

Cash-based Intervention Technical Working Group Turkey

CBI TWG Monthly Meeting Minute

25 March 2019

UNHCR Ankara and Gaziantep

Chaired by: Ahmet Unver (UNHCR), Line Rindebaek, (WFP), Salah Hamwi (CARE)
Hosted by: UNHCR Country Office (Ankara), Sub-Office (Gaziantep), WFP IAO (Istanbul)
Participants:

Ankara			
Ahmet Ünver	UNHCR Co-Chair	Sevgi Kelly	UNHCR
Line Rindebaek	WFP Co-Chair	Firat Olcay	UNHCR
Salah Hamwi	CARE NGO Advisor	İmren Arslanoğlu	UNHCR
Andrea Markham	WFP	Damla Taşkın	UNHCR
Livio Mercurio	UNHCR	Hanifi Kınacı	Türk Kızılay
Özlem Çavuş	UNDP	Erik Lode	WFP
Cansu Şengür	ASAM	Isabella Bianchi	WFP
Ali Aytaç Emecen	ASAM	Gonca Savaş	WFP
Alı Muhtaroglu	ASAM	Sahnur Soykan	WFP
Bahadır Murat Akın	ILO		

Gaziantep	
Chris Bender	UNHCR
Omar Alsmail	IOM
Leila Mamadashvili	UNHCR
Merve Ağcabay	WATAN
Obada Kahil	WHH
Dildar Mehmet	WHH
Enes Elhasan	WHH
Muhannad Khadra	WATAN
Chris Bender	UNHCR
Istanbul	
Arzum Karasu	WFP

Agenda:

- Welcome and Action Points from Previous Meeting
- Thematic Focus: Livelihoods
 - CBI Mapping of Livelihoods Activities
 - Update on the operational guidance: *Cash for Work Guidelines & Next Steps*
- Draft MPC Outcome Monitoring Indicators
- AOB:
 - Brief update on Amman CaLP regional workshop
 - Work Plan & Meeting Schedule

Action Points - Follow up issues and updates:

- CBI Delivery Platforms template for partner inputs. **Deadline 8 March / No inputs received.**
- Draft overview of CBI Delivery Mechanisms in Turkey: The template was developed and shared with the partners. **Deadline 8 March / No inputs received.**
- The final CBI Mapping 2018 will be presented to STF in May 2019 meeting.
- Updated work plan has been shared with the partners. A short overview will be presented during the meeting.
- NGO Technical Advisor Role re- advertised twice. No volunteers identified. **Please e-mail the Co-Chairs if you would like to be technical advisor.**
- Updated TOR circulated on 5 March. It is final and endorsed. The final version will be shared with MoM and with STF.
- PPT template for potential partner updates was shared with January MoM on 22 February

New Action Points from the Meeting:

- Share Draft MPC Outcome Monitoring Indicators information for partners to submit comments: **Deadline: 25 March.**
- Co-chairs to look into possibility of cross-checking CBI mapping figures with those reported under 3RP. **Deadline: 28 May**

1. Welcome and Action Points from Previous Meeting

Following a round-the-table introduction, WFP co-chair provided an update on the action point from the 29 January meeting (see above). The co-chairs thanked Salah Hamwi (CARE) for his dedicated support of the work of the CBI TWG in the past years as the NGO technical Advisor. His tenure will end by 31 March, 2019.

2. Thematic Focus: Livelihoods

CBI Mapping of Livelihoods Activities:

UNHCR technical advisor provided an overview of the mapping of livelihoods CBI activities based on extractions from the overall CBI Mapping exercise.

General overview

- The mapping exercise which will be performed periodically, can provide an overview of who does what and how within the different sectors.
- Across all sectors, 17 organizations reported on 30 different CBI based programmes, for a total of nearly \$750 million spent in 2018, with almost 2 million beneficiaries reached. In 2019, more people are expected to be reached.

Cash and Livelihoods

- **Cash for Work / Short-term employment interventions** within the Livelihoods sector have become more important due to major donor interest in moving from pure assistance to supporting self-reliance.
- Six organizations reported seven different programmes, with a total of \$30 million spent in 2018 with more than 35,000 beneficiaries reached.
- Beneficiaries are more concentrated in South East and in Istanbul. The majority of the beneficiaries of CfW programmes are Syrians refugees living in urban locations (44%). Turkish nationalities are included under the 'Other' (25%).
- GIZ and BMZ are major contributors of the CfW programmes.
- It is mainly conditional and unrestricted cash. Female beneficiaries' inclusion is 86%. It takes into consideration of Turkish legislation in matter of social security (86%).
- **Cash for Livelihoods** analyses also includes **Cash for Trainings**. Beneficiaries are more concentrated in South East, Izmir, Istanbul and Ankara and seven organisations reported on eight different programmes with a budget for 2018 of more than \$28 million and with more than 25,000 beneficiaries reached in 2018 and with 12,800 planned for 2019.
- Most of the programmes are earmarked (88%) for the specific activities as per donor requests.
- Depending on the scope of the programme and organization, ESSN beneficiaries can also be included into the Cash for Livelihoods programmes.
- 50% of the programs have monthly distributions.
- This exercise was done last year and would be repeated this year as well. In order to compare the changes, it would be good to repeat the exercise in September 2019 since it was launched in last September 2018.
- The group discussed the need to clarify and fine-tune some of the content.
- It was suggested that the CBI co-chairs try to match and cross check the CBI mapping figures with those reported under 3RP.

ACTION POINT: Co-chairs to look into possibility of cross-checking CBI mapping figures with those reported under 3RP.

Update on the operational guidance: Cash for Work Guidelines & Next Steps:

The Coordinator of the LHWG presented an overview of the draft operational guidelines:

- This was discussed in the October LHWG meeting and a "Short Term Employment" Guidelines drafting committee was established in Ankara and Gaziantep in November.

- Members of the TWG include İŞKUR, UNDP, UNHCR, IOM, GIZ, WFP, Concern and STC. Two Core Groups were established temporarily. Partner from the Government side is İŞKUR. After drafting the guidelines, they will be shared with the LHWG and CBI TWG partners. The guidelines will be finalized by the end of 2019.
- The aim is to provide minimum standards for the harmonization of CfW (it will be called LH Sector “Short-term Employment” in the guidelines) projects across agencies, their design and delivery modality.
- As it is described in the definition of short-term, 9 months of employment was based on the İSKUR circular on public benefit:
 - *“Short-term employment in the community, generally not lasting for more than 9 months to improve purchasing power of beneficiaries in the short term& producing public services and improving public assets and resources to the advantage of the whole community where workers are beneficiaries of the project and receive compensation in cash for their time and effort.”*
- In addition, it was discussed by the group that both public sector and private sector would be included. Some partners may also work with private sector.
- The CfW indicator was separated in the 3RP LH Sector 2019-2020 Log-frame. It will be tracked under different indicator.
- İŞKUR Service circulars modalities and features were used to shape the guidelines.
- Please refer to the CBI TWG PPT for the full overview of the draft guidelines.
- The LHWG Coordinator welcomed inputs and comments.
- A discussion on the technical content (such as the inclusion of the Private Sector, the status of CfW beneficiaries as formally (or not) employed, the need to differentiate between CfW and Cash for Assets for example) and the purpose of the guidelines pursued.
- The LHWG Coordinator confirmed the intention to complete the CfW guidelines by end April and noted that it is the intention to work on trainings guidelines which will include CfT guidelines subsequently but emphasizes that this exercise will be complex.
- It was agreed that further technical inputs on the guidelines could be arranged bilaterally for example from WFP.
- Once final, it will also be shared through the CBI TWG.
- The group also discussed and recommended tracking multiple participation to different vocational courses-if it is possible. The LHWG Coordinator underlined that data protection prevents cross checking the IDs of the participants/beneficiaries. It was noted that checking with MoNE would be the one option whilst the position of donors on this was important.
- Regarding the mapping of stipends, LHWG Coordinator noted that as part of the joint mapping exercise with Basic Needs which aims to map out livelihoods opportunities through the Services Advisor Platform, a detailed mapping of LH activities is expected to be available in the coming months.

The CBI TWG co-chairs highlighted the **key areas where the TWG can link with and provide support to the LHWG, including:**

- Future collaboration in specific technical areas (e.g. cash for training)
- Provision of overview of possible transfer modalities & of existing mechanisms, approaches and platforms – this would build on the **CBI Delivery Platforms** document already prepared in December by the CBI TWG. [Members were encouraged to share inputs – if no inputs are received, the document will be considered a final draft]
- The May cycle of the CBI TWG will focus on “Know your Customer” (KYC) and will aim to provide overviews (best practices and restrictions) of this to guide LHWG members
- Market updates are now a regular part of CBI TWG. LHWG members can be invited and updates can be provided in LHWG.
- Common MPC indicators can be shared.

3. Draft MPC Outcome Monitoring Indicators

WFP technical advisor provided an update on the draft MPC monitoring indicators briefly discussed at the recent CaLP workshop in Amman:

- As part of the Grand Bargain cash work stream, a group of stakeholders has been working on an initiative to compile and identify shared outcome indicators for multipurpose cash. This is part of the sub-work stream of "Measuring VFM, Efficiency, Effectiveness, and Outcomes of Multipurpose Cash."
- This began last year with mapping existing MPC outcome indicators and their use, which brought a wide variety of responses from across humanitarian stakeholders.
- A working group was then formed, with experts from NGOs, UN agencies and donors, including USAID, CRS, CaLP, ActionAid, CARE, ECHO, Save the Children, WFP, World Vision, and UNHCR, as well as substantial input from relevant clusters and from multipurpose cash programming to date, to refine and organize these indicators.
- Feedback can be provided on the draft before 31 March.

WFP outlined the draft indicators including:

- **Core Indicators** *required for all interventions using MPC*
- **Core Qualitative Question** *Strongly recommended for all interventions using MPC*
- **MPC-Contributing Indicators** *Required for all interventions in which the sector is reflected in the MEB, unless other indicators for that sector supersede them for a given program or response*
- **Context-Specific Indicators** *Strongly recommended to gather one or more, based upon the priorities of affected people, the agency and the response*

While use of a limited set of common indicators is welcomed, it was noted that clarification around frequency of data collection will be important for effective comparison.

The draft MPC indicators can be found here:

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1DcZm56yxsKZ55ckjaqlLwHZ8JvDVtUG8KnsITGetEUw/edit?usp=sharing>

ACTION POINT: Presentation will be shared for the comments (all relevant documents shared on 25 March)

4. AOB

Brief update on Amman CaLP regional workshop

- CBI TWG Co-Chairs and WFP and UNHCR Technical Advisors participated in a workshop organised by CaLP and CashCap in Amman (6-7 March). The purpose of the workshop was to facilitate consultations two draft documents that was developed by Global Cluster Coordination Group (GCCG): (1) Draft Cash Coordination Guidance for CC and (2) Draft Standard Terms of Reference for Cash WG
- The objectives of the workshop were strengthening the documents by getting feedback from participants, and ensuring that gaps are identified, and best practices of MENA are reflected on documents,
- Workshop also aimed to facilitate further consultation of «CALP's Future of Financial Assistance» and «draft MPC outcome indicators»
- Workshop established a discussion platform to a diverse and representative sum. Standard Terms of Reference was effectively reviewed; whereas, review of Cash Coordination Guidance was limited since participants only reviewed the summary
- Report is being prepared and abovementioned documents will be enhanced with the given feedbacks.

Work Plan & Meeting Schedule

A brief overview of the updated work plan for 2019 was provided, noting that it reflected the discussions from January including the emphasis on Inter-Sectoral Linkages (e.g. Livelihoods & Protection), tools / guidance on Turkey specific context (e.g. on Delivery mechanism and technologies & Common M/E indicators) and Learning on thematic technical topics:

CBI TWG - 2019 Meeting Plan

March	May	July	September	November
LIVELIHOODS WG LINKAGE	KYC & DATA PROTECTION	FINANCIAL PROCESSES	PROTECTION WG LINKAGE / or M&E Details TBD	CBI TWG REVIEW
-CBI mapping -Update on CfW and CFT definitions and efforts -CfW guidance overview and feedback -CBI TWG and Livelihoods WG synergies	-KYC requirements in Turkey especially for IP/TP -data protection legislation in Turkey -data sharing mechanisms in CBI programmes	-transfer -reconciliation -sweepbacks MARKET UPDATE		-plan new CBI mapping -review good practices, work plan for 2020
	APRIL *	June	August	October
				December

**In January 2019, the CBI TWG members agreed to have bi monthly meetings in 2019.*

Members were invited to express interest for contribution for the planned topics in 2019.

Next meeting: The next CBI TWG meeting is tentatively planned for the fourth week of May 2019, date and time will be confirmed closer to the time.