugees have been arrested while trying to cross the sea.

1 February 2019, 09:30-11:30, WFP/TRC Izmir

- SASF Discretionary Allowance has not been fully put into practice in the Aegean provinces yet. Most of the SASF's are still reviewing their files for potential beneficiaries, although some have started using their quota for families that match the Group A criteria.
- Social Cohesion: In Esme district (Usak) tension between host dramatically increased after two Syrian men stabbed two local citizens during a fight.

■ **TRC Outreach Activities:**

- During December 2018 and January 2019, TRC Izmir Outreach Teams have visited 152 sites in seven eight provinces out of 11 mostly to Nufus, Municipalities and SASF's.
- **Municipalities and SSCs:** Regularly visited for sensitizing.
- **SASFs:** Mainly to assist with and solve ESSN application related issues.
- **Nufus:** Solving issues resulting from some inconsistencies between Nufus database and PDMM's.

3. **Updates on the CCTE:**

Cash Component:

- UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor provided an update of CCTE noting that 439,215 beneficiaries were entitled for CCTE payment in January 2019 and 47,563 beneficiaries received only CCTE top-up payment. 211,038 Kizilaycards were uploaded with January 2019 payment. 1,526,911 Turkish beneficiaries received January 2019 payment in the national CCTE programme.
- As of 21 January 2019, 91 % (462,243) of the CCTE applications were accepted, 8 % (43,912) of the applications were rejected and 1 % (3,341) of the applications is pending. 36 % of the applications were registered by TRC Service Centres.
- As of 16 January, 98,569 calls were received by TRC Call Center for CCTE. 56 % of the callers were women and top call category was information request.
- As the ratio in November 2018 payment, 3.5 % of the CCTE beneficiaries (15,165), who received January 2019 payment, were from Izmir.
- 22 SASFs and 5 Halkbank branches have been visited by UNICEF CCTE Field Monitors in 4 provinces in the Aegean and Marmara Regions since 7 December 2019. Main findings:
 - Refugee movement for work and other reasons is still prevalent creating challenges for SASFs in confirming address and conducting verification visits.
 - In Manisa, concerted efforts by local administration to reach refugee families have been observed. Outreach groups consisting MoNE, SASF, MoH, Municipality representatives visit households and check on access to services. Registration to school is found to be high; however, attendance levels are still low (especially in high school).
- The ratio of CCTE beneficiaries in kindergarten (1,4 %) and high-school level (1,6%) is lower in Izmir compared to the national averages (CCTE beneficiaries in kindergarten consist of 2,6% and 6,9 % of the beneficiaries are in the high-school).
- Children enrolled in ALP have been eligible to apply for the CCTE programme as of mid-August 2018.
 - The number of ALP Learners was 1,066 among the 439,215 children paid in January 2019.
 - 74 out of 1,066 ALP Learners who have received CCTE Payments in January 2019 were from Izmir: Karabaglar (48 ALP students) and Bornova (18 ALP students) were the districts with most CCTE ALP beneficiaries among 7 districts of Izmir where ALP classes are operational (Buca, Foca, Menderes, Menemen and Torbali).

4. **ESSN and Disability**

- The presentation included the legal framework upon which the Ministry of Health was referring to when putting in place policies for people with disabilities, their status, their rights and the Severe Disability Assistance they could claim to according their situation and the procedure to obtain Disability Health Reports in Turkey. The Severe Disability Assistance and the disability criteria when applying to the ESSN programme has been discussed. Regarding the Severe Disability Assistance, one of the criteria to obtain such report is to have at least 50% disability however to avoid confusion, the representative of the MoH have stressed the fact that ***having 50% disability does not automatically mean that the applicant is severely disabled.***
- Severe Disability Assistance started in August 2018 and can only be provided to ESSN beneficiaries.
- 5.928 people have been granted severe disabled assistance as of December 2018. They are located in 71 provinces.
- A total of 3.556.800 TL has been uploaded to Kizilaykarts as Severe Disability Assistance beneficiaries.

5. **Q&A with Representative from MoH: Mr. Zubeyir UNSAL and Mr. Ali BATGA**

- Representatives of the MoH presented their own presentation on the policy of the Ministry of Health regarding the rights of people with disabilities. The legal framework and its implementation were also part of the presentation. The presentation included a map with the location (nationwide) of the hospital where the DHR can be obtained (private, publics and university training hospitals) – the link of the map and the list of those places has also been shared:
https://khgmozellikli.saglik.gov.tr/svg/ozellikli_hizmetler.php?srr=136
- One NGO raised the case where some medicals tests were requested to some people and whether this procedure was legal and if so on which context this should be done. Mr. Batga confirmed that in some suspicious cases i.e someone claiming being 15 but looks older applies to be put in an orphanage for example can be submitted to medical tests to verify his/her age. Again, when accepting refugees, the state has the right to ask for medical tests to detect any case of contagious diseases said Mr. Batga.
- Representatives answered questions and comments about some issues raised by participants mainly about difficulties of access to some treatment and/or medicines for refugees. Mr. Ali Batga reminded the participants that some medicines are originally not available in Turkey, they are coming from abroad – The Ministry has asked the DGMM to finance some medicines that come from abroad, so they can be accessible to refugees. The representatives also reminded the fact that the National Security Scheme (SGK) do not provide medicines to refugees but AFAD used to do it hence their request to the DGMM who is now taking over from AFAD. Also, it was shared with the participants that UNHCR do take applications for resettling applicants to third countries in some cases especially when the needed treatment is not available in Turkey. But they also stressed the fact urgent and particular cases should be reported to the Provincial Health Directorate when no solutions is provided by hospitals and/or doctors in case they are alternatives solutions.
- Regarding concerns raised as to the mistreatment and/or the DHR fee being higher than it should be (200 TL) -the representatives stated that the Ministry is regularly controlling the implementation of the rules by hospitals and that any mistreatments or charges of higher fees and even hospitals not applying fees at all will be facing consequences. Any such situations should be reported to the Provincial Health directorate they said. For more detail about the DHR cost and any complaints on misuse of this rule, the below link can be used – Public Hospitals Financial Department
<https://khgmfinansalanalizdb.saglik.gov.tr/>

- Difficulties as to obtaining an appointment to get a DHR has been raised, the representatives confirmed they are currently working on new policies to make the procedure easier.
- Bedridden people and transport to hospitals: The problem of transporting bedridden people to doctor appointments has been shared with the representatives and asked whether there were any solutions such as transport facilities that refugees could use. The representatives confirmed that in some cases municipalities could assist in such cases and ambulance also via the hospitals they are attached to but that this was not mandatory. In addition to that, Mr. Zubeyir stated that they made a request to have one location only that could gather all needed medical equipment and health personnel to do the various needed tests and that it would at least avoid having to go to different places to do tests. This is a request and at this stage no more information is available.
- MoH representatives stated that refugees are in better position than Turkish citizens in terms of access to medical services and benefits. Refugees do not pay any additional fees and all emergency treatment are free of charge for them since DGMM is covering their TP insurance premiums. It was also emphasized that if a refugee has chronic disease that existed before entering Turkey, some difficulties regarding available treatment may occur.
- Participants shared cases such as hospitals asking for high fees for birth related practices for example. Mr. Batga stated that the practice of delivery is totally free in public hospitals but in case of intensive care need for the newborn, fees may be applied in some cases.

6. Any Other Businesses:

- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed related to coordination and the ESSN TF with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:
 - **WFP:** Arzum Karasu – email: arzum.karasu@wfp.com
 - **TRC:** Ayman Sallawy Alhalb – email: ayman.alhalb@kizilay.org.tr
Hanifi Kinaci – email: hanifi.kinaci@kizilay.org.tr
- For any programmatic issues, please refer your queries to the following Programme related focal points:
 - **WFP:** Digidem Aktaran – email: digidem.aktaran@wfp.org.com
Gulfem Kaya – email: gulfem.kaya@wfp.org
 - **TRC:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban – email: faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr

Next Meeting: The next meeting will be held on 05 April 2019 (TBC). The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Izmir Presentation
2. TRC Data Management and Analysis System
3. ESSN and Disability presentation
4. CCTE presentation

1 February 2019, 09:30-11:30, WFP/TRC Izmir