

ESSN Task Force Izmir Minutes

Agenda

1. Welcome and Introduction
2. Updates on ESSN and its implementation in the Aegean region
3. Updates on CCTE
4. ESSN Market Bulletin for the first quarter 2019
5. AOB
 - MUDEM ESSN Implementation highlights

Date of meeting

14 June 2019
09:30 - 11:30

Location

TK Izmir Branch - Sehit Nevres Bulvari No:3
1. Kat, Kizilay Is Merkezi, Izmir

Meeting

WFP: Arzum Karasu

Co-Chairs

TK: Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban

1. Action Points:

New Action Points from the Meeting:

Action point	By	When
Any impact on the ESSN application following the Ministerial circular stating address registrations will be done at PDMM offices rather than Nüfus offices in some districts?	WFP Izmir Office	August ESSN TF

2. Updates on the ESSN:

The Co-Chairs World Food Programme (WFP) and Turk Kizilay (TK) provided updates on the ESSN programme, highlighting:

- A total of 2,667,841 individuals were registered; 8,609 persons were not assessed, and 998,333 persons were ineligible.
- 1,660,899 people in total received ESSN assistance in May 2019.
- 56,229 people in Izmir received the ESSN assistance.
- DHR related updates have been presented, participants have shared their concerns about difficulties faced by SASF personnel while entering Cozger's (Special Needs Report for Children) data into their own system (MERNIS). Co-chairs shared the information stated in the Official Gazette where it defines a disability situation in the report under **the category of the disability**, please use this [link](#) (pages 9-10) for details.
- The ministry is working on addressing the **technical issues related to data integration (DHR related)**. Participants are asked to share any similar cases before and/or during the following meeting.

TK-WFP Monitoring and Evaluation Activities:

- Monitoring visits were conducted in **Aydin, Denizli, Izmir, Kutahya, Manisa, Mugla and Usak** where the following institutions **Provincial/District Governorships, PDMM, District Directorates of Population and Citizenship (NÜFUS), SASFs, Halkbank** branches and **hospitals** were visited.
- During those M&E activities, **nine** protection Cases related to PDMM registration, medical equipment/medicine, legal and health services were identified and referred to the respective service providers (TK, IOM, ASAM and Multeci-Der).
- **77** Livelihood Actors in city centres and districts with high ESSN application numbers were visited for livelihoods mapping activity in the Aegean region. These mainly included public education centres, vocational training centres and ISKUR branches.

Monitoring visits main findings:

General:

- The number of registered TP holders in Izmir has **decreased** from 144,000 to **142,000** in the past two months. Some of the possible reasons are moving out of city, voluntary returns to Syria or ID cancellations.
- In Karabaglar, there are about 5,000 refugees without IDs.
- A circular dated April 15th stated that address registration of all who are under IP or TP will be completed through PDMMs instead of Nüfus Offices in certain provinces/districts. With two conditions in: 1) the address should be empty 2) the applicants should come accompanied with the person they are willing to share the address with.
- Izmir PDMM implemented a lot of social cohesion activities, such as Iftar events during Ramadan.
- In Salihli (Manisa), most of the Syrian refugees can speak Turkish thanks to the evening classes provided by the Muftuluk.
- The former verification centre in Manisa provides support to needy TP and IP holders.

SASFs:

- An **11% progress** on the SASF Discretionary Allowance quota was recorded in the Aegean area (159 HHs/683 individuals).
- In Bayindir (Izmir), there are families who live in tents in Haskoy area. Many HHs have registered their addresses in a single house in the area.
- In Saruhanli (Manisa), it was reported that some families attempt to register children from relatives into their own households to fit into the ESSN criteria. This was done at the Nüfus level since Nüfus does not have access to the DGMM data. The problem is being solved by the SASF.

Focus Group Discussion (FGD) highlights:

April 2019: Healthcare Services

- Held with Iranian and Syrian refugees in Denizli.
- Language barrier hinders access to healthcare services including emergencies.
- State hospitals are a primary source for getting healthcare services. Receiving treatment from informal medical sources is not preferred.

May 2019: Ramadan and Economic Conditions

- Held with Syrian refugees in Manisa.
- Household expenditures went up in Ramadan. Participants were still not able to afford the desired food items for Iftar.
- Long working hours during Ramadan in Turkey is one of the main differences compared to Ramadan in Syria.
- It has been difficult to get together with family members and friends during Ramadan or Eid in Turkey mainly due to travel costs and permits.
- The amount of assistance provided by different actors in Ramadan has decreased compared to past years.
- Prices have increased for every item including food items, clothing and rent. Participants usually buy on credit from local shops and they remain indebted to relatives and friends in swelling amounts.
- Summer time is relatively better in terms of getting a job, but still worse compared to previous years.
- Language and vocational courses with an occupational guarantee are the kind of support the participants say they need the most.

3. Updates on the CCTE:

Cash Component:

- UNICEF CCTE Field Monitor provided an update that 399,024 beneficiaries were entitled for payment in May 2019. 202,814 Kızılaycards have been uploaded with payment. 1,596,450 Turkish beneficiaries received May payment in the National CCTE Program
- As of May 2019, the number of children reached with at least one CCTE payment has become 511,453 and the number of Kızılaycards uploaded are 247,753.

- In Izmir, the total number of children reached as of May 2019 is 17,356. Out of these children, 74,3% are in Primary School, 21,5% are in Middle School. Gender distribution is equal and the top five districts with the highest number of beneficiary children in Izmir are Bornova, Karabağlar, Konak, Bayraklı and Buca.
- As of 27 May, number of CCTE applications accepted from ALP students is 125 in Izmir.

Third Party Monitoring (TPM) for CCTE – 1st Wave

TPM 1st wave findings were shared with the participants. A total of 1,902 households have been surveyed during the first wave of the TPM. More information can be found in the presentation. Some of the highlights from the findings are:

- The average total income of the households is approximately 2000 TL in Istanbul, higher than South East provinces surveyed.
- Primary sources of income of CCTE beneficiary households are skilled labour (48%) and unskilled labour (28%), followed by ESSN (13%) and CCTE (3%) benefits.
- Findings show that for the overall age range of 6-17 years more girls (81,2%) than boys (76%) are enrolled among the CCTE beneficiaries.
- For the influence of CCTE on first time enrolment, 71,8% of the families in Istanbul reported no influence but when the attendance practices are asked 89,6% of the children attend regularly in Istanbul.
- One of the top reasons for irregular attendance is illness of the children (36%) but also children looking for job or working (20%), followed by children doing household chores or taking care of relatives and siblings (12%).

Questions and Comments from the participants:

TPM

Question was asked regarding the number of household members:

- The average number of people in HHs was 6,5
Slide 15 (Services Applied by HHs after CP Visit): How the information in regard to whether the beneficiaries applied for services have been collected?
- Beneficiaries were asked which services they were referred to by the TK CCTE CP teams, out of these services which ones they applied and whether they were able to receive service. They were also asked about the services that the beneficiaries didn't apply and the reasons for it.
Slide 7 (Primary Sources of Income of CCTE Beneficiary HHs): What types of income sources are included in the "other" category?
- "Other" income categories include: Informal-small commerce, savings, remittances, credits-borrowing money, begging, sale of assets, gifts from family-relatives, assistance from other organizations/government (cash/voucher/in kind).

Cash Transfer

- ALP program in Konak; There are two main factors considered while choosing the PECs where ALP to be implemented in the 12 provinces: the most important factor is the high population density of refugees in the district, while the second is the readiness of the PEC (mainly physical capacity) to implement ALP. According to the needs assessment performed by the MoNE ALP coordination team on this regard, currently ALP is implemented in 7 districts in Izmir (Bornova, Buca, Fotça, Karabağlar, Menderes, Menemen and Torbalı). If there is a need and demand to implement ALP in Konak, this can be discussed with the MoNE ALP coordination team to start steps to implement ALP in Konak.
- Tracing of ALP students transfer to formal education. This information can demonstrate whether children who have been away from education (and are likely working) would be motivated to return to formal education after ALP.
- Currently there are no follow-up mechanisms to the ALP students referred to formal education system after completing certain levels of ALP. There are discussions with MoNE and other possible NGO partners to implement follow-up programme.

Child Protection Component

In total, 16 CP offices are operational in 15 Provinces with the highest number of refugees.

Their objectives are to:

- **Sustain positive education outcomes;**
- **Mitigate child protection risks and violations**, which are closely intertwined with economic vulnerabilities (such as child labour, child marriage, physical and emotional violence and family separation), and
- **Reducing the damage** caused by exposure of children to violence, exploitation, abuse and neglect, and family separation.

a) Identification:

- Identification is made through the CCTE beneficiaries list provided by the MoLFSS
- Children are identified based on the following criteria for PHASE I
- Children whose payment has been paused (missed more than 4 days of school)
- Vulnerability Criteria (ESSN beneficiary list)
- Geographical location

In addition to those criterias in PHASE II; Focusing on specific grades (ALP students have been prioritized for March & April period).

b) Screening:

Screening is made through a risk/need assessment carried out during household visits by TK Child Protection Teams in 15 provinces. Child Protection Teams do screening using standardized forms.

c) Response:

On the Spot Information:	Internal Referral:	External Referral:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ CCTE Eligibility Criteria and Application Process ✓ ESSN Eligibility Criteria and Application Process ✓ Obtaining ID ✓ Obtaining Report ✓ New Registry-identity/data verification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Community Center Case Team ✓ Service Center ✓ Psychosocial Support ✓ Child Friendly Spaces ✓ Adolescent Friendly Spaces ✓ 168 Line 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Health Services ✓ District Governorate ✓ Other NGOs ✓ Civil Registry Office ✓ ASPIM (Ankara Provincial Directorate of Family, Labour and Social Services)

CCTE CP – March 2017 - April 2019:

- Children screened by outreach teams: 64.883
- Children identified and assessed with protection needs: 12.369
- Children referred to specialized services: 6120

During January and February 2019, Izmir Child Protection Outreach Team screened **435** children.

Risk disaggregation:	Gender based disaggregation:	Age based disaggregation:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ High Risk: 1 ✓ Middle Risk: 36 ✓ Low Risk: 73 ✓ No Risk: 325 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Girls: 221 ✓ Boys: 214 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ 0-5 Age: 71 ✓ 6-9 Age: 88 ✓ 10-13 Age: 154 ✓ 14-17 Age: 112 ✓ 18+: 10

4. ESSN Market Bulletin for the first quarter 2019:

- **Highlights:** The Turkish economy has contracted, particularly in the sectors that the refugees are employed, namely construction and manufacturing.

- With the formal unemployment rate reaching to 14.7%, the possible job competition between the Turkish and refugee communities in the informal market is highly likely and can lead to social tension.
- The annual inflation rate is still high (18.71% as of May 2019); the prices continue to increase after some decrease in Q4 2018. The refugees increasingly resort to more coping strategies since mid-2018, might be attributed to reduced income along with the inflation. Please see attached report for a thorough analysis.

5. **Any Other Businesses:**

MUDEM ESSN Implementation highlights:

- MUDEM gave a presentation on their activities in the province of Izmir. The full presentation is attached for reference.
- Participants have been informed that future meetings will dedicate a 10 min presentation to one participant NGO per meeting for them to present their work within the scope of the ESSN program. More information will be provided ahead of the meeting.

Coordination/ Programme information focal points:

- Please remember to send any issues/challenges observed related to coordination and the ESSN TF with as much detail as possible (location, date, etc.) to the ESSN TF focal points:

- **WFP:** Arzum Karasu email: arzum.karasu@wfp.com
- **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban email: faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr

For any programmatic issues, please refer your queries to the following Programme related focal points:

- **WFP:** Digidem Aktaran email: digidem.aktaran@wfp.org.com
Gulfem Kaya email: gulfem.kaya@wfp.org
- **TK:** Faruk Ahmed Abdo Shaban email: faruk.shaban@kizilay.org.tr

Next Meeting: The next meeting will be held in August (TBC). The venue, time and agenda will be shared accordingly.

Attachments:

1. ESSN Task Force Izmir Presentation
2. CCTE presentation
3. ESSN Market Bulletin Q1 2019
4. MUDEM presentation